# TATIONAL

OCIAL





**Official Journal of the National Social Science Association** 

Volume 56

Number 1

2021

Name of Publication: NATIONAL SOCIAL SCIENCE JOURNAL Issue: Volume 56 # 1 ISSN 2154-1736 Frequency: Quarterly Offices of Publication: National Social Science Association Mailing Address 2020 Hills Lake Drive El Cajon, CA 92020

> Office Address: 9131 Fletcher Parkway, Suite 119 La Mesa, CA 91942

On Line journals: <u>http://nssa.us</u> E-mail address:<u>nssa1@cox.net</u>

The National Social Science Journal is being abstracted in: Cabell's Directory; Eric Clearinghouse; EBSCO, Economic Abstracts; Historical Abstracts; Index to Periodical Articles; Social Science Source; Social Science Index; Sociological Abstracts; the University Reference System.

We wish to thank all authors for the licensing of the articles. And we wish to thank all those who have reviewed these articles for publication



This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution 3.0 Unported License.

Editor; Barba Patton, University of Houston-Victoria Book Review Editor; J. Vern Cromartie, Contra Costa College

## **EDITORIAL BOARD**

Editorial Board: Isela Almaguer, University of Texas Rio Grande Valley Donna Azodi, Lamar University Sue Burum, Minnesota State University, Mankato Cindy Cummings, Lamar University Jose da Cruz, Armstrong Atlantic State University Amy Shriver Dreussi, University of Akron Talitha Hudgins, Utah Valley University Charmaine Lowe, Austin Peay State University James Mbuva, National University Jeffrey Stomper, College of Lake County Pegly Vaz, Fort Hays State University Wen Xing, Southwest Jiaotong University & Dartmouth University

## NATIONAL SOCIAL SCIENCE JOURNAL

## Volume 56 #1

## **Table of Contents**

Student Perceptions of the Impact Simulated	
Problem-Solving Has on Their Marketable Skills	
Dr. Thomas Harvey, Dr. Donna Azodi, Lamar University	1
Presidential OUTlaw: How Barack Obama Became	
The First Presidential Advocate for The LGBTQ Community	
Daniel Cervantes Jr., Chapman University	9
Global Pandemics as a National Security Threat	
John J. Gascho, Jacquelyn E. Harn, Dean A. Hicks,	
Undergraduate Students, Georgia Southern University	
Joséde Arimatéia da Cruz, Georgia Southern University	23
The Impact of Mindfulness Breaks and Physical	
Activity Breaks on Student Effectiveness	
Jaskiran Dhaliwal, Joseph Hunter, Western Washington University	38
The Impact of Professional Association Membership on	
Teacher Job Satisfaction	
Hope R. Shields, Ed.D., Aarek Farmer, Ed.D., Mark Blackwelder, Ph.D.,	
Andrea Moore, SLP D., Freed-Hardeman University	45
Science and World War I:	
Involving Teacher Candidates in Integrated Learning	
Donna F. Short, Philip C. Short, Austin Peay State University	64
Holocaust Memorial Art and History Education	
Julie Anne Taylor, University of Michigan-Dearborn	
Timothy Gore, Douglass Academy for Young Men,	
Danielle L. DeFauw, University of Michigan-Dearborn,	
Michael Sevick, University of Michigan-Flint	
Kyria Gore, Douglass Academy for Young Men,	
Timothy Constant, Holocaust Memorial Center,	
Chantal Assaf, University of Michigan-Dearborn,	
Jacob Schenkel, University of Michigan-Dearborn,	
Glovetta Williams, Douglass Academy for Young Men	70

# **Book Reviews**

Cultural Theory and Popular Culture	
William Kirtley	84
A Review and Commentary of Peter Reddaway's The Dissidents:	
A Memoir of Working with the Resistance in Russia, 1960-1990	
Samuel B. Hoff, George Washington Distinguished Professor Emeritus	88

## STUDENT PERCEPTIONS OF THE IMPACT SIMULATED PROBLEM-SOLVING HAS ON THEIR MARKETABLE SKILLS

Dr. Thomas Harvey Dr. Donna Azodi Lamar University

#### **Introduction and Background**

In a regional university in Southeast Texas, graduate students in the Educational Leadership program participate in The School Principalship (EDLD 5339) course which provides multiple opportunities for students to participate in leadership activities on their campus as well as simulated leadership activities. In this course, candidates are required to participate in simulated problem-solving activities that promote the vision of a hypothetical campus and improve student achievement in an equitable learning climate.

Specifically, candidates are asked to simulate being in the role of a new principal charged with the responsibility of collaboratively addressing challenges in a Career Technology Education program and reporting progress to a hypothetical superintendent. Candidates were asked to reflect on the impact the

course simulated leadership activity had on the development of their marketable skills. This assignment reflects Texas and the university's support and focus on the development of candidates' marketable skills. The Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD, 2012) invited the states of Texas, Washington, Virginia and Ohio to participate in an analysis of the labor market relevance and outcomes of the state's higher education system. The OECD project examines how well higher education systems help learners develop skills that are valued by employers. A goal of this project is to identify how policymakers can improve the state's higher education system to anticipate, develop and communicate market relevant skills.

The purpose of this study conducted Spring of 2019, was to gain insight into candidate perceptions regarding the impact that participating in simulated problem-solving activities had on identified marketable skills associated with the principalship. Data from this study will be used for program improvement in EDLD 5339 and other core courses in the university's principal preparation program.

## **Review of the Literature**

#### Leadership

It can be determined that leadership characteristics of school principals directly and very significantly affect the organizational trust, commitment and citizenship felt at the school especially by those working in schools, the culture and climate of the school and the quality of education and training (Avci, 2015). Moreover, "school principals shape motivational climates and structures for learning. Improvements in education rest on their ability to lead the process of change – to introduce better methods, develop or apply innovations, and implement new requirements effectively" (Kanter, 2005, p.1). Additionally, highly skilled school leaders have been rigorously prepared and deliberately mentored in well-designed programs that immerse them in real-world leadership experiences where they are challenged to excel (Gray, Fry, Bottoms& O'Neill, 2007).

Fullan (2002) suggests that focusing on relationships doesn't reflect a single year effort, rather school leaders look to develop a solid foundation that extends the focus across a number of years. This consistent effort to connect with teachers, especially building relationships with individuals who do not feel connected to the school's purpose, is critical to sustaining and enhancing the climate and culture of the school. These relationships cultivated and enhanced over time are critical to supporting a learning environment. Additionally, rather than focusing on team members' weaknesses, high performing schools' principals focus on teachers' individual strengths and encourage them through opportunities to enhance the school (Burke, 2009). Further, Luthra and Dahiya (2015) indicate effective leaders are considered skilled communicators and share clearly identified values and actively promote the development of values in others. As a result, the shared values support team members' willingness to follow their campus leader. **Simulation** 

Zoroja, Pejic', and Miloloža (2019) suggest that not only do leaders need to strive to be life-long learners, this learning experience should be supported by a real or authentic environment. Integrating leadership activities as simulation scenarios support graduate students' ability to apply realistic leadership decisions as a function of their learning process. Further, simulation activities can be implemented to support or train aspiring principals' ability to analyze situations and predict potential actions or steps that can be used in a leader's decision-making. Moreover, these authors suggest that using simulation games to support leadership growth facilitates aspiring leaders' ability to structure decisions and strategic planning that allows them to review and analyze their decisions and suggestions for actions in an environment of safety. The simulations provide students the ability to identify the outcome of their decision making in real time rather than the extended timeframe that would occur in the real-world setting (Zoroja, Pejic', & Miloloža, 2019).

Voelkel, Johnson and Gilbert (2018) indicate that providing educational leadership students opportunities to engage in simulations reflecting situations found in K-12 learning environments support their learning as aspiring leaders. Further, they suggest these simulation opportunities scaffold graduate students' growth as instructional leaders. Moreover, the researchers suggest simulations provide realistic

opportunities for students to implement critical analysis and problem-solving opportunities that reflect the reality of the dilemmas school leaders confront.

Additionally, researchers studied aspiring principal and superintendent candidates' perceptions of the impact that implementation of educational simulations had on their sense of being prepared to engage in the critical analysis and problem-solving skills needed for school leadership. These aspiring leaders indicated the educational simulation experience was beneficial and they appreciated the opportunities for collegial discussion as well as their enhanced perspective of school leadership. These graduate students denoted numerous benefits from their leadership simulation experiences including a sense of their ability to manage the real-life educational dilemmas as well as enhancement of their judicious reflection of diverse educational issues school leaders face (DeJong & Grundmeyer,2018).

#### Marketable Skills

In an effort to identify skills or traits that are recognized as important in crossing the threshold to the workforce moving toward success in their career path, Webucator (2014) surveyed professionals, college graduates and businesspersons to determine skills that are most critical and pertinent to employment. This survey recognized the following skills: passion, continued learning, communication, adaptability, work ethic, problem-solving, will power, networking, ambition, and good attitude (Webucator, 2014).

In contrast, other marketable skills were suggested that students should develop while working toward their college degree. These skills include skills for life, writing, research, pedagogy, communication, social skills, stress management, leadership, time management, listening, and organization. (Learn.org, August 2012).Implementing marketable skills development is meant to help college students identify their marketable skills and communicate them to their employers. Texas public universities and colleges are working toward the goal that all graduates will have completed programs with identified marketable skills by 2030, a goal set by the Higher Education Strategic Planning Committee (HESPC) that created 60x30TX. This initiative regarding marketable skills is a result of national discussions about graduate employability and helping students understand the marketable skills and talents they are developing during their college experience. (Higher Education Coordinating Board, 2018).

Although the current focus on marketable skills is being developed related to supporting employability, Craig and Markowitz (2017) indicate that the skills gap is really an awareness gap. These authors posit that as a result of this awareness gap, potential employers do not realize the link between these graduate applicants and the expertise they gained from their college activities and education. Moreover, these authors contend that if action is not taken to address the awareness gap, students may not be responsive to considering how they can best communicate how the skills they developed in their college activities and classroom relate to increasing their opportunity to apply for future careers.

While universities are concerned about the marketability of all graduates, the development of educational leaders with the employability skills necessary to lead school campuses has been a crisis for some time. There is indeed a difference in being certified to be a school administrator and being qualified. (Southern Region Education Board, 2002). Five qualifying key marketable skills for school principals have been identified by American University, in Washington DC. These skills include communication skills, critical thinking, problem solving, decision making, and leading others. (American University, 2019).

Concerned about the 60x30TX mandate shared earlier, and in concert with the crisis of developing educational leaders with the capacity and marketable skills required to lead school campuses, the Educational Leadership Department at a regional university in Southeast, Texas has identified eight specific marketable skills. These skills include critical thinking/problem solving, oral/written communication, teamwork/collaboration, information technology application, leadership, professionalism/work ethic, career management, and global/intercultural fluency. (Mason, 2019).

DeJong, D, and Grundmeyer (2018) report that because of the complexity of marketable and employability skills necessary to lead schools, instructional strategies used in preparing educational leaders have evolved. While simulations have been used in military and medical training, the use of educational simulations to increase aspiring administrator confidence with real-world issues is relatively new in the training programs for school leaders.

## Methodology

## **Data Collection and Analysis**

The participants for this study were 415 online Principal Certification students, 321 females and 94 males, enrolled in the Principal Certification Program at a regional institution in Southeast Texas. Of the 415 participants, 115 or .036% were American Indian/Alaskan, 10 or .024% were Asian Pacific Islander, 137 or 33% were Black, Not Hispanic, 252 or 60.7% were Caucasian,1 or .002% indicated Other. (See Table 1).

The data collected from the Strategic Problem-Solving summative activity, the Professional Growth Reflection, included textual data relating student responses in the reflection were aligned to identified marketable skills. These data were analyzed using a qualitative method design; identifying themes from student reflections regarding the impact the activities had on their developing marketable skills. Four hundred fifteen principal certification candidates completed the Professional Growth Reflection. Further, descriptive statistics were used to analyze the participants' demographic data.

Students responded to the Professional Growth Reflection which included the following questions:

- How did your responses to the strategic problem-solving assessment activities
  - Impact your ability to analyze issues, make decisions, and overcome problems?
  - Impact your ability to demonstrate originality and inventiveness?
  - Impact your ability to articulate thoughts and ideas clearly?
  - Impact your ability to build collaborative relationships?
  - Impact your ability to leverage the strengths of others to achieve goals?
  - Impact your personal growth as an aspiring administrator?

## **Research Questions**

1. How does applying simulated problem-solving impact students' ability to analyze issues, make decisions or overcome problems?

2. How does implementing simulated problem-solving impact students' ability to demonstrate originality and inventiveness?

3. How does simulated problem-solving effect students' ability to build collaborative relationships leveraging the strengths of others to achieve goals?

4. How does simulated problem-solving effect students' growth as an aspiring administrator?

## Findings

Research Question 1

How does applying simulated problem-solving impact students' ability to analyze issues, make decisions or overcome problems?

- I know that after working on the various activities that I'm a lot more meticulous and pragmatic with my decision making. Normally, I would just make a decision and that would be the end of it. Now, I'm more focused on assessing the situation, outlining the problem, setting goals, forming a plan, and developing activities to support and monitor progress toward those goals. I know that if something unexpected comes up that the best thing I can do is to stay calm and follow the aforementioned process.
- This activity helped me to further move into the mindset of being a collaborative instructional leader. The structure of the activity lent itself to breaking large issues into bite-size activities that are more manageable. This activity required multiple steps and the input and support of multiple stakeholders so allowed for collaboration and shared decision making in the true sense of the word. Through this process I was able to begin with the basics of building relationships, set goals, and monitor and adjust the plan based on results, which is a strategy to be utilized in many aspects of the principal's role.

## Research Question 2

How does implementing simulated problem-solving impact students' ability to demonstrate originality and inventiveness?

• This project required me to demonstrate originality and inventiveness in the way I designed a collaborative approach for vision, goal, and action plan development. I had to be forward thinking

in how I might address barriers and challenges in the project by involving a diverse group of partners. I also had to design a Monitor and Adjust calendar that would help me remain focused and intentional in my decision-making efforts. Additionally, I had to consider how I might collect evidence of progress, initiative effectiveness, and partnership maintenance.

• I think this assignment showed me how I can be original, creative, and inventive especially when student achievement and success is in jeopardy. However, it also made it clear to me that I am not the most creative or inventive person out there and that there is much for me to learn from my colleagues and those who evidence best practice. I look forward to learning from my colleagues, no matter what stage I am at in my career.

## Research Question 3

How does simulated problem-solving effect students' ability to build collaborative relationships leveraging the strengths of others of achieve goals?

- Through this activity I was able to experience what collaboration really is. I have been saying that I have been on collaborative teams for years now. But in reality, we have just been people working cooperatively on the same task at the same time. I believe that it is important to have a team you can work with and depend on, and through this assignment I was able to think about what true collaboration would look like if I were running a school. I would want the people to be able to work together on the same task, but also to really value each other's opinions.
- Collaborative relationships and development are essential for any organizational growth. This activity as well as others in this class have definitely taken those abilities of mine to new heights . . . when in fact, effective collaboration involves much more, such as actively listening, showing empathy to other's ideas, being resourceful, and agreeing to disagree effectively.
- I find the strengths of others to be both inspiring and encouraging, and I apply others' strengths in such a way that it helps the group overall. Not only does this instill confidence in others and helps motivate them to achieve at their greatest potential, but it also serves to increase the success of task completion.
- Using the strengths of others is crucial for the success of a school and I realize this more now than ever through completion of this assignment. It is impossible for one person to perform all necessary roles on a campus, therefore, using the strengths of others leads to positive outcomes by building a positive culture and rapport between staff members. As a future instructional leader, I plan to leverage the strengths of others to accomplish campus goals.

## Research Question 4

How does simulated problem-solving effect students' growth as an aspiring administrator?

- This course has impacted my personal growth as an aspiring administrator because it put me in a simulated situation where I needed to go out and look for the answers. I wasn't going to have a team magically come in and make the changes needed for improvement. I had to work at it. I had to learn policies, guidelines, expectations, build relationships, build a team and be as transparent as possible.
- In order to build and maintain a collaborative team, I must inform, involve, include, and inspire each member, and avoid collaboration barriers such as ignorance, indifference, intimidation, infiltration, and interference.
- I must also always ask myself if I know what collaboration is, have I seen it, do I understand how to bring it into my school, can I identify the barriers, do my actions contribute to collaboration, and have I been a barrier to collaboration myself? Keeping these questions in mind will help me maintain a positive, collaborative campus with one shared goal of students' success.

## Conclusions

The use of simulations where prospective school principals are placed in virtual leadership roles that assume the responsibility of addressing real-world campus issues are perceived by participants to have a positive impact on a number of marketable skills such as building collaborative relationships, creative originality and inventiveness and leveraging the strengths of others.

While the use of complex simulations in the preparation of school administrators is a relatively new practice, the reflective aspects of simulations that place students in virtual administrative roles allowed them to recognize and more clearly articulate their individual strengths and weaknesses as aspiring leaders. Students' participation in virtual professional collaborative activities at the application level increased their professional confidence as prospective school principals.

## **Recommendations for Future Study**

Results from this study could be used as part of ongoing course and program improvement. After reviewing the findings of this study, educational leadership professors can utilize this information in course review. Particularly professors can incorporate action and activity-based assignments to foster higher student learning engagement.

Further study could be conducted to compare student performance on strategic problem solving and the representative marketable skills and student state certification performance.

Conduct a study of principal preparation program completers a year after graduation to assess the impact of practicing marketable skills had on their employment as a school administrator.

#### References

- American University. (2019). How to become aprincipal: Five skills to start building now [Blogpost]. Retrieved from https://soeonline.american.edu/blog/to-become-a-principal
- Avci, A. (2015). Investigation of transformational and transactional leadership styles of school principals and evaluation of them in terms of educational administration. *Academic Journals*, 10(20), p. 2758-2767. DOI: 10:5897/ERR2015.2483
- Burke, K. A. (2009). The principal's role in supporting teacher leadership and building capacity: Teacher and administrator perspectives. US San Diego Electronic Theses and Dissertations. Retrieved fromhttps://escholarship.org/uc/item/8031p4n4
- Catch the Net (n.d.) Texas: One of four states for OECD. Retrieved from https://www.catchthenext.org/texas-one-of-four-states-for-oecd-study/
- Craig, R., Markowitz, T. (March2017). The skills gap is actually an awareness gap -- And it's easier to fix. Retrieved from
- https://www.forbes.com/sites/ryancraig/2017/03/17/the-skills-gap-is-actually-an-awareness-gap-and-its-easier-to-fix/#59e1e42e3ff4
- DeJong, D.& Grundmeyer, T. (2018). Educational leadership simulations: Learning lessons from behind the curtain of educational leadership. *International Journal of Educational Leadership Preparation*, 13(1), p. 189-200.
- Fullan, M. (2002). The change leader. *Educational Leadership*, 59(8). p.16-21. Retrieved from http://www.ascd.org/publications/educational Leadership/may02/vol59/num08/The-Change-Leader.aspx
- Gray, C, Fry, B.,Bottoms, G, & O'Neill, K. (2007). Good principals aren't born they're mentored: Are we investing enough to get the school leaders we need? Retrieved from http://www.wallacefoundation.org
- Higher Education Coordinating Board. (2018). Retrieved from http://board.thecb.state.tx.us/reports/PDF/10796.PDF?CFID=75920892&CFTOKEN=79194126

- Kanter, R. M. (June 2005). Principals as innovators: Identifying fundamental skills for leadership of change in public schools. Harvard Business School Working Paper, No. 05-076, June 2005. https://pelp.fas. Harvard.edu/files/hbs-test/files/pel07 p2.pdf
- Learn.org (August 2012) Marketable skills blog. Retrieved from https://scholar.google.com/scholar?hl=en&as\_sdt=0%2C44&q=Marketable+ skills+Learn.org&btnG=
- Luthra, A., & Dahiya, R. (2015). Effective Leadership is all about communicating effectively: connecting leadership and communication. *International Journal of Management & Business Studies*, 5(3), p. 43-48.
- Mason, D (2019). Marketable skills memo. Internal Lamar University communication: unpublished.
- Southern Region Education Board. (2002). SREB Leadership Initiative: Creating Effective Principals Who Can Improve the Region's Schools and Influence Student Achievement. Retrieved from http://wallacefoundation.org/knowledge-center/pages/sreb-leadership-initiativ-creating-effectiveprincipals.aspx
- Voelkel, R., Johnson, C.W.& Gilbert, K.A., (2018). Use of immersive simulations to enhance graduate student learning: Implications for educational leadership programs, p. 1-7. Retrieved fromhttps://www.westga.edu/~distance/ojdla/summer192/volkel\_johnson\_gilbert192.html
- Webucator Blog. (August 2014). Top ten most marketable skills. Retrieved from www.webucator.com > blog > 2014/08 > top-ten-most-marketable-skills
- Zoroja, J., Pejic' Bach, M., & Miloloža, I. (2019) Developing leadership in a simulation-games environment. Proceedings of the 42<sup>nd</sup> International Convention, p. 926-931, MIPRO. ieeexplore.ieee.org.

## Table 1 Participant Gender

Gender	Frequency	Percentage
Female	32177.40%	
Male	9422.60%	
Total	415	100.00%

# Table 2: Participant Ethnicity

Ethnicity	Frequency	Percentage
American Indian/ Alaskan	15	.036%
Asian Pacific Islander	10	.024%
Black, Not Hispanic	137	33.0%
Caucasian	252	60.7%
Other	1	.002%
Total	415	100.00%

## Presidential OUTlaw: How Barack Obama Became The First Presidential Advocate For The LGBTQ Community

## Daniel Cervantes Jr Chapman University

When discussing President Obama's presidential legacy, what are some of the first things that come to mind? For the most part, Healthcare or bi-partisan comradery are two areas of a unique presidency that overshadowed a larger legacy left behind Obama's two term presidency; A legacy such as the advancement of Gay rights. Historically, only a small subset of the men and women who have held any political office in the United States have stood up for the group of silenced minorities over the span of two hundred and forty-three years. After the election of President Donald J. Trump, the presidential election of 2020 has brought forth a new set of Democratic candidates that have never been seen before. Mayor Pete Buttigieg (D) of South Bend, Indiana has taken the upcoming election by storm by being the first openly gay candidate to run for executive office. How is it that the controversial topic that most politicians and presidents have tried to separate themselves, or outright ignore, became the landmark legacy for the two-term President and secured a place at the table for member of the LGBTQ+<sup>1</sup>

community? Though President Obama has vocally opposed same-sex marriage at the start of his career, there has

been a clear evolution of thought that has brought on hope for those who seek acceptance by their fellow Americans. Some members of the opposition argue that that President Obama's evolution from a queer "foe" to ally was nothing more than a way to gain more support for his own political ventures. Various news sources have published op-ed pieces that mention the many times that the Obama Administration had essentially worked against the progression of gay rights.<sup>2</sup> Jonathan Rauch, a Brookings Institution senior fellow, even claims that "we [as gay Americans] felt betrayed when his Justice Department insisted, as George W. Bush's had done, that gays have marriage equality already, because we can already marry someone of the opposite sex." Statements, such as these, had left many wondering if the man who had claimed to be the physical representation of "Hope" and "Change" would fight for or against members of the LGBT+ community. But the argument can be made that context of the switch from friend to foe was mostly to gain more of a way to gain political support seeing as Obama was once quoted stating that "I [Obama] favor legalizing same-sex marriage and would fight efforts to prohibit such marriages."<sup>3</sup>

Over the span of two terms, President Obama made his way to become the first United States President to openly advocate for the LGBT community. This legacy has been accredited to various external motivations, including his backing by a coalition made up of political minorities, and inclusive presidential rhetoric that paved the way for many others to carry the torch. This paper takes a closer look at how President Obama became the first President to work towards the equalization of rights for the LGBTQ community. Various topics will be addressed such as Obama's evolution from only endorsing same- sex civil unions to lighting up the white house in resemblance of the LGBTQ pride flag. Public opinion, rhetoric, and external motivations will also be examined to help understand if President Obama changed the political climate or if he changed with it. This paper also takes a more in depth look at the Obama Presidency and how his political rhetoric, policy track record, and proactive action, pertaining to the LGBTQ+ Community, worked together to secure his legacy of being the first American President to advocate for the LGBTQ+ community.

#### The Change You Can Hear

Barack Obama has always had, what he himself has described as, "a certain talent for rhetoric" and has been credited as being one of the most consciously and artfully rhetorical speakers in the recent history of a American Politics.<sup>4</sup> The rhetoric of the American President can be interpreted as a guiding light for the general public in piecing together what the next 4-8 years is going look like. Lori Cox Han and Diane J. Heith, authors of "*Presidents and The Presidency*", note that "rhetoric plays an important rolein the institutional setting of the presidency by enabling different presidents to shape the presidents to shape in a stable and constant manner."<sup>5</sup> Though that is said, Presidential Rhetoric does not begin when one takes office. With the creation of social media andthe growing reliance on the internet, one cannot hide from who they were or what they have said.

Modern presidents, and their respective administrations, carry a consistent rhetorical history of publicly working against the advancements of LGBTQ+ rights dating back the 1950's. President Eisenhower was one the first sitting president to issue an executive order that blatantly discriminated against Homosexual employment in 1953. <sup>6</sup> That's not to mention the "most tolerant person on the subject", President Richard Nixon, negatively faulted the homosexuals for the fall of the Roman Empire and refused to pass laws that seemed to humanize the LGBTQ+ community.<sup>7</sup> While in office, President George H. W. Bush all out ignored the aids epidemic which resulted in the death of over 32,000 Americans before he left office. Finally, the way that President Bill Clinton stood by several discriminatory policies and how President George W. Bush vowed to defend "traditional" marriage values at all cost showed that presidential rhetoric that goes against the advancement of LGBTQ+ rights is still alive in the twenty first century.<sup>8</sup> Prior to 2008, it was more than clear that the relationship between the LGBTQ+ community and prior presidential administrations is one that has developed into pure hatred and has further politicized the "gay agenda."

#### **Pre-Presidency**

A Young Barack Obama made way into the public eye long before he became the first American President of color or the first Presidential advocate for the LGBTQ+ community. From the start, Obama has had a way with offering support to marginalized and oppressed groups. Being a Black man in the United States of America, and the product of an interracial marriage, he was not impervious to the societal and political oppression of minorities that shaped the political landscape ever since the signing of the Declaration of Independence. In 1996, Barack Obama shifted away from the world of academia and successfully ran for the Illinois senate. As stated before, his views were assumed to be "Unequivocally pro-gay"<sup>10</sup> seeing as he had, again, stated that he was in favor of same-sex marriage in a response to candidate's questionnaire from Chicago's Outlines gay newspaper. Later, in another 1996 survey, Obama started his shift away from his pro- gay stance and two years later fully backed away from his supportive position.

Obama unsuccessfully ran for congress in 2000, with little support from the gay community seeing as this shift looked more like a power grab than a thought-out decision. Obama's political perspective surrounding the LGBTQ+ community has been centered around the word "marriage."<sup>11</sup> Several major congressional advancements surrounding the word marriage were made by Obama's "political and practical" approach to same sex issues. With this unique twist to a more traditional approach, there was a subsequent increase of protection surrounding LGBTQ+ rights through civil unions and domestic partnership. Though that is not exactly "marriage" equality, Obama's crafty "lets see what we can accomplish without explicitly stating what we are doing" mindset and rhetoric started to move towards acceptance.

Obama seemed to have made his way back into the hearts of the LGBT community early on in the 2004 U.S senate campaign by reaching out and facilitating discussion between his staff and members of the LGBT community. With several other Pro-LGBT democratic campaigns all pining for a highly contested seat, it seems that the strong coalition of LGBTQ+ members was what was needed in order to make his U.S senate campaign successful. In April 2003, Obama's campaign held a its first community discussion

on gay and lesbian issues at a gay bar in Chicago, Illinois. This cardinal event really set the ball rolling for Obama's campaign seeing as though this was not a large event, it resulted in several members of the crowd joining his election campaign in significant roles (Including raising money, and voter outreach). Later in June, 2003, Obama marched alongside his fellow Democratic candidates in the Chicago Gay and Lesbian Pride Parade with an audience of 375,000+ people.<sup>12</sup> Obama's actions, such as the his initial outreach to the local LGBT+ community and marching in one of Chicago's pride parades, lead the to a creation of a strong coalition of gay voters. This coalition became one of the key factors in Obama's successful Senate campaign, seeing as Republican candidate Jack Ryan refused any support from the gay community (even from the Log Cabin Republicans).<sup>13</sup>

Shifting more towards ally and supporter of gay rights, Obamas rhetoric, as a congressional candidate, started to mirror his actions more closely. While speaking at his rallies, he started to voice his support of civil unions and domestic partnerships more seriously and vowed to continue his support on the Senate floor. His stance on gay rights became more and more clear after the United States Supreme Court's 2003 decision to strike down sodomy laws, stating that this ruling was "an important victory for justice."<sup>1415</sup> President Obama made his first appearance on the national stage as the keynote speaker at the 2004 Democratic National Convention, a speech that would later be referenced as "The seventeen minutes that launched a political star."<sup>16</sup> The once generally unknown junior Senator from Illinois became a household name when he delivered a message in which he discussed "his background, the goals and aspirations of the [Democratic] party and adopting a message of hope."<sup>17</sup> Words, such as, "This is not a liberal America or conservative America, there is only a United States of America" surpassed any speech that was given that night and shifted the national spotlight onto this dark horse runner. Throughout the context of this one speech, Obama touched on several aspects of American Life that were prevelant in 2004, one of which resonated with the national LGBTQ+. Obama humanized the gay community by reminding the nation that "We [as Americans] coach little league in the blue states and yes, we've got some

gay friends in the red states."

With the help of this new-found notoriety, Barack Obama became the symbol for change and a voice for various minority groups all over the nation. His rhetoric had redefined "patriotism as the ideas and values that anyone can hold and become an American"<sup>18</sup> and truly mirrored that change would be at the center of both Obama's successful 2004 Senate and his two successful presidential campaigns.

#### **Pre- Presidential Election**

Throughout these campaigns, Obama used his finely tuned talents to connect with and leave his audience, that he had no direct understanding of their personal hardship, feeling protected. This provided protection wasn't from conservative men and women who are known to not only throw punches; This protection was from the Federal and State governments that have consistently used the LGBT community as a way to distract from the hate-based politics. While launching his campaign back in 2007, Obama spoke on this issue and noted that "when all else fails, when [hurricane] Katrina happens, or the death toll in Iraq mounts, we've been told that out crises are somebody else's fault. We're distracted for out real failures, and told to blame the other party, or gay people, or immigrants." He continued by dedicating his campaign to those who wanted to see real change in their political system and were willing to put in the work to ensure that change would come. "That is why this campaign can't only be about me. It must be

about us- it must be about what we can do together."19

Obama, like any other candidate, made many mistakes and didn't always provide the right answer to every question that was asked on the campaign trail. There were many instances that left voters wondering if he would be the champion of change that the LGBTQ+ community needed in order to find their rightful seat at the table. Fortunately, Barack Obama's rhetorical track record was consistently in favor of the politically oppressed and was not afraid to speak on issues that other candidates would rather not touch on. Speaking on these politically taboo issues became the strength of Obama's campaign, but as the campaign progressed, the fears of the LGBTQ+ community shifted once again. The promises made by

candidates are blue prints for their focus once they take office.<sup>20</sup> Obama was starting to make more promises to the gay community on the campaign trail leaving many to wonder if these were just typical campaign promises that would never become reality. Would his message line up with his mandate to govern or would this just be another attempt from a power-hungry politician to make his way up the political ladder? But throughout the span of his campaign, Obamas rhetorical message of inclusivity was consistent, speaking eloquently on issues like Don't ask, Don't Tell, HIV and Healthcare, and the murder of Mathew Shepard. <sup>21</sup> After a leap of faith taken by the gay community, and the rest of the Obama coalition, America elected its first gay friendly, African- American President on November 4<sup>th</sup>. 2008.

#### The Obama Presidency

Though it took longer than expected, the newly elected President Barack H. Obama slowly started to mend the historically frayed relationship between the LGBTQ+ community and the President of the United States. Over the span of Obama's presidency, LGBTQ+ Americans were able to see the evolution of Obama's thought process surrounding some of his negative views towards the same-sex marriage. Many policy issues had been touched on within the first four years of his presidency, but it wasn't until 2012 where Obama publicly confirmed his support for gay marriage. In an interview with ABC News correspondent, Robin Roberts, Obama detailed his personal evolution of his views and became the first president in American History to publicly support gay marriage. This rhetorical shift provided the marriage equality movement with a national ally that illustrated that people can really change and evolve from their previous thoughts and opinions. From stating "I believe marriage is between a man and a woman. I am not in favor of gay marriage"<sup>22</sup> in 2008, to "I've just concluded that for me personally it is

important for me to go ahead and affirm that I think same-sex couples should be able to get married"<sup>23</sup> in 2012. Over the span of four years, President Obama use of the bully pulpit had done more for the LGBTQ+ community than any other president in American History. Many opposers, again, accredited this historic change to seeking reelection and a second term and not actually because he believed in same-sex marriage.

Regardless of intention, Obama's proclamation showed that all humans, regardless of title, are capable of change and that all Americans deserve equality. Even after re-election, the lame duck president did not give up on his support for the queer community. After the legalization of Same-Sex marriage, Obama was one of the first to voice his happiness just moments after the Supreme Court Ruling has handed down. The White House was also ordered to be lit up to represent the iconic LGBTQ+ rainbow pride flag in support of historic ruling. <sup>24</sup> After a heinous terrorist attack that took place at Pulse Nightclub in the Summer of 2016, President Obama's response was not to declare this as just an attack on the LGBT community, but as an attack on America. <sup>25</sup> In his issued response to the deadliest shooting in American history, Obama made it clear that "this is a sobering reminder that attacks on any American -- regardless of race, ethnicity, religion or sexual orientation -- is an attack on all of us and on the fundamental values of equality and dignity that define us as a country. And no act of hate or terror will ever change who we are or the values that make us Americans."<sup>26</sup>

Over the span of his Presidential tenure, Obama continued to voice his support for the gay community at the national level in various venues. He was a constant supporter of the Human rights campaign (HRC) and became what some would call the token "straight spokesman" for the organization after delivering several speeches that had gone viral in a matter of hours after being posted online.<sup>27</sup> With his use of the bully pulpit, President Obama changed the previous conversations surrounding the LGBTQ+ community and turned it into a more virtuous avenue of acceptance. Several of President Obama weekly video addresses were focused on LGBTQ+ rights, policy change, and updates on the work that the White House was doing to keep this new conversation going. In further effort to tackle bullying and discrimination within the LGBT youth community, while increasing social acceptance, President Obama employed his social media skills and teamed up with *The Trevor Project* to release a "It gets better" video on *the Obama White house* YouTube page. In this three-minute video, President Obama was able to use

the digital bully pulpit to remind all members of the LGBT community that things do get better, that all are created equal, and that all Americans are entitled to pursue happiness.

## **Post-Presidency**

As Obama's time in office started to come to a close, the lame duck president did not give up on advocating for the LGBT community. During the 2015 State of the Union address, President Barack Obama made history by becoming the first American President to use the words "Transgendered" and "Bisexual" when addressing the nation. While closing out his address to the nation, Obama begins to describe American democracy as a brand and goes on to explain how hard it is to maintain that brand without the voice the people that protect human dignity. "As Americans, we respect human dignity [...] that's why we defend free speech, and advocate for political prisoners, and condemn the persecution of women, or religious minorities, or people who are lesbian, gay, bisexual, or transgender. We do these things not

## only because they're right, but because they make us safer." 28

Regardless of the political backlash, President Obama chose to speak for the criminalized and voiceless LGBT community throughout his time on the national stage. Even though he may have not always carried a consistent ideology towards marriage equality and Same-Sex marriage. The overall conclusion of rhetorical research shows that Obama's use of the digital bully pulpit and the evolution of his stance on Same-Sex marriage were two major actions that mended the historically tragic relationship between the LGBT community and the Office of the President.

## The Change You Can Feel

Domestic Policy, regarding the LGBTQ+ community, has historically been a way to institutionalize discrimination based on sexual orientation and gender identity. Consistently, American Politicians, and Presidents alike, have looked at the issues of queer politics as either morally repugnant or not as big of an issue as it is. As stated earlier in this essay, several previous presidents have issued policies and enforced laws that provided legal precedent for the discrimination of Americans who identified as queer. And though America is officially a secular society with a separation of church and state, many anti- LGBTQ+ policy issues are rooted in religious exemptions.

President Barack Obama, even identifying with the Christian Denomination, did not see these religious exemptions as a chance to establish a "moral society", but a blockage of civil rights. While in Congress, President Obama strategically "switched" his views on Same Sex marriage for, what seemed like, religious reasons. This switch left many of his LGBTQ+ supporter in disarray for quite some time due to how quickly his views changed and how his rhetoric surrounding the word "marriage" changed. Fortunately for the LGBT community, Obama carried through with the promises throughout his first presidential campaign and brought change to the White House and to domestic policy.

While in office, President Obama and his administration had made many strides in their efforts to bring equality to all Americans; more specifically queer Americans. His administrative track record includes over 30 policy initiatives and executive orders that continuously expanded the rights of the LGBTQ+ community further than any administration had before. <sup>29</sup> These legislative achievements advanced equality for the LGBTQ+ community in the areas of health, civil rights and marriage equality, and even in areas that involve discrimination and hate.

#### Anti-Discrimination and Hate

One of Obama's first major acts as president for the LGBTQ+ community was signing the Matthew Shepard and James Byrd, Jr., Hate Crimes Act of 2009 into law.<sup>30</sup> This act detailed that the "Justice Department jurisdiction over crimes of violence in which a perpetrator has selected a victim because of sexual orientation or gender identity, as well as many other characteristics."<sup>31</sup> The LGBTQ+ community has, historically, been subjected to verbal and physical attacks by anti-LGBTQ+ extremist, both in public and private, for as little as identifying as queer. 21-year-old college student, Matthew Shepard, was beaten to death by two men solely based on his sexuality. At the time of the murder, many states did not recognize violence that targets victims based on their sexual orientation as a hate crime. Even under federal law, only crimes committed based on color, race, religion or national origin would fall under the

umbrella of recognized hate crimes.<sup>32</sup>

The bill was first introduced to the House of Representatives during the 106<sup>th</sup> through the 110<sup>th</sup> congress and though referred to the judiciary committee, the bill continuously died in either in the House or in the Senate. The bill was reintroduced again while 111<sup>th</sup> congress was in session and passed in both the House and the Senate as an amendment to National Defense Authorization act for the 2010 fiscal year.

President Obama signed the act into law on October 28<sup>th</sup>, 2009 without hesitation. The historical significance of the signing this hate crimes prevention act in to law was that it not only that it was the first to offer federal protections for the LGBTQ+ community against hate- based violence; It was also the first time a sitting president worked in favor of the gay community. Obama's signing of The Matthew Shepard and James Byrd, Jr., Hate Crimes Prevention Act of 2009 was not only historical, but was also the proof needed that the LGBTQ+ community would not be forgotten once again.

#### Repealing "Don't Ask, Don't Tell"

"Don't ask, Don't tell" a directive that called for the discharge of any military personal that was openly homosexual or queer had consistently been a hot button topic for LGBTQ+ members of society, seeing as this policy initiative was a just way to discriminate against the queer community through suppression. <sup>33</sup> Though the intentions of "Don't Ask, Don't tell" were to expand the rights of LGBTQ+ Military personnel that had been discriminated against since homosexuality was formally listed as an "exclusionary characteristic" back in 1942, many gay rights activist felt that this policy did "little to combat the prejudice against them."<sup>34</sup>

As a presidential candidate, Barack Obama had stated many times that, if elected, he would call for the immediate repeal of "Don't ask, Don't tell." After being elected in 2008, many gay rights activists and military personal waited for the moment that for the newly-elected president to go forward with the promised repeal. In January of 2009, shortly after his inauguration, President Obama received a letter in which Second lieutenant Sandy Tsao publicly came out as a lesbian. In her personal letter, Tsao depicted the daily struggles she faced as an army officer, a Christian, and a lesbian under the "Don't Ask, Don't tell" policy. Though Tsao was aware that sending this letter would lead to her discharge from the military, she hoped that President Obama would "help [the LGBT community] win the war against prejudice so that future generation will continue to work together and fight for our freedoms regardless of race, color, gender, religion, national origin or sexual orientation."<sup>35</sup> President Obama later responded to Tsao's letter and request for action by stating that "Although it will take some time to complete (partly because it needs congressional action) I intended to fulfill my commitment"

After the repeal of "Don't Ask, Don't Tell" and signing the Hate Crimes Act of 2009 into law, it was safe to say Obama had up held several of his campaign promises while also securing his legacy as the first pro LGBTQ+ President in U.S History. President Obama had expanded federal policy to protect the gay community and their rights, an action that many politicians wouldn't consider. According to Obama' White House online archive dedicated to LGBT policy; President Obama didn't feel that partial equality was enough for any subset of Americans. In a statement published on the same webpage, President Obama's solidarity was described as a "commitment to leveling the playing field and ensuring equal protection under the law is the bedrock principle this nation was founded on and has guided the

President's actions in support of all Americans."36

#### **LGBTQ+ Health Policy**

Another aspect of policy that Obama worked tirelessly to equalize and expand on while in office was the area of health policy. Sadly, general knowledge of President Obama's work in the area of health policy is often only his fight for universal health care, as known as "The Affordable Care Act." Though the Affordable Care Act made it illegal for insurance companies to discriminate based on pre-existing conditions and made it easier for people living with HIV and AIDS; Equality, in regard to health policy, was not solely embedded in health care reform. President Obama understood that "equality under the law does not always apply to the LGBTQ+ community" and health policy proved to be the most discriminatory

in regards to LGBTQ+ rights.<sup>37</sup> Ryan Baily, a health law fellowat DePaul University, discussed the how the field of health care has been at the forefront of the LGBT battlegrounds for so long in an article

published by the American Medical Association Journal of Ethics.<sup>38</sup> Throughout his essay, Baily cites Justice Kennedy of the United States Supreme Court's given opinion regarding homosexuals fundamental right to privacy in the case of *Lawrence v. Texas* as the first step towards equality in the area of health

care and health services.<sup>39</sup> The decriminalization of sexual intimacy between homosexuals and allowing consensual sexual activity to be covered to under the right to privacy set a new standard of equality for LGBTQ+ Americans.

The Supreme court's decision regarding *Lawrence v. Texas* provided the necessary precedent for the Obama Administration to enact state laws that would reverse the laws working against the LGBTQ+ community. At the federal level, President Obama used the extension of rights to privacy, protected by *Lawrence*, to equalize patient's rights within hospitals that were federally funded. In April 2010, Obama issued a memorandum to the U.S Secretary of Health requesting that "all hospitals that participate in

Medicare or Medicaid respect the rights of patients to designate visitors." <sup>40</sup> This memorandum would allow for LGBTQ+ patients to carry the same "visitation privileges that are no more restrictive than those immediate family members enjoy."<sup>41</sup>

#### Marriage Equality

In February 2011, President Obama and his Attorney General brought LGBTQ+ members of society closer to marriage equality with the announcement that the Department of Justice (D.O.J) would no longer defend the Defense of Marriage Act or its provisions.<sup>42</sup> Under the Defense of Marriage Act, marriage had been defined as "legal union between one man and one woman as husband and wife, and the word

'spouse' refers only to a person of the opposite sex who is a husband or a wife.",43

After the Obama's presidential declaration against upholding the Defense of Marriage Act, the marriage equality movement found itself one step closer to the fulfilling their goals. In the case of *United States v. Windsor*, section three of Defense of Marriage Act was challenged when Windsor Spyder was denied a federal estate tax exemption for surviving spouses on the estate that was left to her by her late wife.<sup>44</sup> Since Marriage was defined as only between a man and a woman, Spyder was denied a tax refund on the

\$363,053 that was paid estate taxes by the Internal Revenue Service. Due to the Attorney General's decision to no longer defend the constitutionality of the Defense of Marriage Act, the United States had been represented by the Bipartisan Legal Advisory Group (BLAG) of the House of Representatives. Ultimately, the Court ruled in favor of Windsor, stating that section three of D.O.M.A was unconstitutional on the grounds that it was a "deprivation of the equal liberty of persons that is protected by the Fifth Amendment." <sup>45</sup> After the Supreme Court handed down their decision, President Obama ordered the members of his Cabinet to review the thousands of federal laws and regulations to assure that this decision would be implemented by the federal government as quickly as possible.

The *Windsor* victory set the stage for the future of marriage equality by allowing for federal marriage benefits to be awarded to same-sex couples who were married in states or countries that legally recognize same-sex marriage. In the span of time that it took for *Obergefell v. Hodges* to reach the Supreme Court, marriage equality had been at the center of various aspects of daily life.<sup>46</sup> On June 26<sup>th</sup>, 2015, the United States Supreme Court handed down their decision that state prohibitions on same-sex marriage unconstitutional based on the fact that this violates due process liberty guarantees of the Fourteenth Amendment.<sup>47</sup>

#### The change you can feel

Whether it be positive or negative, presidential legacies are the accumulation of the major moments that have taken place thought each respective president's time in office. Each executive order, judicial nominee, and policy decision is assessed to determine each president's historical footprint and decipher which areas were affected by each respective office.

After 8 years in office, President Obama's legacy has been the subject of debate for many presidency scholars. Obama's presidential legacy is rooted in an aspect of his presidency that most critics and supporters would never have thought of but is one that secured his place in history. On top of being the first African-American President, it is clear that the expansion of LGBTQ+ rights had become the main takeaway from his 8 years in office. Between carrying a positive rhetoric and offering unwavering support for the LGBTQ+ community, real change had been put into place under the Obama administration that can be measured with both qualitative and quantitative methods.

#### **Ouantitative measurement**

In a 2013 study, conducted by the Pew Research Center, LGBT Americans were asked if they felt as if things were better than they were 10 years prior.<sup>48</sup> The survey was designed to quantifiably measure LGBT American's overall attitudes, experiences, and values in the changing social and political landscape. The analysis of the experience and attitudes of the LGBT population in this report was represented by a sample of 1,197 adults who identified as LGBT.<sup>49</sup> The Pew Research Center relied on a random sample of adults who agreed to take part of an online survey, hosted by a third party, in exchange for small monetary reward after the completion of the survey. Several areas surrounding the daily lives of LGBT (i.e. social acceptance, marriage and parenting, and partisanship, policy views, values) were examined in order to better measure the overall change in culture from 2003-2013.

Though the data from the survey was primarily intended to measure the shift in the views held by LGBT Americans on the progression of acceptance in American culture, the Pew Research Center found that the LGBT population was more "distinctive in ways beyond sexual orientation."<sup>50</sup> The survey had found that, compared to the general public, members of the LGBT community were more democratic, less religious, more liberal, and less happy with their lives. It was also discovered that average family income of LGBT Americans was lower, and that LGBT Americans were more perceptive to discrimination, both against themselves and other minority groups.

## Social Acceptance

Social acceptance plays a giant role in the progression and expansion of Civil Rights, regardless of the movement. If the there is little to no acceptance coming from the majority of the general public, the nonviolent social movement becomes less likely to be successful. This data provided by the Pew Research Center was collected years before many pro-LGBT policy changes had been decided upon or had taken affect, but still highlights the progression of acceptance that LGBT community members feel from general public. According to data, the majority (59%) of LGBT adults surveyed felt that there was at least some social acceptance of the gay community; 19% felt as if there was a significant amount of social acceptance,

leaving 21% of LGBT Adults feeling as if there was little to no acceptance in 2013.<sup>51</sup>

Though 80% of those surveyed felt that social acceptance in 2013 was low, 92% of respondents felt that society was now more accepting than they were 10 years ago. Pew Research Center also found, in a corresponding survey, that those who know someone who identifies as LGBT, were more accepting of homosexuality and gay marriage. Surveys that focus more on the views of general public suggest that social acceptance is rising and could possibly be accredited to the growing numbers of adults who know someone who is homosexual.<sup>52</sup> Data from 1993 suggest only 61% of Americans personally knew someone who identified as homosexual, as opposed to the 87% in 2013.

With little knowledge of the future, and what it would mean for the LGBT community, respondents seemed to choose hope as opposed to fear. When asked about the future of social acceptance, 92% of respondents felt that society would be more accepting of the LGBT community over the next 10 years.<sup>53</sup> But, with a history of oppression and little acceptance coming from the general public, why did respondent feel that society would be more accepting in the next decade? 70% of respondents agreed that knowing someone who is LGBT is a correlating factor in overall social acceptance, but 66% felt that support on LGBT issues from non-LGBT leaders plays a huge role in society becoming more accepting of the community. <sup>54</sup>

When asked to name a few public figures that were vital to the advancement of LGBT rights, who would also be recognizable at the national level, a total of six names were listed. Among those names were public figures, Anderson Cooper, Hillary Clinton, Barney Frank, and Neil Patrick Harris; All receiving less than 3% of respondents naming them as vital to the LGBT movement. Ellen DeGeneres came in second with about 18% of LGBT adults naming her as an important figure in the progression of LGBT rights. Barack Obama received roughly 23% of respondents feeling that the President of the United

States was the national figure who had been the most important in advancing LGBT rights.<sup>55</sup> Not only did a majority of respondents cite President Obama as one of the most important figures in advancing LGBT rights, 63% of LGBT Adult felt that Obama Administration was generally friendly towards people who identify as LGBT; 30% felt that the Obama Administration was generally neutral, which left 6%

feeling like the administration had been generally unfriendly to the gay community.<sup>56</sup>

## Partisanship, policy, views, values.

Obama has consistently had a strong LGBTQ+ backing, even after he left office in 2017. The overall impressions of Obama presidency and its relationship with the LGBTQ+ community seemed to have been positive during his first term and followed him into his second term. Pew Research Center found that 76% of all LGBT Americans had favorable opinions of President Obama, leaving 24% with an opinion that would be considered quite unfavorable.<sup>57</sup> Respondents who Identified as lesbian (84%) seemed to be more likely to have favorable opinions of Obama, with gay men (83%) following suit. 68% of bisexuals carried favorable opinions, leaving this sub-section to carry most of the LGBT community's unfavorable opinions of Obama and his time in office.

#### **Oualitative Measurement**

Assessing Obama's presidential legacy should not be confined only to quantitative forms of measurements, seeing as Obama did not only bring on policy change; He brought on social and emotional change for the LGBT community. From the enactment of laws preventing hate crimes, to becoming the first president to use the words "bisexual" and "Transgender" in his last State of the Union speech; Obama left behind more than just policy change. Though many critics and scholars may argue Obama's presidential downfalls outweigh his accomplishments, the memories that his supporters carry will be those of both tangible and emotional change.

Though this area of measurement is based on the subjective views of the nation as opposed to objective, it can tie into how quantitative measurements is interpreted across various platforms. In the 2013 survey of LGBT Americans conducted by the Pew Research Center, several anonymous responses explaining reasoning behind various questions were published throughout the report. One question that was coupled with a response was "Which Public Figures, at the National Level, Have Been Important in Advancing LGBT Rights?"<sup>58</sup> The first response that was shared stated that "Barack Obama helps a lot- I am amazed to have a sitting president supporting my right to marry."<sup>59</sup> A gay man also stated that they found it "profoundly brave of President Obama to end the 'Don't Ask, Don't Tell' policy." <sup>60</sup> Again, This survey was published several years before the legalization of Same-Sex marriage.

Gautam Raghavan, editor of "West Wingers: Stories from the Dream Chasers, Change Makers, and Hope Creators Inside the White House," recounts his positive experiences as a gay man working for the Obama Administration.<sup>61</sup> According to the White House Staffer, support of Same-Sex Marriage showed double digit growth among black voters in Maryland and Pennsylvania within weeks of the Obama's announcement.<sup>62</sup> The movement continued to gain momentum with the U.S Supreme Court's decision to strike down section 3 of the Defense of Marriage Act under United States v. Winsor just a year later.<sup>63</sup> And in three years-time, the U.S Supreme Court would hand down their decision on Obergefell v. Hodges thus legalizing Same-Sex marriage.<sup>64</sup> Raghavan continuously cites Obama's leadership and support for the LGBTQ+ community as some of the main reasons that LGBTQ+ rights progressed so quickly over his eight years in office.

### **Conclusion**

After copious amounts of research on Barack Obama's time in office, it is clear that Obama contributed to the progression positive change to the American political landscape. But what was also made clear is that most of that political change found its way back to the LGBTQ+ Community. In each aspect, inclusion was at the core of the majority of decisions that were made by the Obama Administration.

The rhetorical aspect of Obama's political career, in regard the LGBTQ+ community, evolved over the span of 20 years. The strategic use of his rhetorical talents throughout his evolution and time on national stage seemed to be exactly what was needed to bring LGBTQ+ closer to social and political acceptance. After examining his over twenty years-worth of carefully crafted orations that echo acceptance of the LGBT community, it safe to say that Obama's use of the bully pulpit was one of key factors in the expansion of LGBT acceptance and protections. Through the use of his words and his political position, Barack Obama preached Inclusion instead of exclusion; Successfully humanizing the LGBTQ+ community and establishing a new relationship with the LGBTQ+ community.

President Obama's policy agenda and track record has had its fair share of highs and lows but has ultimately remained consistent throughout his time in office. Several areas of policy that were focused on by the Obama administration positively affected the LGBT community, each expanding the rights of LGBTQ+ Americans over the span of 8 years. After examining these several areas of policy that worked to establish protection and expand LGBTQ+ rights, it is clear that the policy goals of the administration were based in overall inclusion. Each aspect of domestic policy that had been changed to offer legal protections for the LGBTQ+ community were ones that previously excluded members of the community; Making President Obama the first American president to support pro-LGBT policies in the history of the Union.

Finally, Obama's legacy made it possible for members of the LGBT community to feel as if their movement had made any progress towards being accepted by society. The Pew Research Center was able to quantifiably measure the overall feelings of the LGBT community in the aspects of social acceptance, policy, and President Barack Obama. Even with the data being collected in 2013, the interpreted data provides evidence that Barack Obama was able to change the American political and social landscape over the span of his first term. With little to no recent data regarding the LGBT community from reliable sources collected during or after Obama's presidency, one must measure his second term using qualitative measurements. We can determine the legacy of the Obama administration through the plethora of stories coming from every aspect of the LGBT communities and their allies that describe the positive societal change brought on by the Obama Administration.

Overall, the combination of all three areas examined led to the creation of the first pro-LGBTQ+ Presidential advocate. It can be agreed that that President Obama's actions were meticulously calculated and carried out, allowing them to be viewed as a positive example of how the ends justify the means. Through his strong leadership, many have been able to carry his legacy of LGBTQ+ rights into future elections and various positions of power. After two terms in office, Barack Obama and his Administration provided the LGBTQ+ community with their rightful place at the table and a platform to speak their mind in ways that other presidential administrations would never allow. The change Obama brought on gave many LGBTQ+ adults the pathway to run their campaigns openly. Moving forward, the LGBTQ+ community still has a lot more ground to cover to reach their goal of total equality within the United States, but their presidential ally helped bring them a few steps closer.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup>Throughout the paper "LGBTQ+" is used to refer to the American Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Transgendered, questioning, questioning, and others (ally) community

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> See Jonathan Rauch's "Why Gay Rights May Be President Obama's Biggest Legacy", The Brookings

Institution, May 11<sup>th</sup>, 2011, available at https://www.brookings.edu/opinions/why-gay-rights-may-be-president-obamas- biggest-legacy/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> 1996 Outlines gay newspaper questionnaire response from then-Candidate for Illinois state Senate Barack Obama.

<sup>4</sup> See Sam Leith "Words like Loaded Pistols: Rhetoric for Aristotle to Obama", Basic Books, 2012, Pg.231

<sup>5</sup> Dr. Lori Cox Han and Dr. Diane J. Heith, "Presidents and The Presidency", *Oxford University Press*, second edition, 2017

<sup>6</sup> See Executive Order #10450, President Dwight D. Eisenhower, 1953

<sup>7</sup> President Richard Nixon, the Nixon Tapes, 1971-1972

<sup>8</sup> See Defense of Marriage Act (Pub.L. 104–199, 110 Stat. 2419, enacted September 21, 1996, 1 U.S.C. § 7 and 28 U.S.C. § 1738C)

<sup>9</sup> See Department of Defense Directive 1304.26 issued on December 21, 1993

<sup>10</sup> Tracy Baim, "Obama and the Gays: A Political Marriage", Amazon Books, 2010.

<sup>11</sup> Tracy Baim, "Obama and the Gays: A Political Marriage", *Amazon Books*, 2010.

<sup>12</sup> Estimation provided by Chicago Police Department and provided by Tracy Baim "375,000+ at the 2003 Pride Parade" *Windy City Times*, June 2, 2003

<sup>13</sup> The Log Cabin Republican is a National Organization created by members of the Republican party who identify as queer

<sup>14</sup> Tracy Baim, "Obama and the Gays: A Political Marriage", Amazon Books, 2010.

<sup>15</sup> Lawrence V. Texas (02-102) 539 U.S 558 (2003) 41 s. w. 3d 349, Reversed and Remanded

<sup>16</sup>Eli Saslow "The Seventeen Minutes that launched a Political star" Washington Post, August 25,2008

<sup>17</sup> Barack Obama's 2004 Democratic National Convention Keynote speech; Full transcript and video found at https://www.c-span.org/video/?182718-3/senator-barack-obama-2004-democratic-national-convention-keynote- speech

<sup>18</sup> See "The Obama Years: The Power of Words" Smithsonian Documentary, Jon Farevro, 6:40

<sup>19</sup> Barack Obama's Presidential Campaign kick-off speech. Tracy Baim, "Obama and the Gays: A Political Marriage",

Amazon Books, 2010

<sup>20</sup> Dr. Lori Cox Han and Dr. Diane J. Heith, "Presidents and The Presidency", *Oxford University Press*, second edition, 2017

<sup>21</sup>Referencing the murder of 21-year-old Matthew Sheppard, a gay college student who was brutally murdered and targeted based on his sexuality

<sup>22</sup> Referencing to the response from, then presidential candidate, Senator Barack Obama's (D- Illinois) 2008 MTV interview regarding same-sex marriage and support of Proposition 8

<sup>23</sup> Barack Obama's Interview with ABC news correspondent Robin Robert's; American Broadcasting Company.
05/09/12

<sup>24</sup> See cover photo by Pablo Martinez Monsivais, AP

<sup>25</sup> Ralph Ellis, Ashley Fantz, Faith Karimi and Eliott C. McLaughlin, "Orlando shooting: 49 killed, shooter pledged ISIS allegiance", *CNN*, June 13, 2016, https://www.cnn.com/2016/06/12/us/orlando-nightclub-shooting/index.html

<sup>26</sup> President Barack Obama's remarks on the Pulse Night Club shooting in June 2016. Full remarks found at https://obamawhitehouse.archives.gov/blog/2016/06/12/president-obama-tragic-shooting-orlando <sup>27</sup> Viral; noun; an image, video, advertisement, etc., that is circulated rapidly on the

Internet. <sup>28</sup> President Barack Obama's State of the Union Address, January 19<sup>th</sup>, 2015;

Washington, D.C.<sup>29</sup> See "Fact sheet Obama Administration's Record and the LGBT

Community";

https://obamawhitehouse.archives.gov/the-press-office/2016/06/09/fact-sheet-obama-administrations-record- and-lgbt-community

<sup>30</sup> The Matthew Shepard and James Byrd, Jr., Hate Crimes Prevention Act of 2009, 18 U.S.C. § 249, was enacted as Division E of the National Defense Authorization Act for Fiscal Year 2010. Section 249 of Title 18 provides funding and technical assistance to state, local, and tribal jurisdictions to help them to more effectively investigate and prosecute hate crimes.

<sup>31</sup> Katy Stinemetz, "See Obama's 20-year evolution on LGBT rights", Time Magazine, April 10,

2015; http://time.com/3816952/obama-gay-lesbian-transgender-lgbt-rights/

<sup>32</sup> See Civil Rights Act of 1968, [18 U.S.C. § 245 (b)(2); Violent Crime Control and Law Enforcement Act of 1994 28 U.S.C. § 994 note Sec. 280003; Church Arson Prevention Act H.R. 3525, Pub.L. 104-155]

<sup>33</sup> Don't ask, Don't Tell Act (DADT), Clinton Administration, Department of Defense, Directive 1304.26. Full text: https://biotech.law.lsu.edu/blaw/dodd/corres/html2/d130426x.htm

<sup>34</sup> Sarah Pruitt, "Was 'Don't ask, Don't tell' a step forward for LGBT in the Military", *History*, April 25,2018.
<sup>35</sup> Tracy Baim, "Obama responds to a Lesbian Soldier 's letter", *Windy City Times*, May 13, 2009. Full text found at http://www.windycitymediagroup.com/lgbt/Obama-responds-to-lesbian-soldiers-letter/21121.html

<sup>36</sup> Full statement found on the White House of President Barack Obama, Office of the Press Secretary, Statements and releases: Fact Sheet, Obama Administration's Record and the LGBT Community https://obamawhitehouse.archives.gov/the-press-office/2016/06/09/fact-sheet-obama-administrationsrecord- and-lgbt-community

<sup>37</sup> Ryan Baily, "Heath law: The LGBT community, Health Policy, and the Law," American Medical Association Journal of ethics, August 2010, volume 12, Number 8: 658-622.

<sup>38</sup> Ryan Baily, "Heath law: The LGBT community, Health Policy, and the Law," American Medical Association Journal of ethics, August 2010, volume 12, Number 8: 658-622.

<sup>39</sup> Lawrence v Texas, 530 US 558 (2003)

<sup>40</sup> Barack Obama, Memorandum on Respecting the Rights of Hospital Patients To Receive Visitors and To Designate Surrogate Decision Makers for Medical Emergencies Online by Gerhard Peters and John T. Woolley, The American Presidency Project https://www.presidency.ucsb.edu/node/288346

<sup>41</sup>See footnote 44.

<sup>42</sup> Defense of Marriage Act (DOMA) (Pub.L. 104–199, 110 Stat. 2419, enacted September 21, 1996, 1 U.S.C. § 7 and 28 U.S.C. § 1738C)

<sup>43</sup> Defense of Marriage Act (DOMA) (Pub.L. 104–199, 110 Stat. 2419, enacted September 21, 1996, 1 U.S.C. § 7 and 28 U.S.C. § 1738C); Section 3 (a)

44 US v. Windsor, 133 S. Ct. 2675 (2013)

<sup>45</sup> See Footnote 49

<sup>46</sup> Obergefell v. Hodges, 135 S. Ct. 2584, 2628 (2015)

<sup>47</sup> Courtney W. Daum, "Marriage Equality: Assimilationist Victory or Pluralist Defeat?", *LGBT Politics*, New York University Press, 2017; Edited by Marla Brettschneider, Susan Burgess, Christine Keating,

<sup>48</sup> Pew Research Center, "Survey of LGBT Americans: Attitudes, Experiences, and Values", June 13, 2013
<sup>49</sup> Pew Research Center, "Survey of LGBT Americans: Attitudes, Experiences, and Values", June 13, 2013; See Methodology, Pg. 113-119

<sup>50</sup> Pew Research Center, "Survey of LGBT Americans: Attitudes, Experiences, and Values", June 13, 2013; *Demographic Overview*.

<sup>51</sup> Data taken from Pew Research Center, "Survey of LGBT Americans: Attitudes, Experiences, and Values", June 13, 2013; *Demographic Overview*. (N=1,197). Those who did not answer were not included. See Figure 1

<sup>52</sup> Pew Research Center for the People & the Press, May 1-5, 2013 poll and Pew Forum on Religion & Public Life, March 21-April 8, 2013 poll

<sup>53</sup> Data taken from Pew Research Center, "Survey of LGBT Americans: Attitudes, Experiences, and Values", June
13, 2013; Social Acceptance, Page 30. (N=1,197). Those who did not answer were not included. See Figure 2.1
<sup>54</sup> Data taken from Pew Research Center, "Survey of LGBT Americans: Attitudes, Experiences, and Values", June

13, 2013; *Social Acceptance*, Page 34. (N=1,197). Those who did not answer were not included. See Figure 2.2 <sup>55</sup> Data taken from Pew Research Center, "Survey of LGBT Americans: Attitudes, Experiences, and Values", June 13, 2013; *Social Acceptance*, Page 35. (N=1,197). Those who did not answer were not included. See Figure 2.3 <sup>56</sup> Data taken from Pew Research Center, "Survey of LGBT Americans: Attitudes, Experiences, and Values", June 13, 2013; *Social Acceptance*, Page 37. (N=1,197). Those who did not answer were not included. See Figure 2.4 <sup>57</sup> Data taken from Pew Research Center, "Survey of LGBT Americans: Attitudes, Experiences, and Values", June 13, 2013; *Partisanship, policy views, values*, Page 105. (N=1,197). Those who did not answer were not included.

See Figure 2.4 <sup>58</sup> See Figure 2.3

<sup>59</sup> See full quote: Lesbian, age 32; Pew Research Center, "Survey of LGBT Americans: Attitudes, Experiences, and Values", June 13, 2013; *Social Acceptance*, Page 36.

<sup>60</sup> See full quote: Gay Man, age 60; Pew Research Center, "Survey of LGBT Americans: Attitudes, Experiences, and Values", June 13, 2013; *Social Acceptance*, Page 36.

<sup>61</sup> "West Wingers: Stories from the Dream Chasers, Change Makers, and Hope Creators Inside the White House" *Penguin Books*, 2018.

<sup>62</sup> Gautam Raghavan, "West Wingers: Stories from the Dream Chasers, Change Makers, and Hope Creators Inside the White House" *Penguin Books*, 2018; Evolution, Pg. 1-20.

<sup>63</sup> United States v. Windsor, 133 S. Ct. 2675 (2013)
<sup>64</sup> Obergefell v. Hodges, 135 S. Ct. 2584, 2628 (2015)

## Global Pandemics as a National Security Threat

John J. Gascho Jacquelyn E. Harn Dean A. Hicks Undergraduate Students Georgia Southern University Department of Political Science & International Studies

Joséde Arimatéia da Cruz Georgia Southern University Department of Political Science & International Studies US Army War College Strategic Studies Institute

#### Abstract

Historically, the term 'national security' has been strictly associated with military strength, defense, and external threats. A country's national security solely concerned their military prowess and their ability to defend themselves against foreign invaders. However, the ambiguous term 'national security' has evolved to incorporate numerous non-traditional factors such as the economy, gender equality, climate change, and even infectious and epidemic diseases. This evolution, while revolutionary for the study and development of national security, has endured sporadic research. For example, the impact of infectious and epidemic diseases on national security is a topic that has been ignored by scholars and researchers alike. This paper will discuss the broad effects that widespread diseases have on political stability, the armed forces at home and abroad, and society as a whole, all of which contribute to the overall topic of national security, and, consequently, how the term 'national security' is reinvented via this connection. The acute effects of widespread diseases impact developed, developing, and underdeveloped nations and are not restricted to particular social classes; both the wealthy and the impoverished have the potential to be affected, resulting in an overall extensive impact worthy of discussion.

#### I. National Security and the Outbreak of Infectious Diseases

What is 'national security'? While there literature is abundant on the topic of "national security," the definitions, interpretations, and characteristics of the term vary greatly. Historically, 'national security' was limited to the concepts of power, force, and military strength which could also be referred to as 'military security' (Holmes, 2014). The term has been defined as, "the protection of a state's territory, population, and interests against external threats" (Feldbaum, 2006). However, what classifies external threats? The ambiguity of 'external threats' further broadens the existing vague term of "national security." Traditionally, external threats were limited to military threats to a nation's defense and sovereignty. Overtime, the term "national security" has evolved to incorporate numerous non-traditional factors such as the economy, gender equality, climate change, and even infectious diseases; all of which pose potential threats to a state's territory and population.

The prevention and management of infectious diseases is a necessary component of national security policy. At a foundational level, national security includes protecting the nation from any entity, phenomenon, or individual that could pose a threat to national interests and the daily lives of the population. The initiative of a nation to prevent the spread of illnesses is categorized under the umbrella of national security as global health security. The Preamble of the Constitution of the World Health Organization (WHO) refers to the, "happiness, harmonious relations and security of all peoples" and further states that, "the health of all peoples is fundamental to the attainment of peace and security" (Aldis, 2008). From these statements, issues of global health are essential components to a nation's overall national security just as are issues of military security.

The outbreaks of infectious diseases can have widespread effects on nations outside of the obvious clear and present dangers that normally result. In addition to the threat of illness experienced by the population, which can have varying degrees of severity, a nation's economic, social, and political pillars, also referred to as a nation's foundations of power, can experience negative impacts. Look at the current experience of nations around the world regarding the novel Corona virus (COVID-19) impact. These impacts include, but are not limited to, civil unrest, decline in the prosperity of businesses, a decrease in economic trade, and even second-hand impacts in nations where the disease is not yet present. Diseases do not discriminate, and due to the increasing interconnectivity of nations across the globe, they can spread rapidly.

The Centers for Disease Control (CDC) estimates that more than 70% of the world remains unprepared to manage an outbreak and there is increasing literature that has determined that disease outbreaks are becoming more and more common as time progresses. The CDC and the National Institute for Occupational Safety and Health (NIOSH) estimate that in the past few decades, the world has seen approximately four times increase in the amount of emerging infectious diseases. Due to the adaptability of diseases through mutations and the global effects that can result, it is imperative that nations recognize the importance of global health security. If outbreaks of infectious diseases are left unchecked, not only will the origin nation experience negative impacts to their foundations of power but, these drastic ramifications will have global consequences. In this article, three infectious diseases are discussed in the terms of their origin, symptoms, and the impact they had on the nations infected: the 2015 Zika virus epidemic, the

spread of HIV, and the 2003 Severe Acute Respiratory Syndrome (SARS) pandemic. The importance of the inclusion of global health security as an aspect of national security is showcased. Also, this article provides recommendations and potential solutions for the future prevention of the severe ramifications that follow the outbreak of infectious diseases.

## II. The Origins and Symptoms of Zika Virus

While Zika virus was first discovered in Uganda's Zika Forest in 1947, it did not become a matter of international attention until the occurrence of a large outbreak in March of 2015 (World Health Organization, 2018). Brazil became the epicenter of a pandemic that swept across South and Central America, reaching even the southern portion of the United States. This disease caused not only economic woes, but long-lasting societal damage. Dealing with the fallout of Zika and preventing another outbreak became a major concern for the countries affected, especially Brazil.

Zika virus is primarily spread to humans via the bite of an infected mosquito of the *Aedes*genus. While all *Aedes* mosquitoes are potential vectors, the *Aedesaegypti*, which is also known to transmit other diseases like dengue and yellow fever, is the most common source. Humans may transmit the disease to one another through sexual intercourse and organ transplants. In addition, non-infected mosquitoes may bite infected humans, becoming new vectors for the pandemic. The final source of Zika transmission is the most worrying form. Pregnant mothers may transmit Zika to their unborn fetuses, resulting in birth complications (Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, 2019).

The disease caused by Zika virus is usually harmless to adults, although rare complications have occurred. Most people who are infected will display no symptoms at all. Those who do develop Zika symptoms may experience "fever, rash, conjunctivitis, muscle and joint pain, malaise or headache" (World Health Organization, 2018). These symptoms usually last between two and seven days. Rarely, adults may develop Guillain-Barre syndrome, which can cause paralysis (World Health Organization, 2018). The most common threat posed by Zika is to pregnant women and their unborn children. Pregnant women infected with Zika may experience "fetal loss, still birth, and preterm birth" (Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, 2019).

One of Zika's most infamous birth complications is microcephaly, a disease causing a malformation of the brain and skull of an unborn fetus. Babies who survive being born with microcephaly face life-long challenges such as seizures, trouble with basic motor skills, and intellectual disabilities. While some cases of microcephaly are considered mild and those affected may live fairly normal lives, "many, if not most cases of Zika microcephaly will be very severe, possibly requiring lifelong intensive care" (National Institute of Neurological Disorders and Stroke, 2019). A treatment for microcephaly does not exist; an affected child cannot have their brain or skull restored. All that doctors can do is provide movement and speech therapy in order to help affected children reduce dysfunction. Measures taken to reduce the occurrence of microcephaly must be performed before birth. Unfortunately, Zika, a cause of severe microcephaly, has no vaccine yet. Pregnant women who wish to protect their unborn children

must avoid Zika entirely to be safe (National Institute of Neurological Disorders and Stroke, 2019).

## III. The Impact and Response to Zika Virus

Responses to the tragedy of Zika were mixed. Following Brazil's outbreak of Zika and its subsequent spread to nearby countries, health officials in El Salvador, Guatemala, Jamaica, and Columbia advised their female populations to avoid becoming pregnant for the immediate future (Mansharamani, 2016). 150 doctors authored an open letter to the World Health Organization urging them to postpone or delay the 2016 Summer Olympic Games in Rio de Janeiro, Brazil (CBS News, 2016). The games went on as scheduled, although some athletes refused to attend out of fears of catching the disease. Brazil had to slash funding for the games by five hundred million in response to the crisis, and failed to sell all of its tickets, coming in at eighty-two percent (Grohmann, 2016).

Zika is not native to Brazil or even the Americas as a whole. It is typically found in parts of Africa, Asia, and Polynesia. Zika is believed to have entered Brazil in 2014. The DNA of the Zika strain that ravaged South and Central America is known to share similarities to a strain discovered in French Polynesia. In 2014, Brazil played host to the World Cup for soccer, as well as the Va'a World Sprint Championship, a canoe race. The canoe championship is known to have included competitors from French Polynesia. It has thus been deduced that one or more people at one of these events was infected with Zika virus. This person, or potentially multiple persons, was subsequently bitten by a local mosquito, who began transmitting the disease to other humans and mosquitoes. Given how some people infected with Zika remain asymptomatic, Patient or Patients Zero may have had no idea that they posed a health risk to other people (Murthy, 2016). An innocent trip may have been the cause of an international catastrophe.

Zika found an area perfectly suited to rapid expansion. With Zika once being confined to the continents known as the "Old World," residents of South America lacked any immunity. In addition, Zika's primary infection vector, the *Aedesaegypti*mosquito, inhabited a broad stretch of territory in the Americas. Since insects have no regard for states, laws, and borders, the spread of such a disease across national boundaries was inevitable. Brazil itself, the epicenter of the tragedy, bore social conditions that greatly enhanced Zika spread. Brazil's public health systems were ill-equipped to deal with the virus. Brazil's hospitals have faced a funding crisis for some time. In December of 2015, some hospitals simply had to shut their doors and turn people away. Critical shortages existed and still exist in saline, sutures, respirators, and space to put patients in (Bowater, 2016). Such an overworked and underfunded system had no chance at stemming the tide of a new pandemic.

Brazil lost the battle against the Zika virus outside the hospitals as well. Brazil ranks 112th in the world in sanitation, according to the World Bank. Some 22 municipalities around Rio de Janeiro completely lack any form of sewer waste collection. The country's urban centers post a fifty-five percent sewage collection rate (Machado, 2015). The waste that is left uncollected is a health risk in the best of times. In 2015, it served as a potent multiplier to the Zika threat, providing breeding grounds for legions upon legions of mosquitoes.

## **IV.** Preventing Zika in the Future

What can be done to combat infectious diseases that are similar to Zika in the future? What tools does that nation state have at its disposal to fight an opponent like Zika? As neither a vaccine nor a cure have yet to be developed for Zika, prevention of outbreaks is the only solution. As the common Aedesaegypti mosquito is the primary vector for Zika, it must be the primary target of any anti-Zika campaign. States in tropical areas that are home to mosquito populations should express the importance of mosquito safety to their citizens. The Centers for Disease Control recommend reducing exposed skin with protective clothing. Long shirts, pants, hats, and closed shoes can provide a measure of safety from mosquito bites. Insect repellants can also help, though users should remember to keep track of how long sprays remain effective and reapply accordingly. Mosquito nets can be applied to beds and other sleeping areas. Windows and doors can be screened to keep mosquitoes out. Sources of standing water should be eliminated, where possible. Safe sex practices should be used in order to avoid person-to-person transmission. The most effective solution to protecting one from Zika, however, is simply to avoid entering areas where Zika is prominent. Citizens should be encouraged to avoid Zika hotspots, as they may contract the virus and spread it further afield. Pregnant women, who bear the highest risk, should especially consider staying home.

Brazil's 2015 response to Zika should serve as a case study for what not to do. An underfunded health sector was unable to provide education or assistance to the large masses of urban poor. Most of those living well-below the poverty line in Brazil neither knew how to protect themselves nor had the resources to do so. Poor sanitation infrastructure, and, in some areas, an utter lack of infrastructure, provided ample pools of standing water, prime breeding grounds for mosquitoes. Despite calls from doctors to cancel or postpone the Olympic Games in Rio in 2016, they went ahead as planned, potentially exposing the thousands of attendees to undue risk and further risking the health of the athlete's and tourist's home countries.

A better response to Zika combines proactive education, sanitation, and risk mitigation. The nation state has at its disposal the tools needed to accomplish these tasks. Better funded health systems can inform the public of the dangers of Zika. Citizens should be properly informed about mosquito safety and sexual safety. Mosquito netting and repellant can be distributed to at-risk communities. Infrastructure expansion and maintenance, though expensive, can directly save lives. Temporary travel bans to Zika hotspots can reduce transmission from person to person. The good news about many of these solutions is that they have secondary benefits. Proper mosquito safety protects not only from Zika, but other mosquito-borne illnesses, like West Nile. Safe sexual practices protect from a variety of diseases besides Zika, such as HIV/AIDS.

## V. HIV/AIDS Discovery and Origins

HIV/AIDS, for decades, has been one of the most well-known and devastating diseases to impact the world. While HIV was officially discovered in 1983 by an international team of scientists, there have been sample strains and occurrences pre-dating 1983. The earliest known sample of the virus was discovered in a 1959 sample from a man in the Democratic Republic of the Congo and HIV is believed to have been within the US since the mid-1970s. As with most

infectious diseases, it originated in an animal species that was then transmitted to humans. In the case of HIV, it originated in chimpanzees that had Simian Immunodeficiency Disease (SIV). SIV then mutated into HIV and was transmitted to humans when they ate the contaminated meat of the chimpanzees (The AIDS Institute, 2011). Even though the source of this disease had been determined, the timeline on when it came into being is still disputed and, to this day, there are no cures or vaccines to combat the disease.

## VI. What is HIV/AIDS? Who does it affect and How?

Human Immunodeficiency Virus (HIV) is a lentivirus and a Sexually Transmitted Infection (STI). In 2018, a report released by the CDC estimated that 38 million people were infected with HIV (Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, 2019). HIV spreads through a variety of ways but, it is mainly transmitted through sexual intercourse. According to the CDC that receptive anal sex puts individuals at the highest risk to transmit the infection, with vaginal sex being the second highest risk, and oral sex putting individuals in the lowest risk category to transmit the disease (Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, 2019). Other ways that HIV can spread are not as common but still just as dangerous and have adverse effects on national security. These alternative methods are childbirth, with the transmittance from mother to child, shared needle usage as the disease can survive on a needle up to 48 days, and bodily fluid exchange. This does not have to be through sexual means as transmittance can occur through blood exchange with cuts and open wounds.

HIV harms the body by primarily attacking the body's immune system. It makes it harder for the body to combat diseases thus making the majority of other illnesses possibly lifethreatening. In this capacity, there are multiple stages that HIV goes through. The first phase, known as Acute HIV, typically begins two to four weeks after the infection enters the body. During Acute HIV, individuals could experience no sign of symptoms or they could suffer from fever, headaches, muscle aches, rash, swollen lymph glands, diarrhea, weight loss, night sweats, and cough (Mayo Clinic, 2020). In the second phase, Chronic HIV, the disease is still present in the body but the individual usually does not experience symptoms and this phase can last for years. However, without the proper treatment, Chronic HIV will advance into more serious phases. Once the disease becomes symptomatic, the virus will continue to grow and multiply in one's body, destroying the immune system, and will result in a multitude of symptoms. After HIV has destroyed a plentitude of CD4 T cells, a type of white blood cells, the immune system will have been severely damaged in which case HIV will evolve into Acquired Immune Deficiency System (AIDS) (Mayo Clinic, 2020). At this point, the body is susceptible to many illnesses including various forms of cancer.

## VII. The Impact of HIV/AIDS & the Threat to National Security

HIV/AIDS has been a main focal point for people arguing to make global health security a major part of both national and international security. According to the CDC's "*The Global HIV/AIDS Pandemic*", in 2006, an estimated 10% of South Africa was infected with HIV. Two years prior, in 2004, Richard Feachum, the Executive Director of the Global Fund to Fight AIDS, Tuberculosis, and Malaria, was stressing the importance of heightening security concerning infectious diseases to political leaders around the world. There have been numerous United Nations council meetings on HIV/AIDS alone (Feldbaum, 2006). Harley Feldbaum, who is the current Head of Policy and Strategy of the Global Fund to Fight

AIDS, Tuberculosis, and Malaria, published a 2006 article that outlined the many dangers HIV/AIDS could pose to traditional matters of national security.

In his article, Feldbaum suggests that HIV/AIDS will have adverse effects on national security by affecting "strategically important populations." The first of these is soldiers as Feldbaum states that HIV could inhibit a soldier's ability to serve and theorizes that there exists the potential for states to attempt to weaponize HIV. The second group, Feldbaum identifies are peacekeepers who, in 2000, were contributing to the spread of HIV rather than preventing further conflict as a result of the disease (Feldbaum, 2006). By affecting these populations, Feldbaum believes that HIV should be considered a threat to national security through how its potential effects on a nation's military, and international interests, both of which are typically included in the various definitions of national security. However, as with the majority of diseases, their effects on a nation are not limited to its spread or its infection of the population. There exists a domino effect. This domino effect that makes every infectious disease a matter of national security. Widespread diseases can cause panic amongst the public, public unrest, and can cause harm to the economy.

HIV/AIDS remains under control within the United States as most infected individuals can receive treatment and rarely experience the consequences of full blown AIDS. Yet, other major nations such as India, Russia, and China are still in the process of controlling their HIV situations with the majority of their attempts resulting in failure. Even though the United States does not experience the same level of discomfort concerning HIV as other nations do, HIV should not be disqualified as an issue of national security. For example, what happens when some of the major Third-World countries, from which the United States imports raw materials, see a major outbreak? The outbreak in question does not have to be a result of HIV; it could be from any disease of the past or from a disease that has yet to appear. What happens when our economy begins to suffer because our business partners are suffering from a pandemic? The National Public Radio (NPR) reports that the average cost of HIV medication can cost anywhere from \$2000-\$5000 per month, which is devastating for the majority of families. Outbreaks, and a variety of other situations, can significantly harm the economy thus further affecting an individual's ability to attain the necessary medication. With HIV, this could directly lead to an increase in AIDS. While theoretical in discussion, this situation should raise concern about what nations should be doing to prepare for diseases that are easily transmitted.

## VIII. SARS Outbreak of 2003

In mid-November of 2002, a case of atypical pneumonia was reported in the Guangdong Province of southern China. Health authorities and the Ministry of Health in Beijing were aware of this outbreak and proceeded to investigate until late January of 2003. However, these reports were kept in secrecy and were not reported to the World Health Organization (WHO). Rather, the WHO became aware of a potential influenza outbreak in Guangdong Province but pegged the report as "noise" due to a lack of correlation to any unusual respiratory disease. Despite the efforts of the Chinese Government, the WHO office in Beijing was made known of this deadly outbreak through an email from the son of a former WHO employee: "Am wondering if you have information on the strange contagious disease . . . which has already left more than 100 people dead. The outbreak is not allowed to be made known to the public . . . but people are already aware . . . and there is a "panic" attitude" (Fidler, 2004). The WHO approached the Chinese government in February of 2003 which, in return, released its first official report to the WHO citing an "outbreak of acute respiratory syndrome with 300 cases and five deaths in Guangdong Province" but later stating in a press conference that the situation was under control (Fiddler, 2004).

Around this same time, Dr. Liu Jianlun, a professor of nephrology at Zhongshan University in Guangzhou, Guangdong Province, was in Hong Kong for a family wedding. On February 22nd, 2004 he was admitted to the Prince of Wales Hospital where he later died of what was diagnosed as severe, atypical pneumonia. However, previous to his admittance to the hospital, Dr. Liu spent one night in the Metropole Hotel in Hong Kong where it is believed he came in contact with, and infected, 16 other individuals (Fiddler, 2004). Thus, in Hong Kong, China in March of 2003, the first recorded outbreak of Severe Acute Respiratory Syndrome (SARS) occurred in the Prince of Wales Hospital (Chan et. al., 2004).

## IX. Symptoms of SARS and How SARS Spreads

Severe Acute Respiratory Syndrome (SARS) is a viral respiratory illness with influenzalike symptoms. SARS normally begins with a high fever and individuals may experience headaches, body aches, and even mild respiratory symptoms. Most patients who have contracted SARS will develop pneumonia. It has been determined that SARS spreads as a result of close person-to-person contact. It is thought to be most readily transmitted by 'droplet spread' that is produced whenever an individual coughs or sneezes. These droplets can spread up to three feet and have the potential to infect others when landing on another person or when landing on a surface which a person comes into contact with. During the SARS Outbreak of 2003, the illness spread to over two dozen countries in Asia, Europe, North America, and South America with 8,098 people contracting the illness and 774 of those individuals succumbing to their symptoms (Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, 2004).

## X. The Impact of SARS

The SARS Outbreak of 2003 had a significant impact on the economic, social, and political statuses of the affected countries. Due to the pandemic's rapid spread and its veil of uncertainty, the consequences of SARS stretched past the impact on individual lives and notably affected the long-term status of countries within the Asian region. The death toll of SARS was insignificant in comparison to other disease outbreaks such as HIV/AIDS. Rather, there were numerous unknown factors about SARS, such as transmission, the level of contagiousness, the proper precautions, and lack of cure, which led to an intense environment of fear and panic (Caballero-Anthony, 2005). Without clear evidence or solutions, various governments put into place extreme precautions such as an overall limit on contact through various quarantine areas and a limit on mobility through travel advisories and restrictions.

The Chinese Government was not upfront about the initial outbreak of SARS. They severely downplayed the initial outbreaks as an atypical respiratory illnesses and atypical pneumonia. Thus, the opinion of and overall credibility of China was damaged. Due to subsequent pressures from other countries and the WHO, the Chinese Government imposed a variety of drastic and strict protocols in an attempt to limit the mobility of people. The Chinese Government issued several travel advisories and installed thermal imagers into airports and various points of entry to screen individuals for illness. Some areas took travel advisories a step further; for example, Bangkok and Kuala Lumpur required any individual arriving from a SARS impacted area to go into quarantine for seven to ten days (Caballero-Anthony, 2005). Policy decisions, such as these placed into fruition by the various governments, led to an intense economic impact which would affect the high-outbreak countries long-term.

Focusing on economic impact, the WHO estimated the total cost of SARS for Asia to be \$30 billion (Caballero-Anthony, 2005). Within the approximation of this number was the numerous retail store and manufacturing closures, the overall lack in consumer confidence, and the steep decline in both the travel and tourism industries. China, Hong Kong, Singapore, and Vietnam saw a drastic decline in tourism due to various travel advisories that were declared as a result of SARS. Focusing on Hong Kong as an example, an area that documented the second highest number of cases worldwide, researchers began to see an obvious domino effect as a result of inbound tourism dropping 70-80% (Caballero-Anthony, 2005). This decline impacted airlines as passenger traffic dropped 75% in Hong Kong (Caballero-Anthony, 2005). With the drop in the amount of people entering Hong Kong, the hotel industry saw a decrease in occupancy rates and the retail industry saw a dramatic drop in sales (Caballero-Anthony, 2005). Overall, the cost of SARS alone for Hong Kong totaled to approximately US\$1.7 billion as the gross domestic product was reduced 0.5% to 1% (Caballero-Anthony, 2005).

## XI. A National Security Concern?

The SARS, HIV/AID, and Zika showcase the threats caused by infectious diseases are not limited to the health and well-being of individuals. Infectious diseases can severely impact social order, government confidence, and economic interests. By impacting each of these areas, SARS affected the "foundations of power" (Caballero-Anthony, 2005). The pandemic undermined the social, political, and economic capacities of each of the regions. In particular, China's failure to take action and recognize the threat that SARS posed on their nation and others put their interests at risk. As each of the impacted nations endured threats to their foundations of power, they began to appear unstable to other nations in the world and untrustworthy to their populations (Caballero-Anthony, 2005). At the center of this predicament is the debate of whether to expand the definition of national security to include infectious diseases. There exists pressure to do so in order to protect the populations of impacted nations. According to the Copenhagen School's guidelines on the securitization process, there are three phases with the first being of primary importance. These phases are as follows:

- 1. The creation of an existential threat before a referent object;
- 2. The commencement of special/emergency/extraordinary actions in an attempt to secure and protect the referent object against the existential threat; and

3. The receiving of the speech act by one or more audiences (Romaniuk, 2018, pg. 2).

When applying the first phase to the securitization process of infectious diseases, diseases take on the role of the existential threat while nations and their populations are the referent objects. By securitizing infectious diseases, resources can then be allocated to the population in order to protect them from the potential threats. In general, securitization provides the population with protection from their governments if they choose to ignore the threats posed by the outbreak. Multiple countries, such as the United States, have implemented programs and initiatives to further progress the securitization process and spread the necessity of these programs to countries across the globe.

## XII. Preventing Outbreaks in the Future

According to the CDC, 70% of the world is unprepared to respond to a public health emergency and is unable to properly protect their countries and populations. The first step in the securitization process is acknowledging the threats at hand. In regard to health security, the majority of countries have acknowledged that infectious diseases pose significant threats to their population and their various foundations of power. In recent years, the United States has become a major force in assisting countries with becoming prepared for potential disease outbreaks. Through the Global Health Security Agenda (GHSA) and the Division of Global Health Protection (DGHP), the CDC partners with numerous US Government agencies, Ministries of Health, and other international organizations to accomplish key global health security goals to better prepare the world for future disease outbreaks (Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, 2019). These goals include, but it is not limited to, the following actions:

- (1) Establishing routine surveillance for priority diseases and developing information technology tools and systems...;
- (2) Ensuring countries have the knowledge and resources they need, including emergency operations centers that can mount a fast, coordinated response when outbreaks happen;
- (3) [Establishing] safe laboratory systems and diagnostics...; and
- (4) training frontline responders, laboratorians, disease detectives, emergency managers, and other health professionals who are responsible for taking the lead when crisis strikes (Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, 2019).

Currently, GHSA and DGHP, alongside various other CDC global health security programs, are working in 31 countries to assess the global health vulnerabilities in these countries and, consequently, develop plans of action to address those issues (Centers for Disease Control and Prevention). It is through this continuous investment in global health security programs that will prevent further disease outbreaks from occurring or, at the very least, lessen the resulting devastation to the economies, political structures, societies, and general population of the impacted countries. Diseases cannot be prevented but, in a world of increasing globalization, "an outbreak in one country is just a plane ride away from almost any other country" making the collaboration between countries a necessity in the protection of the world's health (Frieden,

### 2015).

Programs and initiatives such as GHSA and DGHP are further expanding as countries are implementing their own strategies to address global health security and contribute to the prevention of infectious diseases. In 2019, President Trump's administration released a new Global Health Security Strategy which outlines, "the United States Government's approach to strengthen global health security, including accelerating the capabilities of targeted countries to prevent, detect, and respond to infectious disease outbreaks" (White House, 2019). This strategy shows the commitment of the United States to collaborate with countries and international organizations to "[detect] and [contain] bio-threats at their source and [improve] emergency response" to these threats (White House, 2019). Thus, through collaboration in the form of international strategic initiatives, capable countries can further spread awareness of the importance of global health security and prepare struggling countries for potential outbreaks in the future.

## XIII. Conclusion

Global health security is one of the most important issues facing our world today. Within the past couple of decades, the world has become exposed to numerous deadly viruses such as Zika, HIV, and SARS. In addition to the obvious threat these diseases pose to the health of a nation's population, that threat is one of many in the resulting domino effect that diseases cause. Threats which harm a nation's population consequently impact a nation's social order, government confidence, and economic interests. In order to protect nations from these devastating diseases, they must be recognized as national security concerns. The acceptance and progression of global health security as an aspect of national, and international, security is crucial for the preparation of the next major outbreak. Unfortunately, the time and location of the next devastating disease outbreak are unknown which further cements the importance of the preparation of countries across the globe.

According to the CDC, 70% of the world is unprepared to defend its population and sovereignty against a major disease outbreak. Currently, as the world is experience increasing globalization efforts, countries are more interconnected than ever before. As a consequence of this, diseases will not solely impact one country. Diseases do not acknowledge borders or political differences. They wreak havoc on any vulnerable population. Thus, collaborative efforts in the form of global health security programs, initiatives, and strategies alike, are crucial in battling potential outbreaks. Programs and initiatives such as GHSA and DGHP showcase the positive impact that collaborations can have on spreading awareness of global health security as the CDC, various US government agencies, and internal organizations have worked to prepare 31 countries across the globe for issues of public health.

The next disease or global pandemic can originate in any area and can occur at any time. History shows that, in order for nations to avoid threats to their foundations of power and populations, countries need to prepare to defend themselves against the next potential outbreak. Due to an increase in globalization, the consequences of an infectious disease that is ignored or mishandled can lead to global chaos and devastation. If more countries continue to disregard global health security and refuse to accept it as a category of national security, these world leaders should expect the next disease outbreak to be catastrophic.

## Works Cited:

- Aguirre, Jessica Camille. (2012, July). Cost Of Treatment Still A Challenge For HIV Patients In U.S. NPR, <u>www.npr.org/sections/health-shots/2012/07/27/157499134/cost-of-treatmentstill-a-challenge-for-hiv-patients-in-u-s</u>.
- Aldis, W. (2008, June). Health security as a public health concept: a critical analysis. *Health Policy and Planning*. 23(6), 369–375. <u>https://doi.org/10.1093/heapol/czn030</u>
- Bowater, Donna. (2005, Feb.). *Brazil's 'Broken' Healthcare System*. Brazil | Al Jazeera, <u>www.aljazeera.com/indepth/features/2016/02/brazil-broken-healthcare-</u> <u>system160204075525812.html</u>.
- Caballero-Anthony, Mely. (2005). SARS in Asia: Crisis, Vulnerabilities, and Regional Responses. *Asian Survey*, 45(3), 475-495. <u>https://as.ucpress.edu/content/45/3/475</u>
- CBS News. (2016, Aug.). *Health Experts: Move Rio Olympics Due to Zika Outbreak*." CBS Interactive. <u>www.cbsnews.com/news/health-experts-urge-who-to-move-postpone-rioolympics-zika-virus/</u>
- CBS News. (2016, Aug.). Zika Virus Adding to Long List of Brazil Olympics Woes. CBS Interactive. <u>www.cbsnews.com/news/zika-virus-adding-to-long-list-of-brazil-olympicswoes/</u>.
- Centers for Disease Control and Prevention. (2019). *About Zika*. Zika Virus. <u>www.cdc.gov/zika/</u> <u>about/index.html</u>
- Centers for Disease Control and Prevention. (2004). *Fact Sheet: Basic Information about SARS*. Severe Acute Respiratory Syndrome (SARS). <u>https://www.cdc.gov/sars/about/fssars.html</u>
- Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, (2020). *Facts about Microcephaly*. Birth Defects. <u>www.cdc.gov/ncbddd/birthdefects/microcephaly.html</u>
- Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, (2019). *Global Health Security*. Global Health Protection and Security. https://www.cdc.gov/globalhealth/healthprotection/ghs/index.html
- Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, (2019). *HIV Transmission*. HIV. <u>https://www.cdc.gov/hiv/basics/transmission.html</u>
- Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, (2006). *The Global HIV/AIDS Pandemic*. Morbidity and Mortality Weekly Report.<u>https://www.cdc.gov/mmwr/preview/mmwrhtml/mm5531a1.htm</u>
- Chan, P. K., To, W. K., Ng, K. C., Lam, R. K., Ng, T. K., Chan, R. C., Wu, A., Yu, W. C., Lee, N., Hui, D. S., Lai, S. T., Hon, E. K., Li, C. K., Sung, J. J., & Tam, J. S. (2004).

Laboratory diagnosis of SARS. *Emerging infectious diseases*, 10(5), 825–831. https://doi.org/10.3201/eid1005.030682

- Feachem R. (2004, Jan.). HIV/AIDS pandemic and its implications for global health policymakers. *Health and Foreign Policy Seminar, Foreign and Commonwealth Office*. http://www.ukglobalhealth.org/Default.aspx?textID=587&cSectionID=2
- Feldbaum, H., Lee, K., & Patel, P. (2006). The national security implications of HIV/AIDS. *PLoS medicine*, 3(6), e171. doi:10.1371/journal.pmed.0030171
- Fidler, D.P. (2004). Brief History of the Global SARS Outbreak of 2002–03. SARS, Governance and the Globalization of Disease, 71-105. <u>https://doi.org/10.1057/9780230006263\_5</u>
- Frieden, T. (2015, Oct.). Dr. Tom Frieden: Protecting the World from the Next Pandemic. GE Reports. https://www.ge.com/reports/dr-tom-frieden-protecting-the-world-fromthe-next-pandemic/
- Grohmann, Karolos. (2016, Aug.). *Rio Games Far from Sold out, Ticket Sales at 82 Percent*. Reuters. <u>www.reuters.com/article/us-olympics-rio-tickets-idUSKCN10I0UY</u>.
- Holmes, K. (2014, Oct.). *What is National Security?* The Heritage Foundation. <u>https://www.heritage.org/military-strength-topical-essays/2015-essays/what-nationalsecurity</u>
- Machado, Arthur Pinheiro. (2015, Jan.). *The Next Battle for Brazil: Public Sanitation*. Forbes Magazine. <u>www.forbes.com/sites/arthurmachado/2015/01/05/the-next-battle-for-</u> <u>brazilpublic-sanitation/#4fd4fbc16861</u>
- Mansharamani, Vikram. (2016, Jan.). Zika Virus Is Not Only a Health Threat, but an Economic One Too. Public Broadcasting Service. <u>www.pbs.org/newshour/economy/zika-virus-</u> isnot-only-a-health-threat-but-an-economic-one-too
- Mayo Clinic, (2020, Feb.). *HIV/AIDS*. <u>www.mayoclinic.org/diseases-conditions/hiv-aids/symptoms-causes/syc-20373524</u>.
- Murthy, Bhavini. (2016, Jan.). Origin of Zika Virus Outbreak in Brazil May Be Linked to Major Sporting Events. ABC News Network. abcnews.go.com/Health/zika-virus-outbreakbrazillinked-major-sporting-events/story?id=36575321
- National Institute of Neurological Disorders and Stroke. (2019, Mar.). *Microcephaly Information Page*.<u>www.ninds.nih.gov/Disorders/All-Disorders/Microcephaly-Information-Page</u>.
- Romaniuk, S. (2018). Copenhagen school. In B. Arrigo (Ed.), *The SAGE encyclopedia of surveillance, security, and privacy*, 224-224. doi: 10.4135/9781483359922.n95

The AIDS Institute. Where did HIV come from? The AIDS Institute.

www.theaidsinstitute.org/node/259.

- White House. (2019). United States Government Global Health Security Strategy. https://www.whitehouse.gov/wp-content/uploads/2019/05/GHSS.pdf
- World Health Organization. (2018, July). Zika Virus. World Health Organization. <u>www.who.int/</u><u>news-room/fact-sheets/detail/zika-virus</u>

# The Impact of Mindfulness Breaks and Physical Activity Breaks on Student Effectiveness

## Jaskiran Dhaliwal Joseph Hunter Western Washington University

#### Introduction

Students sit through many hours of classes, during which they are expected to stay on task, get all their work done, be cooperative, and maintain their mental and physical health. Many students find these expectations difficult. Throughout the day students become energetic and unable to focus cognitively and/or emotionally on class expectations. In many parts of North America, across all school settings, mental health and obesity are challenging educators; these complicate classroom attentional issues, and teachers notice that self-care is often pushed to the side when these factors are in play. Although mental and physical health self-care is important and encouraged, it is not well-practiced by many high school students, and teachers spend little time addressing it in the classroom. Students are always told to take care of themselves, but it is difficult for them to follow through with this advice without modeling and guidance.

The Public Health Agency of Canada's (2017) Chief Innovation Officer stated that "[in the past years], cigarettes were the clear enemy of workplace health, [but now] the humble office chair has become the new workplace villain" (paragraph 6). To combat this, the Public Health Agency of Canada is implementing the Sit Kicker program which is aimed at helping employees be more physically active, especially if they work in a seated environment all day. If the Public Health Agency of Canada is concerned for adults, then educators should be proactively concerned for children and young adults as well. Lifelong habits start young, so students should be educated through experiences that model and reinforce mental and physical self-care. If students can be taught and encouraged self-care while they are young, they may do so more effectively as adults.

## Purpose

The purpose of this study is to investigate student perceptions on the effectiveness of mindfulness breaks and physical activity breaks when these are incorporated into classroom activities. In this present study "student effectiveness" is defined as the student's ability to focus and engage in classroom learning activities. It includes the student's ability to stay on task. This present research assumes that by addressing factors such as clarity of mind and anxiety, students will be able to stay productive and on task. We seek to answer the following question: How do mindfulness breaks and physical activity breaks increase student effectiveness?

#### Context

This study was conducted in a Canadian high school, focusing on three sections of grade nine science. The school has just over 750 students, with 74% of the student body identifying as Indo-Canadian. The rest of the population is Caucasian, Hispanic, or of other ethnicities. Approximately 10% of students in the school qualify for special education services, while 15% of students are English Language Learners, and 10% are on Individualized Education Plans. Twenty-five percent of the students come from immigrant families and there is a total of 37 teachers, two counsellors, and three administrators.

#### **Review of the Literature**

#### Impact of Physical Activity on the Brain

Physical activity has many positive impacts on the brain (Weng et al., 2017; van Dongen, Kersten, Wagner, Morris, & Fernandez, 2016). Weng et al. "tested the plasticity of functional brain networks in response to a single stimulus of aerobic exercise using resting-state functional connectivity analyses" (p. 171). In this study the researchers had a sample of healthy younger and older adults (ages  $\sim 23$  and  $\sim 66$ ) participate in a 30-minute session of moderate-intensity aerobic cycling. Weng et al. found that participants engaging in this moderate physical activity "selectively increased synchrony among brain regions associated with affect and reward processing, learning and memory, and in regions important for attention and executive control" (p. 171). The research also found that "context-learning is sensitive to acute exercise [where context] is conceptualized as a representation of a set of ongoing task rules or generalized schemas that govern how to respond to different environmental cues" (p. 186). Through active exercise, the hippocampus of the brain was found to be working with the medial prefrontal cortex to guide behaviour, leading to increased functional connectivity. If, as indicated by Weng et al., context-learning is sensitive to acute exercise, teachers should be able to use this reality in the classroom. Although functional connectivity will not be measured in the classroom in this present study, Weng et al.'s evidence suggests that students participating in physical activity through high intensity exercises and moderate activity as a part of a classroom instructional design, should experience an increase in functional connectivity, which would help them be more attentive.

Van Dongen et al. (2016) explain that having a good long-term memory depends on the integration of new memories after encoding, which requires neuromodulatory factors like dopamine, noradrenaline and brain-derived neurotrophic factor (BDNF). In other words, these neuromodulatory factors (or chemicals) work to enhance the connections between neurons, the pathways in the brain, which positively impacts long-term memory. If these factors aren't released around the time of encoding, memories decay rapidly. During van Dongen et al.'s study, three groups of participants encoded a set of picture-location associations. After doing so, one group exercised immediately, one group exercised four hours later, and the last group did not participate in any exercise. The study concluded that "appropriately timed physical exercise can improve long-term memory and highlight the potential of exercise as an intervention in educational and clinical settings" (p. 1723). Of importance to this present study, van Dongen et al.'s work demonstrates that providing information first and delaying the time of exercise can improve academic performance. **Impact of Physical Activity on Attention and Focus** 

Bartholomew et al. (2018), and Schmidt, Benzing, and Kamer (2016), had similar findings about physical activity linked to time on task (TOT) behaviour. Bartholomew et al. found that active learning is a combination of physical activity and academic material. During this study, students' attention (TOT) and physical activity were assessed in an active learning context. The participants were 2716 children from 28 elementary schools in Central Texas who were assigned to one of two groups: 1) active learning, or 2) traditional, sedentary academic lessons. Physical activity was measured with accelerometers. There was an increase in TOT behaviour when physical activity was incorporated into an active learning situation. In addition, the researchers also found that randomly increasing physical activity, as compared to focused physical activity related to the learning targets, reduced TOT for students in control schools.

Schmidt et al. (2016) examined 92 students between the ages of 11 and 12 years who were assigned to one of four experimental conditions. The first group participated in physical activity with high cognitive demands, the second group was sedentary with high cognitive demands, the third group participated in physical activity with low cognitive demands, and the fourth group was the control group which was sedentary with low cognitive demands. Attention and affect were measured before and immediately after a 10-minute intervention. The researchers found that physical exertion did not impact attentional performance, while cognitive engagement was the crucial factor that facilitated an increase in attention and processing speed.

#### Impact of Mindfulness on the Brain

Mindfulness has been shown to have positive impacts on the brain. Taren et al. (2017) worked with 35 adults with high levels of psychological distress. These participants took part in a three-day trial where they were involved in intensive mindfulness meditation or relaxation training. Resting state functional

magnetic resonance imaging (rsfMRI) scans were done before and after the intervention, assessing the impact of meditation on the functional connectivity between specific parts of the brain. The study revealed increased resting state functional connectivity in regions of the brain that impact attention, working memory, and cognitive control.

Kilpatrick et al. (2011) used functional connectivity MRI (fcMRI) to identify regions of the brain in a group of healthy women. The women participated in an eight-week Mindfulness-Based Stress Reduction (MBSR) training course or an eight-week waiting period after which the subjects rested with their eyes closed, and fcMRI data was acquired. The subjects participating in MBSR showed:

1) increased functional connectivity within auditory and visual networks, 2) increased functional connectivity between auditory cortex and areas associated with attentional and self-referential processes, 3) stronger anticorrelation between auditory and visual cortex, and 4) stronger anticorrelation between visual cortex and areas associated with attentional and self-referential processes. (p. 290)

The study demonstrated that an eight-week meditational protocol can produce consistent attentional focus, enhanced sensory processing, and reflective awareness of sensory experience.

## **Impact of Mindfulness on Attention and Focus**

Research by Miller, Borsatto, and Al-Salom (2019), and Black and Fernando (2014) revealed that mindfulness strategies can create synchronization between brain regions, thereby impacting attentional focus. Miller et al. collected data from 88 participants who were enrolled in two third-year psychology courses at a university in Ontario, Canada. Some students participated in a "Three-Minute Breathing Space" mindfulness intervention that took less than five minutes of class time each day, while other students functioned as the control group and did not receive the intervention. "By the end of the semester, the intervention group reported experiencing greater enhancements in positive emotionality, and fewer episodes of mind wandering and distractibility than those in the control group" (p. 839). Students also incorporated this mindful activity into their daily life, and it helped promote mental wellness.

Black and Fernando (2014) worked with 17 teachers that incorporated a five-week mindfulnessbased curriculum into their lessons during which they reported on classroom behaviours of 409 children. Post-intervention, teachers noticed improved classroom behaviour of their students, including paying attention, self-control, participation in activities, and caring/respect for others. These improvements lasted up to seven weeks post-intervention.

## Themes from the Literature

The literature indicates that various brain functions are influenced by both physical activity and mindfulness techniques. Likewise, the literature shows that there is improved attention and focus when either physical activity or mindfulness techniques are used as an intervention. Based on the literature review, this present study will seek to determine if the results of an action research project based in a Canadian high school are consistent with previous researchers' findings.

## Methodology

After obtaining informed consent, students were guided through various mindfulness breaks and physical activity breaks for a two-week period. Mindfulness break activities included participating in deep breathing exercises, following through with the "Be Kind to Yourself" (2015) podcast, spending time colouring, identifying the five senses, and listening to instrumental music. Physical activity breaks included a walk around a 400-metre track, dynamic stretches, beginner standing yoga poses, and high intensity interval training (HIIT) exercises. In a two-day structure, students participated in a five to 10-minute mindfulness break on day one, alternating with a five to 10-minute physical activity break on day two. After each activity, students completed a short survey on their perception of the effectiveness of the mindfulness breaks and physical activity breaks on their wellbeing and learning. These surveys were completed at the end of each lesson, so students were able to gauge the impact of the activity on perceived effectiveness. The survey questions provided to students after each activity were based on the "Adaptation of the 'Attitudes toward Physical Activity Scale (APAS)' for Higher Education Students in Turkey" (Dinc, Uzonoz, Mok, and Chin, 2019). Students responded to the questions using a four-point Likert scale: strongly disagree, disagree, agree, and strongly agree. The questions were:

Mindfulness Break:

- 1. I improve on my schoolwork after mindfulness breaks.
- 2. I feel better after mindfulness breaks.
- 3. I think better after mindfulness breaks.
- 4. I feel more confident after mindfulness breaks.
- 5. Participating in mindfulness breaks helps to reduce my anxiety.
- 6. Participating in mindfulness breaks helps to enhance my self-concept.
- 7. Participating in mindfulness breaks helps to improve my analytic skills.
- 8. Participating in mindfulness breaks helps to refresh my thinking.

Physical Activity Break:

- 1. I improve on my schoolwork after physical activity.
- 2. I feel better after physical activity.
- 3. I feel stronger after physical activity.
- 4. I think better after physical activity.
- 5. I feel more confident after physical activity.
- 6. Being physically active helps to reduce my anxiety.
- 7. Being physically active helps to enhance my self-concept.
- 8. Being physically active helps to improve my analytic skills.
- 9. Being physically active helps to give me more willpower. Being physically active helps to refresh my thinking.

A researcher's journal was used daily during this process to note students' time-on-task. Students' survey responses were compared to the researcher's journal to help in triangulation.

## Findings

In all cases of interventions, a strong majority of the students agreed they experienced positive results when either physical breaks or mindfulness activities were used in the classroom. However, the tables (Table 1 and Table 2 at end of the article) show that more students perceived mindfulness breaks as having a more positive impact than physical activity breaks.

Looking closely at the mindfulness survey results, the following highlights emerge:

- at least 80% of students perceived an improvement in schoolwork
- at least 81% of students perceived feeling better
- at least 77% of students perceived thinking better
- at least 68% of students perceived feeling more confident
- at least 79% of students perceived a reduction in anxiety
- at least 73% of students perceived an enhancement of self-concept
- at least 74% of students perceived an improvement in their analytic skills
- at least 86% of students perceived a refreshed mind.
- Students' physical activity surveys show the following trends:
- at least 65% of students perceived an improvement in schoolwork
- at least 70% of students perceived feeling better
- at least 68% of students perceived feeling stronger
- at least 69% of students perceived thinking better
- at least 58% of students perceived feeling more confident
- at least 64% of students perceived a reduction in anxiety
- at least 60% of students perceived an enhancement of self-concept
- at least 70% of students perceived an improvement in their analytic skills
- at least 62% of students perceived an increase in willpower
- at least 77% of students perceived a refreshed mind.

There were major discrepancies between survey results when comparing the various types of activities. When comparing mindfulness breaks, 77% of students reported **thinking better** after the "Be Kind to Yourself" (2015) podcast while at least 91% of students reported thinking better after listening to

instrumental music and colouring. In addition, 68% of students reported **feeling more confident** after the "Be Kind to Yourself" (2015) podcast, while 82% of students reported feeling more confident after listening to instrumental music. When comparing physical activity breaks, 65% of students reported an **improvement on schoolwork** after participating in HIIT exercises and in a combination of all the physical activity break exercises, while 93% of students reported an improvement after walking the track. Also, 71% of **students felt better** after HIIT exercises and yoga poses, while 92% of students felt better after walking the track. When analyzing reports of **thinking better**, 69% of students reported improvement with HIIT exercises while 75% of students reported improvement with yoga poses; however, 95% of students reported thinking better after walking the track. Approximately 58-60% of students felt more confident after walking the track. An approximate difference of 20% was also noted between yoga poses and walking the track, with walking the track being on the higher end, when it came to perceptions of a reduction in anxiety, enhancement of students' self-concept, improvement of analytic skills, and an increase in willpower.

Based on the researcher's observations in the classroom, students were calmer and more productive after incorporating instrumental music, deep breathing exercises, and more productive after walking the track and colouring. Students were more restless and off task after participating in yoga poses and the five senses activity. Student surveys reported similar results, with students improving on schoolwork and thinking better after listening to instrumental music, deep breathing exercise, colouring and walking the track. Students improved less on schoolwork after yoga poses and the five senses activity.

According to student surveys and based on classroom observations, listening to instrumental music, colouring and walking the track were the most impactful activities incorporated into the classroom lessons during this action research.

## Recommendations

Based on the researcher observations and survey analysis, listening to instrumental music, colouring, or going for a short walk should be incorporated into the classroom regularly. These breaks not only help calm the students, but they may increase academic performance.

Including at least five to 10-minute breaks and educating students on what these breaks look like throughout their school years will create habits for a lifetime. Many students in this study engaged in mindfulness breaks for the first time. One student also reported using deep breathing exercises at home. By incorporating breaks during lessons, students not only experience, but are educated on the importance of breaks for mental and physical health.

Future research should investigate **teacher perceptions** and assess their willingness to incorporate mindfulness breaks and physical activity breaks during lessons. Regardless of previous research findings, and this present study's findings, if teachers do not perceive the need for, or usefulness of these strategies, they won't be used in the classroom. The normative nature of the teaching profession has shown that status quo practices hold a powerful sway over day-to-day instructional behavior. By better understanding teacher views related to mindfulness and physical breaks, future leaders may be able to more effectively encourage the use of these techniques in the classroom.

Additionally, future research should determine if there is a correlation between the use of these techniques an actual academic performance. This present study sought to explore student and teacher perceptions. Whether there is actual academic improvement when using these strategies is an important question to pursue.

#### References

- Bartholomew, J. B., Golaszewski, N. M., Jowers, E., Korinek, E., Roberts, G., Fall, A., & Vaughn, S. (2018). Active learning improves on-task behaviors in 4th grade children. *Preventive Medicine*, 111, 49–54. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ypmed.2018.02.023
- Be Kind to Yourself—Right Now. (2015, October 5). Retrieved December 20, 2019, from Mindful website: https://www.mindful.org/be-kind-to-yourself-right-now/

- Black, D. S., & Fernando, R. (2014). Mindfulness training and classroom behavior among lower-income and ethnic minority elementary school children. *Journal of Child and Family Studies*, 23(7), 1242–1246. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10826-013-9784-4
- Dinc, S. C., Uzunoz, F. S., Ching Mok, M. M., & Chin, M.-K. (2019). Adaptation of the "Attitudes toward physical activity scale" for higher education students in Turkey. *Journal of Education and Learning*, 8(3), 95. <u>https://doi.org/10.5539/jel.v8n3p95</u>
- Kilpatrick, L. A., Suyenobu, B. Y., Smith, S. R., Bueller, J. A., Goodman, T., Creswell, J. D., ... Naliboff, B. D. (2011). Impact of mindfulness-based stress reduction training on intrinsic brain connectivity. *NeuroImage*, 56(1), 290–298. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.neuroimage.2011.02.034</u>
- Miller, C. J., Borsatto, J., & Al-Salom, P. (2019). Testing a quick mindfulness intervention in the university classroom. *Journal of Further and Higher Education*, 43(6), 839–847. https://doi.org/10.1080/0309877X.2017.1409345
- Popeska, B., Jovanova-Mitkovska, S., Chin, M.-K., Edginton, C. R., Mo Ching Mok, M., & Gontarev, S. (2018). Implementation of brain breaks® in the classroom and effects on attitudes toward physical activity in a Macedonian school setting. *International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health*, 15(6). <u>https://doi.org/10.3390/ijerph15061127</u>
- Public Health Agency of Canada (2017, March 16). Government of Canada invests in program to combat sedentary behaviour in the workplace [News releases]. Retrieved December 20, 2019, from Gcnws website: <u>https://www.canada.ca/en/public-</u>

health/news/2017/03/government of canadainvestsinprogramtocombatsedentarybehaviourin.html

- Schmidt, M., Benzing, V., & Kamer, M. (2016). Classroom-based physical activity breaks and children's attention: Cognitive engagement works! *Frontiers in Psychology*, 7. https://doi.org/10.3389/fpsyg.2016.01474
- Taren, A. A., Gianaros, P. J., Greco, C. M., Lindsay, E. K., Fairgrieve, A., Brown, K. W., ... Creswell, J. D. (2017). Mindfulness meditation training and executive control network resting state functional connectivity: A randomized controlled trial. *Psychosomatic Medicine*, 79(6), 674–683. https://doi.org/10.1097/PSY.000000000000466
- van Dongen, E. V., Kersten, I. H. P., Wagner, I. C., Morris, R. G. M., & Fernández, G. (2016). Physical exercise performed four hours after learning improves memory retention and increases hippocampal pattern similarity during retrieval. *Current Biology*, 26(13), 1722–1727. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cub.2016.04.071
- Weng, T. B., Pierce, G. L., Darling, W. G., Falk, D., Magnotta, V. A., & Voss, M. W. (2017). The acute effects of aerobic exercise on the functional connectivity of human brain networks. *Brain Plasticity (Amsterdam, Netherlands)*, 2(2), 171–190. <u>https://doi.org/10.3233/BPL-160039</u>

## Table 1

Mindfulness Breaks Survey Averages

Question	Strongly Agree (%)	Agree (%)	Disagree (%)	Strongly Disagree (%)		
1	27.5	59.9	9.0	3.6		
2	33.1	56.5	7.2	3.2		
3	28.2	59.5	10.4	2.0		
4	23.4	51.3	19.2	6.2		
5	29.4	54.8	10.5	5.3		
6	20.4	57.9	17.9	3.8		
7	24.0	57.2	15.6	3.3		
8	35.9	55.0	7.0	2.1		

Question	Strongly Agree	Agree	Disagree	Strongly		
	(%)	(%)	(%)	Disagree (%)		
1	23.5	52.2	20.4	3.9		
2	28.2	51.0	16.8	4.1		
3	21.5	51.4	22.8	4.4		
4	22.2	57.1	16.6	4.2		
5	22.7	43.9	25.2	8.3		
6	24.1	49.9	19.3	6.8		
7	20.6	50.1	22.2	7.2		
8	21.6	49.5	23.7	5.3		
9	21.4	51.8	22.4	4.5		
10	31.7	52.7	9.9	5.7		

Physical Activity Breaks Survey Averages

# The Impact of Professional Association Membership on Teacher Job Satisfaction

Hope R. Shields, Ed.D. Aarek Farmer, Ed.D. Mark Blackwelder, Ph.D. Andrea Moore, SLP D.

Freed-Hardeman University

### Abstract

The purpose of this study was to explore the impact that membership in a professional association has on the job satisfaction of teachers. Data from a sample of 218 teachers who were and were not members of professional associations were compared to determine if differences existed in the job satisfaction beliefs between the two groups of teachers. Data were collected using the Job Satisfaction Survey (JSS). Analyses revealed that teachers who were members of professional associations were more satisfied with their careers. These findings have implications for both school leaders as well as professional association leaders as they collaborate to find ways to increase the effectiveness of 21st century schools.

## Introduction

Professional associations such as the National Education Association work to maintain a plentiful, effective workforce of teachers (NEA, 2017). Research has shown that student achievement suffers when teachers are dissatisfied in their jobs (Asif et al., 2016). The aim of this study was to explore differences in the job satisfaction of teachers who were and were not a part of a professional organization. This data was investigated in order to provide professional associations with the insight needed to develop programs that more effectively address the needs of educators in order to keep them in the classroom and satisfied in their careers. This study was guided by the following research question: *Is* 

there a statistically significant difference in teacher job satisfaction between professional association members and non-members?

Research has shown that professional associations such as the National Education Association and American Federation of Teachers are vital allies for both teachers and students (AFT, 2018a; NEA, 2017b). Professional associations seek to advocate for teachers' political best interests by lobbying for legislation that improves the overall working environment (e.g., salary, tenure, evaluation systems, and professional support) and by campaigning for officials whose platforms promise improved environments for students (e.g., class sizes, adequate technology, and sufficient materials and resources). Furthermore, professional associations provide members with a variety of professional development opportunities. In fact, in some associations, teachers have the opportunity to lead professional development workshops for their colleagues (TEA, 2017). Additionally, professional associations offer members several financial benefits, legal services, and opportunities for recognition.

Many studies have suggested there are several teacher-related factors that tend to influence student achievement (Asif et al., 2016; Lauermann, 2013; Mojavezi & Tamiz, 2012; Ronfeldt et al., 2013). Low teacher job satisfaction has been show to have a negative impact on student performance. Teachers reporting higher job satisfaction were also found to be more motivated, and their students performed better when compared to students of teachers reporting lower job satisfaction (Salehi et al., 2016).

The vision of the National Education Association is "a great public school for every student" (NEA, 2017a). Although professional associations work diligently to achieve their set visions, there is no current research that has clearly linkedy the activities of professional associations to teacher job satisfaction. This study seeks to fill the gap in the literature that currently exists on the subject.

### **Literature Review**

Researchers have aimed multiple studies at job satisfaction for many years. Because satisfied employees typically have improved performance and decreased turnover, employers have long been concerned with how to keep their employees satisfied (Asif et al., 2016).

In respect to the job satisfaction of teachers, specifically, Markow, Macia, and Lee (2013) found that "teacher satisfaction has declined 23 percentage points since 2008, from 62% to 39% very satisfied, including five percentage points since last year, to the lowest level in 25 years" (p. 6). Moreover, Markowet al.'s research showed that in 2013, "51% of teachers report feeling under great stress several days a week, an increase of 15 percentage points over 36% of teachers reporting that level in 1985" (p. 6).

*Job satisfaction factors and limitations.* Job satisfaction is an abstract concept composed of an abundance of tangible and intangible factors. Accoring to Maslow's hierarchy of needs, these factors can be separated into two categories: lower order and higher order. Lower order job satisfaction factors include employment, salary, benefits, and job security. Higher order job satisfaction factors include social acceptance/relationships, sense of achievement, and recognition.

In a study of inner-city schoolteachers, Maforah (2015) found a significant relationship between job satisfaction and remuneration. The results of the study showed that 87% of participants were dissatisfied with their pay. One participant stated, "I love being a teacher with all my heart, but the salary I receive is so low and discouraging that I am having second thoughts about being an educator" (p. 5). Maforah's study also showed a direct correlation between educators' feelings of security and job satisfaction. Results, however, showed that 75% of the participants responded that they never or seldom feel secure in their jobs and, as a result, were dissatisfied with their jobs. This research found similar relationships between higher order factors and job satisfaction. Maforah's research established a relationship between job satisfaction and interpersonal relationships, self-esteem, and recognition.

Conversely, a study focused on job satisfaction with Arizona teachers found that teachers in one of the lowest paying states considered intrinsic motivators to be more important than extrinsic motivation when it came to their job as teachers (Mertler, 2016). Mertler (2016) took his findings further by stating that eachers not only in Arizona but across the country are motivated intrinsically by certain rewards that are combined with teaching, such as high student achievement, student gratitude, and the feeling of helping someone.

The workload and stress of the teaching profession and a teacher's ability to employ coping mechanisms also factor into job satisfaction significantly. Research has shown that teachers experiencing heavy workloads and high levels of on-the-job stress tend to have lower levels of job satisfaction (Türkogl, Cansoy, & Parlar, 2017). Furthermore, one study found that teachers' abilities to cope with the amount of stress they encounter on the job can decrease as the age of the teacher increases (Skaalvik & Skaalvik, 2015). Teachers in the youngest age group reported working late hours and being tired but able to recover over weekends and holidays. Teachers in the middle-aged group worked the same long hours as the younger teachers; however, they were not able to recover from exhaustion as readily and reported using sick leave to have short breaks from working. Teachers in the oldest age group experienced the most significant negative ffects of the heavy workload. These teachers did not work after regular school hours, took less time to prepare for teaching, and used more sick leave. As a result, many of the most experienced teachers reported being unable to meet their own expectations about their teaching, suffering from low self-esteem and reduced job satisfaction (Skaalvik & Skaalvik, 2015).

Just as research indicated job preparation could factor into a teacher's decision to remain in the profession, it also showed that preparation (or lack thereof) can affect levels of job satisfaction (Kaden, Patterson, Healy, & Adams, 2016; Zhang & Zeller, 2014). In one study, Kaden et al. (2016) found teacher satisfaction with student contact (e.g., discipline, attendance) to be less than 60%, which was linked to a lack of preparedness to work with a diverse student population. Additionally, Kaden et al. noted failure to integrate with the community by participating in events and cultural activities negatively impacted job satisfaction, especially for those teachers of a different background from most of the student population.

Job satisfaction and professional associations. Professional associations work to directly impact the lower and higher order needs that determine job satisfaction. Professional associations lobby for increased teacher pay, insurance benefits, and retirement compensation. Research has shown that professional associations tend to support incentive compensation programs centered on additional qualifications or duties, but often oppose compensation programs that directly reward teachers for improved student test scores. The NEA pushed for providing additional pay for teachers to work in hardto-staff schools or to earn National Board certification. However, the NEA opposed tying compensation to student test scores or subject areas of teaching. The AFT also supported giving additional compensation to teachers for obtaining National Board certification, working in challenging schools, and taking on extra duties. Unlike the NEA, the AFT supported providing extra compensation for educators teaching in shortage areas, such as special education and mathematics (Liang, Zhang, Huang, & Qiao, 2015).

Another lower order need tackled by professional associations is job security. Recently, there has been much debate over teacher evaluation systems and tenure laws in several states. In Tennessee, the Tennessee Education Association (TEA) has been pushing for lawmakers to prohibit the use of students' standardized test scores in teacher evaluations and high-stakes personnel decision making (e.g., termination, demotion, loss of tenure) (TEA, 2017). In California, teacher tenure was scrutinized when a lawsuit challenged that the state's tenure statutes violated student constitutional rights. The California Teachers Association (CTA) and the California Federation of Teachers (CFT) both served as defendants in the case. Together, these professional associations demonstrated to the three-judge panel that the state's tenure statutes did not make any certain group of students more likely to be taught by ineffective teachers than any other group of students (Vergara v. California, 2016).

Maslow's (1943) research suggested that once lower order needs are met, higher order needs can begin to be addressed. Although professional associations may still be working toward fulfilling the lower order needs for their members, many are concurrently working to address the higher order needs, such as relationships and a sense of accomplishment. Professional associations provide members with opportunities to build relationships through networking and professional development events. The NEA and AFT hold national meetings annually, and state affiliates host professional development conferences several times each year. Both of these professional associations have awards programs to recognize the accomplishments of their teacher members (AFT, 2017; NEA, 2017b). *Job satisfaction and student achievement.* When teachers are dissatisfied with their employment, some search and find other employment (i.e., teacher turnover). Others remain in the same position despite being unhappy with work (Huysse-Gaytandjieva, Groot, & Pavlova, 2013). When people remaining in an undesirable job position fail to improve their level of job satisfaction in their position, they may experience what Huysse-Gaytandjieva et al. (2013) referred to as *job lock*. Research has revealed that this feeling of being stuck at work can contribute to negative employee attitudes and behaviors.

Although one study indicated no direct correlation between teacher job satisfaction and student academic performance (Asif et al., 2016), other data have suggested that job satisfaction tends to impact areas that do directly affect academic achievement, including teachers' performances, attitudes, and motivation (Salehi, Taghavi, & Yunus, 2015). Teachers who report being more satisfied with their jobs also often show increased job performance when compared with teachers who report being less satisfied (Asif et al., 2016). Salehi et al. (2016) noted that when teachers have a high perception of their professional job quality, they also tend to have positive mindsets about teaching.

These resulting positive teacher attitudes have been shown to impact student achievement. The same study also found teacher job satisfaction and motivation to be interconnected and that higher levels of teacher motivation should result in improved education of students. Moreover, findings of another study (Veldman, Tartwijk, Brekelmans, & Wubbles, 2013) suggested a positive relationship between teacher job satisfaction and teacher-student relationships.

Similarly, a longitudinal survey indicated that teacher job satisfaction positively impacts student achievement scores in both reading and math. The findings also showed a moderate but positive relationship between teacher job satisfaction and students' reading growth between kindergarten and fifth grade. However, the study found no relationship between job satisfaction and growth in mathematics (Banerjee, Stearns, Moller, & Mickelson, 2017).

#### Methodology

This quantitative research study utilized a causal-comparative research approach to examine the difference in levels of job satisfaction between teachers separated into two pre-existing groups— professional association members and non-members. This study employed an independent sample t test for data analyses and tested for significance at the .05 level. Membership status within a professional organization (member vs. non-member) served as the independent variable, and teacher job satisfaction was the dependent variable.

The target population for this study included Pre-K – 12 classroom teachers who were and were not a part of professional associations. Potential participants were recruited online, specifically via social media groups for teachers. Although education support professionals (ESPs) can also be members of professional associations, the study only gathered data on the job satisfaction of classroom teachers. For the purposes of this study, a classroom teacher is defined as an educator working in a position that requires a state-issued apprentice or professional teaching license. As the research questions seek to make comparisons between members of professional associations and non-members, stratified sampling was utilized for this research study. The population was divided into two strata—members and non-members—and participants were randomly selected from each subgroup, proportionally. Stratification has ensured there were enough participants in both the member and non-member categories for rigorous statistical analysis.

Participants were recruited online through educator groups on social media. Participants gave permission for their data to be used in this research study by electronically acknowledging an informed consent statement at the beginning of the survey. Participation in this research was voluntary, and each participant had the right to decline to participate or to withdraw his or her input from the study at any time. Participating teachers completed an electronic survey through Google Forms. The survey questions from the Job Satisfaction Survey, developed by Spector (1985), were chosen because they were designed to evaluate job satisfaction in human service positions. It encompasses 36 items grouped into nine subscales. The subscales are: satisfaction: pay, promotion, supervision, fringe benefits, contingent rewards, operating conditions, coworkers, nature of work, and communication. In order to avoid biases,

17 of the items were designed with positive statements while the other 19 used negative statements, which are reverse coded during scoring. Responses for this survey are measured using a 6-point Likert scale. The Job Satisfaction Survey demonstrated both discriminant and convergent validities through multitrait-multimethod analysis of the Job Satisfaction Survey and the Job Descriptive Index (JDI) developed by Smith, Kendall, and Hulin (1969). Spector (1985) determined that the results of the analysis indicate that the JSS meets all four of the validity criteria established by Campbell and Fisk (1959).

## Findings

The sample for this study included 218 teachers from Pre-K –  $12^{th}$  grades. Research participants were recruited for participation in this study via social media. Of those 218 teachers, 198 taught in the state of Tennessee, while 20 participants taught in other states in the U.S. Fifty-three percent of participants were members of one or more professional associations and 47 percent were not members of any association. (See Table 1)

Prior to data analysis, assumptions of normality and homogeneity of variances were evaluated. A Shapiro-Wilk test was conducted to determine whether responses could have been produced by a normal distribution (Razali & Wah, 2011). The results of the Shapiro-Wilk test were not significant based on an alpha value of 0.05, W = 1.00, p = .987. This suggests that the deviations from normality are explainable by random chance, and thus, normality can be assumed. Levene's test for equality of variance was used to assess whether the homogeneity of variance assumption was met (Levene, 1960). The result of Levene's test was not significant based on an alpha value of 0.05, F(1, 216) = 0.41, p = .524. This result suggests that the variance of the dependent variable (Total Satisfaction Score) is approximately equal in each group, indicating the assumption of homogeneity of variance was met.

The result of the two-tailed independent samples t test was significant based on an alpha value of 0.05, t(216) = -2.48, p = .014, indicating the null hypothesis can be rejected. This finding suggests the

mean satisfaction score was significantly different between the (a) teachers who were members of professional organizations and (b) teachers who were not members. The results are presented in Table 2.

#### Discussion

This research study explored teacher job satisfaction and the differences that exist between professional association members and non-members. The findings from this study support the researcher's null hypothesis that there is a statistically significant difference in teacher job satisfaction between professional association members and non-members. Study participants who were members of professional associations, on average, had higher scores on the Job Satisfaction Survey (JSS) than participants who were not members of any associations. The mean satisfaction score for non-members (M = 125.62) was significantly lower than the mean satisfaction score for association members (M = 133.87), denoting that teachers involved in professional organizations had higher job satisfaction. Therefore, the data suggest that teachers within this sample who are members of professional associations were more satisfied with their jobs than teachers who were not members. A barplot of the means is presented in Figure 1.

Much of the existing research supports the findings from this current study. Maforah (2015) found a significant relationship between job satisfaction and both pay and job security. The results of Maforah's study showed that 87% of participants were dissatisfied with their pay. Additionally, 75% of the participants responded that they never or seldom feel secure in their jobs and, as a result, were dissatisfied with their jobs.

While all employees benefit from collective bargaining wins such as improved wages, tenure duty-free lunch and planning periods, association members also have access to an exclusive set of perks (NEA 2018b; TEA, 2017). Garcia-Serrano (2009) suggested that job satisfaction could differ between professional association members and non-members because members may have access to association private goods such as association events, insurances, and grievance procedures.

Sultan and Rashid (2014) found that an employee's perceived social support was positively related to his or her job satisfaction. Sultan and Rashid (2014) also found that coworker support was

negatively related to an employee's intention to quit. It is concluded, given the data from this study, that the social support employees feel from their colleagues (through professional organizations) could potentially act as a mediator for workplace stress. Likewise, other research shows that people lacking supportive interpersonal relationships experience more stress and less success in overcoming stressrelated problems (Miville & Constantine, 2006). It is possible that the interactions teachers have with like-minded colleagues at association activities and events may be, in part, the reason for the difference in job satisfaction from non-members. These events provide opportunities for teachers to network and build relationships with teachers across their districts, states, and countries—thereby increasing their perceived social support.

Professional associations also provide members with benefits that may afford educators some peace of mind. Many associations provide liability insurances that help members pay for legal representation in the event they are charged with offenses including student injuries, charges of educational malpractice, and corporal punishment, as well as any damages should the courts find that teacher liable (NEA, 2017b; AFT, 2017). The peace of mind these legal benefits provide may help to explain the significant difference in job satisfaction scores between the two groups.

State laws outline both grievance and discipline procedures for educators, and many allow teachers to have a representative present during disciplinary meetings. Professional associations provide these field representatives only to members. Whether members utilize this type of benefit or not, knowing a knowledgeable representative is available should such issues arise may lead members to perceive a stronger sense of job security and thereby explain their increased satisfaction.

Job satisfaction is usually determined by the extent to which outcomes meet or exceed an employee's expectations (Judge, Bono, & Locke, 2000). Several studies have examined social capital as a predictor of teacher job satisfaction (Chazon, 2019; Wolfe & Duran, 2013). Social capital refers to relationships and communication among members of an organization (e.g., a school, school district, or professional association), their objectives, norms, and mutual trust (Coleman, 1990). Wolfe and Duran's

(2013) study, which examined the relationship between teachers' job satisfaction and the level of social capital, concluded that the level of social capital was effective in the level of teachers' job satisfaction. Similarly, Chazon (2009) concluded that teachers' job satisfaction primarily depends on levels of social capital and that this capital is motivated by teachers to mobilize themselves to achieve innovations within the school and to achieve goals in common with other employees.

Other research has shown professional associations and labor unions rely heavily on high levels of social capital among members in order to enact collective actions around a variety of issues (Johnson & Jarley, 2005). Because social capital is critical to organizational success, professional associations work to develop strong networks among members (NEA, 2017a). This may provide some explanation for the significant difference in reported job satisfaction between professional association members and non-members.

## Conclusion

Research has shown that student achievement suffers when teachers are dissatisfied in theirjobs (Asif et al., 2016). Many teacher professional associations focus on improving the educational landscape for teachers and their students (Association of American Educators [AAE], 2017a; Association of Teacher Educators [ATE], 2018; NEA, 2017). The purpose of this study was to explore the involvement of teachers in professional associations and the effect this involvement has on teacher job satisfaction. Several conclusions can be drawn from the results of this study.

Professional association members reported higher satisfaction with their jobs than teacherswho were non-members. While this could be seen as a win for professional associations, it is still unknown to which aspects of membership teachers attribute their satisfaction.

Additionally, the limited scope of the study prevents the findings from being generalized to the larger population. However, when considered in conjunction with prior researchthestudy findings, interpretations, and conclusions contribute to both school and professionalassociation leadership and school improvement literature and should inform discussionsabout leadership development and the impact of teacherleadership on studentachievement.

#### Suggestions

The researcher makes the following recommendations for educational practice based on the findings of this study:

It is imperative that school leaders recognize the importance of transformational leadership in the development of teacher social capital within a school, as research provides evidence that high levels of teacher social capital should result in positive outcomes of student achievement, teacher quality, and teacher job satisfaction (Kahraman, 2016). In this study, participants who were members of professional associations reported higher job satisfaction than non-members. While this finding cannot be generalized to the entire teaching population nor to every professional association, it does suggest that collaboration between professional associations and schools has the potential to increase teacher job satisfaction and, as a result, impact student achievement. Both school and professional association leaders should be cognizant of the significant relationship between association membership and job satisfaction. Because improved coworker relationships have been shown to not only improve job satisfaction levels but also decrease the likelihood of turnover, school leaders should urge teachers to engage in activities that will strengthen these relationships. By encouraging association membership and engagement, education leaders could demonstrate the importance of colleague support, beginning with new teacher trainings and throughout teachers' careers. For example, professional association staff could train teachers on how to give and receive constructive feedback. This type of training could foster a supportive environment for teachers and, in turn, create a better learning environment for students.

## **Limitations and Future Research**

Recommendations for further investigations of the impact of membership in professional associations are threefold: (a) expanded sample size, (b) deeper exploration into the ways professional association membership affects factors influencing student achievement, and (c) investigation into the effects of the length of membership and level of engagement.

One of the limitations of the present study was the small sample size. A larger pool of participants would broaden the demographics of the sample size. This could result in different statistical outcomes or could reinforce the findings of this study.

Second, there is a need for data on which aspects of membership are at play when strengthening teacher job satisfaction. Understanding what teachers attribute to their job satisfaction, or lack thereof, is necessary if school and association leaders wish to make an impact in this area. Specifically, future research should explore how (1) engagement in political action, (2) participation in professional development events, or (3) utilization of member benefits impacts teacher job satisfaction.

Finally, subsequent research should study how length of membership and level of engagement impact job satisfaction. These data were not collected as a part of this study but could provide valuable insight into the reasons for specific outcomes.

# Table 1

Teacher Sample Demographics

Demographic	n	%
Teaching Location		
TN	198	91
Non-TN	20	9
Association Membership		
Yes	116	53
No	102	47

# Table 2

Two-Tailed Independent Samples t Test Job Satisfaction Between Non-Members and Members

	Non-Members		Members				
Variable	М	SD	М	SD	t	р	d
Total Satisfaction Score	125.62	23.13	133.87	25.71	-2.48	.014	0.34

*Note.* N = 218. Degrees of Freedom for the *t*-statistic = 216. *d* represents Cohen's *d*.

# Figure 1. The mean of total satisfaction score by membership.



#### References

- American Federation of Teachers. (2017). 2017–18 AFT + member benefits. *American Federation of Teachers*. Retrieved from https://www.aft.org/sites/default/files/ aftplus\_mbb\_17-18.pdf
- American Federation of Teachers. (2018a). American Federation of Teachers. Retrieved from http://aft.org
- American Federation of Teachers. (2018b). AFT voices. Retrieved from http://aftvoices.org
- American Federation of Teachers. (2018c). Share my lesson. Retrieved from http://sharemylesson.com
- Asif, I., Fakhra, A., Tahir, F., & Shabbir, A. (2016). Relationship between teachers' job satisfaction and students' academic performance. *Eurasian Journal of Educational Research*, 65, 335-344. doi:10.14689/ejer.2016.65.19
- Association of American Educators. (2017a). Member benefits. Retrieved from https://www.aaeteachers.org/index.php/member-benefits
- Association of American Educators. (2017b). Mission and vision. Retrieved from https://www.aaeteachers.org/index.php/aae-mission-and-vision
- Association of Teacher Educators. (2018). Vision and mission statement. Retrieved from https://www.atel.org/mission
- Banerjee, N., Stearns, E., Moller, S., & Mickelson, R. A. (2017). Teacher job satisfaction and student achievement: The roles of teacher professional community and teacher collaboration in schools. *American Journal of Education*, 123(2), 203-241. doi:10.1086/689932
- Chazon, T. L. (2009). Social capital: Relationship between social capital and teacher job satisfaction within a learning organization (Unpublished doctoral dissertation). Gardner-Webb University, USA.
- Coleman, J.S. (1990) Foundations of Social Theory. Cambridge, MA: The Belknap Press of Harvard University Press
- Garcia-Serrano, C. (2009). Job satisfaction, union membership and collective

bargaining.*European Journal of Industrial Relations*, 15(1), 91-111. doi.org:10.1177/0959680108100167

- Huysse-Gaytandjieva, A., Groot, W., & Pavlova, M. (2013). A new perspective on job lock. *Social Indicators Research*, *112*(3), 587-610. doi:10.1007/s11205-012-0072-2
- Johnson, N. B., &Jarley, P. (2005). Unions as social capital: the impact of trade union youth programmes on young workers' political and community engagement. Transfer: European Review of Labour and Research, 11(4), 605–616. https://doi.org/10.1177/102425890501100409
- Judge, T. A., Bono, J. E., & Locke, E. A. (2000). Personality and job satisfaction: The mediating role of job characteristics. *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 85(2), 237–249. https://doi.org/10.1037/0021-9010.85.2.237
- Kaden, U., Patterson, P. P., Healy, J., & Adams, B. L. (2016). Stemming the Revolving Door: Teacher Retention and Attrition in Arctic Alaska Schools. Global Education Review, 3(1), 129
- Kahraman, İ., &Summak, S. (2016). A mixed methods study on developing of social capital in schools. *The Journal of Academic Social Science*, 4(26), 482-504. https://doi.org/10.16992/ASOS.1161
- Lauermann, F. (2013). Teacher responsibility: Its meaning, measure, and educational implications.Unpublished doctoral dissertation, The University of Michigan, Ann Arbor. Retrieved from https://eric.ed.gov/?id=EJ894106
- Lauermann, F., &Karabenick, S. A. (2013). The meaning and measure of teachers' sense of responsibility for educational outcomes. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 30, 3-26. doi:10.1016/j.tate.2012.10.001
- Liang, G. & Zhang, Y. & Huang, H & Qiao, Z. (2015). Teacher Incentive Pay Programs in the United States: Union Influence and District Characteristics. International Journal of Education Policy and Leadership. 10. 1-18. 10.22230/ijepl.2015v10n3a491.
- Maforah, T. P. (2015). Inner-city independent schools' educators' job satisfaction and their motivation to quit. *Journal of International Education and Leadership*, 5(2), 1-9. Retrieved from https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/EJ1135599.pdf.

Maslow, A.H. (1943). A theory of human motivation. *In Psychological Review*, 50(4), 430-437.

- Mojavezi, A., &Tamiz, M. (2012). The impact of teacher self-efficacy on the students' motivation and achievement. *Theory and Practice in Language Studies*, *2*(3), 483-491. doi:10.4304/tpls.2.3.483-491
- National Education Association. (2017a). NEA handbook 2016-2017. Retrieved from http://www.nea.org/assets/docs/2017%20NEA%20Handbook.pdf
- National Education Association. (2017b). National Education Association. Retrieved from http://www.nea.org/
- National Education Association. (2018a). NEA member benefits. Retrieved from http://neamb.com
- National Education Association. (2018b). NEA tools and ideas. Retrieved from http://neamb.comfefficacy on the students' motivation and achievement. *Theory and Practice in Language Studies*, 2(3), 483-491. doi:10.4304/tpls.2.3.483-491
- Razali, N. M., & Wah, Y. B. (2011). Power comparisons of Shapiro-Wilk, Kolmogorov-Smirnov, Lilliefors and Anderson-Darling tests. *Journal of Statistical Modeling and Analytics*, 2(1), 21-33.
- Robertson, S. (2001). The great size debate. IssueTrak: A CEPI brief on educational facility issues. *Council of Educational Facility Planners, International*, *8*, 2-5.
- Ronfeldt, M., Loeb, S., & Wyckoff, J. (2013). How teacher turnover harms student achievement. *American Educational Research Journal*, *50*(1), 4-36. doi:10.3386/w17176
- Salehi, H. &Taghavi, E. &Yunus, M. (2015). Relationship between teachers' job satisfaction and their attitudes towards students' beliefs and motivation. *English Language Teaching*. 8(7). doi:10.5539/elt.v8n7p46
- Skaalvik, E., &Skaalvik, S. (2015). Job satisfaction, stress, and coping strategies in the teaching profession—What do teachers say? *International Education Studies*, 8(3), 181-192. doi:10.5465/AMJ.2005.15993112

- Spector, P. E. (1985). Measurement of human service staff satisfaction: Development of the job satisfaction survey. *American Journal of Community Psychology*, *13*(6), 693-713. doi:10.1007/BF00929796
- Spector, P. E. (1999). Instructions for Scoring the Job Satisfaction Survey, JSS. Retrieved from http://shell.cas.usf.edu/~pspector/scales/jssscore.html
- Türkoglu, M. E., Cansoy, R., &Parlar, H. (2017). Examining relationship between teachers' self-efficacy and job satisfaction. Universal Journal of Educational Research, 5(5), 765-772. doi:10.13189/ujer.2017.050509
- U.S. Department of Education. (2014). Condition of America's public school facilities. Retrieved from https://nces.ed.gov/surveys/frss/publications/2000032/ index.asp?sectionid=8
- Vergara v. California, 202 Cal. Rptr. 3d 362 (Cal. Ct. App. 2016).
- Wolfe, K., Duran, L. K. (2013). Culturally and linguistically diverse parents' perceptions of the IEP process: A review of current research. Multiple Voices for Ethnically Diverse Exceptional Learners, 13(2), 4–18.
- Zhang, G., & Zeller, N. (2016). A longitudinal investigation of the relationship between teacher preparation and teacher retention. *Teacher Education Quarterly*, 43(2), 73-92. Retrieved from https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/EJ1100322.pdf

## Science and World War I: Involving Teacher Candidates in Integrated Learning

Donna F. Short Austin Peay State University Philip C. Short Austin Peay State University

#### Abstract

This article explores the benefits to elementary teacher candidates (*candidates*) from the implementation of an integrated curriculum with predominantly minority students (*students*) of low socioeconomic status (SES). It provides an example of how both Candidates and Students gained fundamental concepts from authentic learning experiences. Two university professors collaborated with a fifth grade teacher (*teachers*) to develop a three-day lesson plan that integrated science and social studies standards in a mid-southern state. The students were from a self-contained fifth grade class and were provided the opportunity to practice their reading, writing and math skills during a project-based three-day lesson that included content narratives, collecting data, graphing, and measuring. Candidates were provided an opportunity to volunteer and practice inquiry instructional strategies during the three-day lesson. The candidates applied their knowledge and skills acquired in courses on instructional strategies and science pedagogy by engaging students through both convergent and divergent questioning. They used questioning techniques such as wait time and redirecting to observe how the fifth grade students processed the daily lessons. The professors and teacher modeled how an integrated curriculum connects students to real-world problems for the candidates. Effective feedback could be provided in real-time to both candidates and students.

## *Keywords: social studies, science, integrated curriculum, authentic instruction,* **Introduction**

In many classrooms across several states, teacher-centered, directinstruction is the basic, explicit teaching style of most teachers whose goal is achieving success for every student (Garrett, 2008). Duckworth (2009) indicated that this approach may actually impede the students' educational growth due to the passive role they assume in their learning. Although direct teaching has been shown toan efficient teaching modelfor academic outcomes as measured by tests aligned with the model, this systematic and step-by-step instruction does not appear to show positive effectives outcomes for both students (Stockard et al., 2018). The rigid routine of direct-instruction focuseson inculcation of teacher-selected material and passing an assessment. Where creative inquiry in integrated science is the goal, the passive nature of direct instructions methods can lead to compliant students that have no internal commitment to the subject matter (Chitman-Booker& Kopp, 2013).

To engage students, an educational mindset shift is required. Rather than isolating reading and math into disciplinary silos, a solution can be simplycreating an inquiry-basedcontent-rich EnglishLanguage Arts (ELA) curriculum integrated withthe often neglected science and social studies subjects. Many studies suggest that inquiry-based approaches to align with how people learn in ways that are internalized and motivate individuals for continued learning (Bransford et al., 1999). Passmore and Beauchamp (2017)posit that real-world phenomena can ground instructional practice for teachers and promote curiosity for students.

A change in focus is needed for teachers to manage the time constraints when trying to address all subjects in an equitable and timely manner. Instructional time is limited in the subjects of science and social studiesdue to prioritization of subjectsemphasized on standardized tests. National trends

reveallimited institutional support and time provided for science education in elementary schools as the curriculum continues to be aligned with priorities for performance on high-stakes testing (Smith &Nadelson, 2017).Mulvaney-Hoyerand Sparks (2017) found that a typical school week allows 30.2% of the time in ELA instructionfollowed by 17.6% in math, but only 8.6% of instructional time remains for social studies and science.With planning periods of 30 minutes or less per day scheduled to develop productive and engaging instruction for multiple subjects,teachers often, regrettably, attempt to manage the core subjects as discrete entities. This pressures of time too often result in neglectingimportant subject matter such as social studies and science. Candidates and cooperating teachers have reported to professors the challenges of integrating the curriculum because it is outside the norm of direct instruction and has not been modeled for them throughout most of their own schooling.

With ELA likely to continue receiving the top priority in elementary education, university educator preparation programs (EPP)need to reinforce among candidates that teaching integratedscience and social studies content does, indeed,create a richer and in-depth context with authentic applications (Dougherty & Moore, 2019). The attention of EPPs towardtraining and licensing candidates in individual methods courses tends to focus solely on outcomes fordiscipline-specific learning objectives. Integrated connectionsbetween the methods courses are not perceived as a requirement in the subject area in which candidatesteach. Content area candidates do not view themselves as literacy educators if their content area is outside ofELA (Friedland et al., 2017).

During this activity, the candidates' field experiences in observing limited instructional time onscience and social studies was of interest. Additionally, there was a concern, due to the EPP emphasis on reading and math licensure paths, that elementary teacher candidates did not view themselves as adequate science or social studies teachers. In particular, the lack of proper training, deficient scientific culture, and the dearth of resources for science teachers appeared to disadvantage the candidates and negatively impact their science self-efficacy as has been indicated by Smith &Nadelson(2017). Opportunities for candidates to see more authentic, real-time experiences modeled during their methods courses, it was reasoned, might nurture the mindset for a constructivist approach and propel them to the goalsof the National Framework for K-12 Science (National Research Council, 2013) as well as those for the College, Career, and Civic Life (C3) Framework for Social Studies (National Council for the Social Studies, 2013).

## **Integrating a Lesson**

To empower candidates to think outside their areas of concentration, and provide strategies on how to address time constraints in the classroom, an integrated science and social studies lesson for onehour sessions over a three-day period was modeled. The lessons followed the 5-E instructional approach (Bybee, 2015). A main goal of the three-daylesson was to provide insights for the candidates on how a collaborative, project-based lesson can address reading comprehension and math skills while providing more instructional time in science and social studies.

Prior to the lessons, the professors and teacher discussed best ways to support both science and social studies' standards in an engaging manner for students. The upcoming social studies and science standards were reviewed and studied to identify authentic connections between disciplines. An overarching theme emergedthat focused on a state social studies standardwhich describes the impact of U.S. involvement in World War I (WW I) and a science standard which addresses motion and stability – forces and interactions. Additionally, thestate's reading standard for conducting short research projects using multiple resources aligned well with the lessons along with the state math standardsaddressing measurement and data, volume, and graphing data. The reading and math standards were easily understood by the candidates tooverlap and support the science and social studies objectives.

The 5-E model of instruction supported the integratedlesson and activities by focusing on the five phases that allowedstudents to engage, explore, explain, elaborate, and evaluate their learning. Since the candidates learned this specific strategy in their social studies and science methods courses, the opportunity to implement this learner-centered, project-based approach as facilitators with the students was provided. Constrained by prescribed plans they are expected to follow during their field experiences, candidates seldom have opportunity to practice innovative strategies learned in their EPP courses. With

students visiting the university's STEM lab classroom, candidates' were afforded the experience of integrating instruction with support and guidance from the teacher and professors. Based on cognitive research, learning is an active process for the student (Bybee, 2015); therefore, benefits were anticipated for not only fifth grade students but also candidates as novice teachers.

### A Social Phenomenon for Science Inquiry

A social studies textbook(Marsh, 2019) aligned to the state's standardsprovided students with an introduction to WW I. An excerpt from Casserley and Marx (n.d.) gave historical context to the phenomenon serving as a basis for the 5-E lesson development.

When World War I began in 1914, neither the United States Navy norAmerican coastal shipping vessels were directly affected. During thewar's early years, the battleshappened far from American shores andthere seemed to be no direct danger to the United States. The peopleof North Carolina felt they had little to fear from Germany's new*Unterseeboot* (undersea boat) fleet that was prowling the NorthAtlantic. TheseGerman submarines, or U-boats, sunk scores of shipswith the loss of hundreds of lives, but many Americans did not believe the U-boats possessed the range to reach the UnitedStates easternseaboard. They were wrong. By the end of the war in 1918, three GermanU-boats, U-151, U-140, and U-117, had sunk a total of 10 vessels off NorthCarolina alone. When the U-151 arrived off the U.S. East Coast in May 1918, it was the firstforeign enemy naval vessel to invade U.S. waters since theWar of 1812. World War I had come home to North Carolina (p. 1).

This fundamental passage guided our next steps to identifying the science standards that would best support the students' authentic learning about the forces that act on a floating boat. Science terms and concepts such as buoyancy, displacement, gravity, surface tension, density, mass, and weight would support literacy goals for the students' as well as build a connection between social studies and science topics. We extended the lesson by incorporating math skills such as measurement, data collection, graphing, addition and subtraction that students would use to design and build their boats. Additionally, we researched and provided multiple resources and pictures that the students could reference to support their designs.

Once our 5-E lesson was outlined, the volunteer candidateswere presented the outlinefor review, discussion, and to make suggested revisions. Through examination of and contribution to the lesson plans, active participation in setting up the classroom, and discussions with the classroom teacher and professors, candidates were able to familiarize themselves with the material and become better prepared to practice effective feedback and questioning strategies.

## An Interactive Mini-Museum

Master of Arts in Teaching (MAT) candidates enrolled in the professors' integrated science and social studies methods course in the program, who were unable to participate in class instruction during the three-day event, were afforded opportunities to contribute. Their involvement in planning included the creation of various hands-on, mini-museum activities that could be utilized by students. The article, "Museums at School" (D'Acquisto, 2013) was an assigned reading for the MAT teacher candidates to learn about the benefits of blending academic subject areas with creative, hands-on learning.D'Acquisto (2013) posited that "the best museum projects, academic rigor and innovative thinking are integrated into one robust learning process" (para. 12).

After discussing the assigned reading, the MAT candidates engaged in group brainstorming sessions for ideas on how to build real-world learning experiences for a fifth-grade class. Time was devoted by MAT candidates in researching various WWI history ideas to create their mini-museum. The candidates envisionedfour different stations borderedby trifold poster boardsserving as museum walls. Each activity included directions, a brief history description, and pictures on varied events of WW I. Station activities included: 1) helping a soldier writeletters to loved ones at home; 2)designing a military service insignia, depicting historical sites using quilt pieces in an activity they called "a stitch in time"; and 4) a hands-on simulation to excavate for WWI artifacts. The situated cognition experience (Brown et al., 1989)provided additional clinical practice for the undergraduate candidates to actively practice what they were learning (Lenkaitis&Hiliker, 2019). An authentic learning experience for the MAT candidates

provided insights on how an integrating math and reading into science and social studies projects could generatediverseactivity lesson ideas leading students deeper into a rich learning experiences.

## Days of Authentic Learning for Students and Candidates

Fifth-grade students were invited, with their teacher, to the university's STEM Center for activity lessons each afternoon for three consecutive days. Conducting the classes on the university campus was convenient for candidates, but it also provided the minority students of lower SESauniversity campus experience. The first day's lesson, involved a warm-up activity to assess the students' prior academic knowledge about the particles of matter.

Two candidates were encouraged to take the leadership rolein two demonstrations, questioning strategies, and providingstudent feedback. Other candidates were assigned to guide one of five small groups of students as they continued the discussion based on their observations of the two demonstrations. Candidates learned how to pose prompting, probing, and focusing questioning about the particles of a solid, liquid and gas to the fifth grade students.

The students rotated from station to station to exploring various demonstrations that explained specificscience terms and concepts that werefoundational to their inquiries. Once each group had rotated through the stations, they returned to their original table to make observations of various pictures of types of boats and make inferences on the purpose for certain boat structures. The students proceeded to work together on ideas for a viableboat design, with the importance of WW I military vessels in mind.

Once candidates conducted a formative assessment of the group's conceptual boat design, the groupswere provided graph paper, rulers, and pencils to begin their scaled drawing of their own boat. Candidates closed the day's sessions with an assessment and review of science terms with their functional definitions.

On the second day students were engaged in a review of the previous day's discussion and lessons learned by revisiting stations and completing performance assessments to demonstrate their conceptual understandings. Groups of students were guided by candidates as they continued their research and completed their blueprint drawings. A stamped approval was required before beginning construction of their boat designs. Roles were assigned to each student who were to perform assigned tasks in the groups. Doing so gave each student ownership in the project.Candidates prompted the small groups with questions about their selected materials and design. Candidates followed-up with focusing questions that would encourage students to explain what they have learned, and motivate the students' interests in their boat project.

On the third and final day, students reconnected to the real-world phenomenon with which the lessons began; that is, the importance of STEM fields to the outcomes of military conflicts such as WW I. Even though the students' capacity for comprehension and application were being assessed, they were excited and eager to test their boat designs in a tub of water. Students placed weights in their boats and recorded the mass their boats could hold without sinking. The data was shared with the whole class to graph and draw conclusions about design efficacy. A whole class discussion allowed plenary engagement of students to infer which variables of boat design were mostrelevant to the buoyancy of different structures. This discussion was extended to the role of science and mathematics as influencers on the course of human history. Additional cross-cutting concepts were addressed by illustrating how our understandings of mass, matter, buoyancy, and force has been facilitated by wildlife in nature. Students were intrigued to learn that many of our technology and engineering applications have largely been modifications of adaptations observed in plants and animals.

## The Need for Clinical Experiences

Fifth-grade students benefittedfrom this three-day, integrated lesson by gaining valuable skills connecting science to their social studies, math, and ELA. Groundingtheir studies in real-world phenomena through opportunities to apply learned concepts in hands-on design experiences had positive affective outcomes. Students were the center of their learning that helped them with higher-order thinking skills, cooperative learning, and consideration of other students' values. Their small group discussions reinforced their thinking process deepening their understanding. The candidates were provided with a practice-based learning experience that combined theory with a strategic, and reflective process. Teacher

candidates could assess the effectiveness of integrated instruction and gain experiences that supported them as self-sufficient professionals who have the capacity to develop, measure, and grow in their practice over time.

This type of clinical experience provided an authentic setting for candidates to observe two professors and the classroom teacher modeling collaborative efforts during the three-day lesson. Formalized efforts in EPPs have been made to transform the field and clinical experiences required of candidateswith the goal of improving candidates' effectiveness (Hubball & Gold, 2007). Nevertheless, an intentional, collaborative effort among school districts and EPPs is essential to amelioratenegative impacts time constraints on inquiry learning and affective measures in a K-12 classrooms. The integrated curriculum is not thecurrent norm in teacher-centered classrooms dominated by direct instruction, but shifting to constructivist approaches, despite transitional challenges, would benefit teachers desiring higher levels of success for every student. The educational growth of our students and teacher candidates requires less passivity and more active participation to own their learning processes in ways that are connected to their respective, lived worlds.

### References

- Bransford, J.D., Brown, A.L., & Cocking, R.R. (1999). *How people learn: Brain, mind, experience, and school.* National Academy Press. https://www.nap.edu/catalog/9853/how-people-learn-brain-mind-experience-and-school-expanded-edition
- Brown, J.S., Collins, A., &Duguid. P. (1989). Situated cognition and the culture of learning.*Educational Researcher*, *18*(1), 32-42.
- Bybee, Rodger W. (2015). The BSCS 5E instructional model: creating teachable moments. NSTA Press.
- Casserley, T.& Marx, D. (n.d.).*The Enemy in Home Waters How World War I Came Home to North Carolina*. National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration. https://monitor.noaa.gov/publications/ the-enemy-in-home-waters.html
- Chitman-Booker, L. & Kopp, K. (2013). The 5 Es of Inquiry-Based Science. Shell Education.
- D'Acquisto, L. (2013). Museums at school. *Educational Leadership*, 70(5).http://www.ascd.org/publications/educational-leadership/feb13/vol70/num05/Museums-at-School.aspx
- Dougherty, C. & Moore, R. (2019). *Educators' beliefs about teaching science and social studies in K-3*. ACT Research & Policy. https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/ED602024.pdf
- Duckworth, E. (2009). Helping students get to where ideas can find them. *The New Educator* 5: 185-188. http://dash.harvard.edu/bitstream/handle/1/4449111/Duckworth%20New%20Educator%202009.p df?sequence=1&isAllowed=y
- Friedland, E.,Kuttesch, E., McMillen, S., &del Prado Hill, P. (2017). Listening to the voices of teacher candidates to design content area literacy courses. *Journal of Inquiry and Action in Education*, 8(2), 34-53.
- Garrett, T. (2008). Student-centered and teacher-centered classroom management: a case study of three elementary teachers. *Journal of Classroom Interaction* 43(1), 34-37.
- Hubball, H. & Gold, N. (2007). The scholarship of curriculum practice and undergraduate program reform: integrating theory into practice. *New Directions for Teaching and Learning*,2007(12), 5-14. doi:10.1002/tl.293
- Marsh, C. (2019/2020). The History of the U.S. & Tennessee History: 5<sup>th</sup> grade social studies student book. Gallopade International.
- Mulvaney-Hoyer, K. & Sparks, D. (2017). *Instructional time for third-and-eighth-graders inpublic and private schools: school year 2011-12*.U.S. Department of Education, National Center for Education Statistics.https://nces.ed.gov/pubs2017/2017076.pdf
- Lenkaitis, C. &Hiliker, S. (2019). Authentic practice with games to promote vocabulary building in language teaching. In C. Lenkaitis and S. Hiliker (Eds.), *Engaging teacher candidates and language learners with authentic practice*(1-14). IGI Global.
- National Council for the Social Studies. (2013). The college, career, and civic life (c3) framework for social studies state standards: Guidance for enhancing the rigor of k-12 civics, economics,

geography, and history.https://www.socialstudies.org/sites/default/files/2017/Jun/c3-framework-for-social-studies-rev0617.pdf

- National Research Council. (2013). A framework for K-12 science education: Practices, crosscutting concepts, and core ideas. The National Academies Press.https://www.nap.edu/catalog/13165/a-framework-for-k-12-science-education-practices-crosscutting-concepts
- Passmore, C. & Beauchamp, A. (2017, March). *Phenomena-Questions-Models* [Conference presentation]. National Science Teacher Association 2017 Annual National Conference in Los Angeles, CA. https://education.ucdavis.edu/sites/main/files/file-attachments/phenomena-questionsmodels nsta 2017 0.pdf?1493666608
- Smith, J., &Nadelson, L. (2017). Finding alignment: The perceptions and integration of the next generation science standards practices by elementary teachers. School Science & Mathematics, 117(5), 194-203. doi:10.1111/ssm.12222
- Stockard, J., Wood, T., Coughlin, C., &Khoury, C. (2018). The effectiveness of direct instruction curricula: A meta-analysis of a half century of research. *Review of Educational Research*, 88(4), 479–507.

# **Holocaust Memorial Art and History Education**

Julie Anne Taylor University of Michigan-Dearborn *Timothy Gore* Douglass Academy for Young Men Danielle L. DeFauw University of Michigan-Dearborn Michael Sevick University of Michigan-Flint *KyriaGore* Douglass Academy for Young Men Timothy Constant Holocaust Memorial Center Chantal Assaf University of Michigan-Dearborn Jacob Schenkel University of Michigan-Dearborn *GlovettaWilliams* Douglass Academy for Young Men

Memorial art offers insights into historic events, persons, and perspectives. Interdisciplinary, creative projects on memorials engage students in the process of historical inquiry. Students apply theirknowledge in generative processes. In this action-research study, students at an urban high school in the Midwest created memorial art on the Holocaust. Their artwork and writings suggest that the project increased their knowledge of history and deepened intercultural understanding. In this study, the following research questions were explored: (a) How should artwork, which was made during and/or after the Holocaust by witnesses, be integrated in secondary history education on the Holocaust?; (b) How would the use of historical photographs in the creation of memorial art engage high school students in historical thinking and analysis?; and (c) Would a memorial art project on the Holocaust foster intercultural communication? If so, how?

The theoretical foundations of this study lie in deeper learning, a constructivist approach to teaching and learning that emphasizes the transfer of knowledge (Pellegrino, 2015). Students learn through questioning, and they apply their knowledge in diverse contexts (Costa & Kallick, 2015). Additionally, the pedagogical insights of Samuel Totten and Stephen Feinberg (2016) influenced this action-research project. When teaching the Holocaust, theyrecommend addressing students' cognitive and affective domains by integrating appropriate primary-source materials. Their emphasis on students' direct study of evidence is in alignment with the *College, Career, and Civic (C3) Framework's* inquiry-based approach to history education (National Council for the Social Studies, 2013).

## The students and their school

This IRB-approved study was carried out in a small, public school in a major Midwestern metropolis. During the 2019-2020 academic year, about 70 students were enrolled. Over 98% of the

students were African American, and all were male. The majority qualified for the National School Lunch Program. Focused on college preparation, the school began offering Advanced Placement (AP) courses for the first time in the fall of 2019.Most students, who were involved in the project, were enrolled in AP World History. With the approval of the school's administration, several students, after expressing interest, participated in the program through a pull-out process. The total number of regular participants was 18. With permission and first-name attributions, images of the students' works of art have been included in this article.

The project was part of a long-term collaboration between the school's social studies teachers and theeducation faculty at a medium-sized, public university. Established in 2012, the partnership is focused on offeringart-based enrichment programming in the social studies. Each year students explore a different topic. During the 2019-2020 academic year, the researchers chose the Holocaust as the subject of study, and they partnered with professionals from a regional Holocaust museum.

## The action-research project

The researchers implemented a ten-week, interdisciplinaryproject on the Holocaust. On average, about one class period per week was devoted to itsstudy. In addition to participating in lectures by high school and university faculty, the students engaged in national and international videoconferences with scholars. WithIsraEd in Jerusalem, Israel and 12<sup>th</sup> Armored Division Memorial Museum in Abilene, Texas, the young men examined the history of anti-Semitism, the Holocaust and its aftermath, and World War II. The interactive videoconferencing format allowed students to pose questions directly to specialists (Anastasiades, 2009; Martin, 2008; Newman, 2008; Taylor, Neloms, & Vaillancourt, 2018). The curator of the 12<sup>th</sup> Armored Division Memorial Museum supported the students' learning with primary sources by holding authentic artifacts to his webcam for close observation. In person, the students visited the Holocaust museum, where they participated in a docent-led tour and a lecture by a Holocaust survivor. Learning from survivors and personal accounts deepens students' understanding of the Holocaust's impact on individual people (Bergen, 2016).

The direct study of primary sources is a well-established, effective practice in history education (Levstik& Barton, 2001; Seixas& Morton, 2013). With their teachers, the students read and discussed Elie Wiesel's (1958/2006) memoir, *Night*. A Nobel Peace Prize recipient, Wiesel was of similar age to the students when he was forcibly transported to Auschwitz. His book documents how he, his family, and other Jewish people were dehumanized during the Holocaust.

Throughout the project, theaction-researchers led the students in thestudy of historic photographs and works of art on the Holocaust. They examined over 100 images. The photographs were primarily from the online database, the *Holocaust Encyclopedia* of the United States Holocaust Memorial Museum (USHMM). Most works of art were from Yad Vashem and the book, *Art of the Holocaust*, by Janet Blatter and Sybil Milton (1981). The researchers decided, at the beginning of the project, to avoid the use of graphic imagery because of its potential to be disturbing and distressing to students (Lindquist, 2006; Totten & Feinberg, 2016).

To engage the students in art analysis in class, the researchers posed the three questions that comprise the Visual Thinking Strategies: (a) What is going on in this picture; (b) What do you see that makes you say that?; and(c) What more can you find? (Yenawine, 2013). They also asked other questions: (a) What is the artist conveying?; (b) What symbols do you see?; and(c) What feelings does the image evoke? When examining both artwork and historic photographs, the students explained how the images related to the project's themes of resistance, liberation, andmemory.

The project culminated in the students' creation of memorial paintings, sculptures, and photographs. Historic photographs of the Holocaust were the subjects of their paintings and sculptures. The sources offered chronological documentation of the Holocaust. All photographs were from the 1930s or 1940s except four: In light of the students' interest in Pavel Friedman's (Volavkova, 1993) poem, "I Never Saw another Butterfly," a couple of contemporary, color pictures of yellow butterflies were included. Additionally, two photographs of Anne Frank's chestnut tree were shared. To promote artistic originality among the students, historic paintings and drawings were excluded as potential subjects.

Due to the onset of the COVID-19 pandemic, the creation of other artistic works, such as mosaics and poetry, could not be undertaken. Although the students completed small, acrylic paintings on paper, their large canvases remained unfinished. To their completed pieces, the students gave titles, and theywrote statements. The writing of statements began in class, and it continued when instruction resumed online, though the work was somewhat truncated by the pandemic.

The pandemic necessitated the cancellation of the planned, live exhibition of the students' artwork at the Holocaust museum. To showcase virtuallythe majority of the students' paintings, sculptures, and photographs, the researchers created a short video. After viewing the students' work, the Venezuelan composer and pianist, Gabriela Montero (2007), gave her permission to use her piece, *Continuum*, in perpetuity with video. The video was shared with the students and their families as well as with university, school, and museum educators. The university published a link to the video in its electronic newsletter to the campus. The video was also shared by the 12<sup>th</sup> Armored Division Memorial Museum on its Facebook page.

#### Methods

The authors used qualitative methods in action research. Action research is a systematic process of inquiry that yields insights to advance teaching methodologies (Efron&Ravid, 2013; Mertler, 2014; Mills, 2011).Conducted in the field, explorations are typically collaborative (Mertler, 2014; Stringer, 2014). In this study, the authors employed two techniques that are common in action research: the analysis of artifacts and persistent observation (Efron&Ravid, 2013). They examined multiple pieces: the students' paintings, sculptures, photographsand writings. Field notes confirmed their findings.Drawn from artifacts, the interpretations were supported by multiple authors.

#### Findings

Of the over 100 historical images that the students had studied during interactive lectures, about 60 photographs were selected by the researchers to be the potential subjects of the small, acrylic paintings. When choosing the photographs, in addition to evaluating their historic content, the researchers considered the technical skill that would have reasonably been required to render the images in paint or clay. Because the school was too small to offer elective courses in art, and only one student in the program had taken an art class in middle school, some of the complex images, which the students had studied during lectures, were not used in the art projects.

The young men had the option of finding photographs independently online for their works of art, but all opted to choose from the collection that was provided. The researchers placed copies of the photographs on multiple tables for the students to peruse. In their field notes, the researchers observedthat, per weeks of study on the Holocaust, nearly all students chose images that aligned with their subject interests. When deciding upon images, a couple of students were also influenced by their sense of how difficult it would have been to paint particular subjects.

When the students' paintings were finished, the researchers noted the students' chosen subjects, and they conducted research to find additional, related images for the sculpture project. The young men were encouraged, but not required, to continue to explore their chosen subjects they made their sculptures. Most students did so. The set of photographs, which was presented for the sculpture project, included additional portraits to encourage biographical study. In light of the students' topics, the researchers also assembled a mobile library. Its books were then regularly brought to the enrichment classes. The mobile library included titles by Paul R. Bartrop (2016); Leon Bass (2011); Jean Boase-Beier and Marian de Vooght (2019); Anne Frank (1947/1991); Martin Gilbert (2003/2004); Rod Gragg (2016); Karen Levine (2002/2012); Bo Lidegaard (2013); Tilar J. Mazzeo (2016); Mordecai Paldiel (2007); Emanuel Ringelblum (1952/2006); Hana Volavkova(1993);and Edward Waszak (2005).

Resistance was a theme of the project. The students considered the various forms that resistance took during the Holocaust, including efforts to document the human-rights abuses and atrocities (Bartrop, 2016; Salmons, 2010). One student chose the Ringelblum or Oneg Shabbat Archives as his subject. He painted the milk can in which the historian, Emanuel Ringelblum (1952/2006), and other Jews in the Warsaw Ghetto had buried records. The student titled his painting, *Ringelblum's Capsule*. Based on a black-and-white photograph, he also sculpted Ringelblum's portrait in clay. The young man's keen

interest in the Ringelblum Archives led him to borrow*Notes from the Warsaw Ghetto*from the project's mobile library to read at home. Of his painting, the student wrote, "I was inspired by the fact that there was so much information stored in the capsule in the Warsaw Ghetto. The artwork conveys how the Jewish people had to hide stories. The painting conveys why the story got out."

Also inspired by the theme of resistance, another young man sculpted a symbol of the uprising in the Warsaw Ghetto: a Molotov cocktail. In addition to having discussed the uprising in class, the students had viewed a video on Jewish resistance by Yad Vashem's International School for Holocaust Studies (n.d.). The young man selected an image of a bottle detonator from the *Holocaust Encyclopedia*, and he shaped and situated an incendiary devicebetween barbed wire as if it were in mid-air. His painting of a fiery red background added to the piece's impact.

In deciding upon subjects, severalyoung men gravitated toward sources on African Americans and the theme of liberation. They painted the insignia of the 12<sup>th</sup> Armored Division, and they sculpted portraits of Edward Carter and Leon Bass.A young man offered this explanation of his choice of the division's insignia: "I painted the insignia of the 12<sup>th</sup> Armored Division. The stories of the African American soldiers caught my attention. I feel that their contributions are not known enough."

On blue and green backgrounds, two young man painted the rescue boats that had ferried Jews from Denmark to safety in Sweden in 1943. With their brushes, they recorded details, such as the vessels' registration numbers. "I painted the Danish rescue boats. I was inspired by the rescue of people. The rescuers had a choice not to help and to do nothing. The Jews, who were rescued, had a choice to stay behind. My artwork conveys a message of liberation," wrote a student. His classmate explained his choice of subject: "What inspired me to do this painting was the significance of the situation. The Danish fishermen helped many Jews to safety in Sweden. I wanted to represent an act of bravery." Healso sculpted King Christian X, who had sought to protect the Jews, as Danish citizens, from Nazi persecution (Lidegaard, 2013).

When creating both paintings and sculptures, a few students chose photographs that reflected the lives and experiences of Jewish children before, during, and after the Holocaust such as a child's violin, a toddler's pair of shoes, and Hana Brady's suitcase. Two students sculpted portraits of Jewish refugee children. In reflecting on the theme of memory and the concept of choice, the students recognized that millions of victims of the Nazis had had only "choiceless choices" in situations over which they had no control during the Holocaust (Langer, 1982; Totten & Feinberg, 2016). Of his portrait of a Polish Jewish girl, whose photograph (USHMM, 1943) was taken when she reached Palestine in 1943, a student wrote, "Compassion is a feeling that every human being should possess.My hope, when you see the sculpture of this little Jewish girl carrying her suitcase and her knapsack into a world of unknowns, is that compassion fills your heart." See Figure 1.

Two students sculpted iconic images:aStar of David and a jacket from a concentration camp. See Figure 2.Onto the former, a student pressed artificial barbed wire, and he incised numbers. He titled the piece, *Behind the Wire*. He wrote, "My artwork depicts the barbed wire that kept people in. The message of my sculpture is memory. The Nazis used barbed wire to keep the Jews from escaping the camps. The Jewish people had no choice when they were put in the camps. I hope that people feel and understand how those people felt."

In their statements, some students wrote about how the process of creating art had fostered emotional connections between themselves and their subjects. According to Stephen Feinberg and Samuel Totten (2016), effective Holocaust education is both cognitive and affective.Empathymay be viewed as a component of historical understanding (Yeager & Foster, 2001). In describing the process of creating a painting of Anne Frank's chestnut tree, a student wrote, "I learned about how Anne Frank and her family went into hiding to flee Nazi persecution...They did not have any choice. My time painting felt as if I was there with her. The tree in the darkness inspired me."one See Figure 3.

Having studied *One Spring*by Karl Bodek and Kurt Conrad Löw (1941) as well asPavel Friedmann's (Volavkova, 1993) poem, "I Never Saw Another Butterfly," two students chose to paint yellow butterflies. *One Spring* depicts a yellow butterfly perched paradoxically on barbed wire in the foreground of the Furs Camp in France in 1941. Friedmann penned his poem while imprisoned in the

Czech ghetto and concentration camp, Terezin. He was killed in Auschwitz in 1944 (Volavkova, 1993).In explaining his reason for painting a butterfly, a young man wrote, "The message of my painting is to remember the people who died." See Figure 4.

The making of photographic art was planned and carried out differently from the painting and sculpture projects. The researchers invited the students to work during their lunch hour on artistic photographs. Five students opted to stay during lunch, and they worked collaboratively on a number of pieces. As props, they utilized painted canvas backgrounds as well as books in the school's media center, yarmulkes, and artificial barbed wire. They took pictures with an iPhone and an iPad. In analyzing their artistic photographs, the researchers noted that the students' focus was the study of theHolocaust today. The photographs conveyed the students' understanding of the need for history and cross-cultural education.

#### Discussion

## Inquiry and historical investigations

The Holocaust memorial art project engaged students in the four dimensions of the Inquiry Arc, which is at the core of social studies education in the United States today. Through the arc, students develop questions and plan inquiries, apply disciplinary concepts and tools, evaluate sources and use evidence, and communicate conclusions (National Council for the Social Studies, 2013). The students communicated in this project through both art and writing.

On the first day of the program, the students wrote and shared the questions that they had about the Holocaust. "Why?" is one of the most common questions posed by learners when studying this subject (Hayes, 2017), and it arose repeatedly among the students. To begin to answer questions about why the Holocaust took place, educators must go beyond the chronological and geographical context of Nazi Germany (Totten & Feinberg, 2016). Having knowledge of historical anti-Semitism in Europe is critical (Totten & Feinberg, 2016). The students also posed questions about resistance, rescue, loss, survival, and long-term consequences. Some of their questions were:

How did people attempt to stay alive during the Holocaust? Why didn't more countries rescue the Jews? Who were the very important Jewish people who died during the Holocaust? How did the Holocaust affect the survivors? How long did it take for them to recover?

How has the Holocaust affected how people think today?

The United States Holocaust Memorial Museum's (2020) definition of and timeline for the Holocaust were used in the program. Beginning in 1933 with Hitler's rise to power, the Holocaust was"...the systematic, state-sponsored persecution and murder of six million Jews by the Nazi regime and its allies and collaborators" (n.p.).Although the project focused on the persecution of the Jewish people, the students learned about other targeted groups, including Poles, gays and lesbians, the disabled, trade unionists, and communists.

As Ringelblum, in the Warsaw Ghetto, prepared written records, Jewish artists, such as Leo Haas, bore witness to Nazi atrocities through their drawings and paintings (Blatter & Milton, 1981). Haas'(1945) drawingof gaunt, uniformed prisoners during a roll call in the Mauthausen concentration camp depicts men, who have collapsed on the ground.See Figure 5. The scene is similar to Wiesel's (1958/2006) description of a roll call in *Night*. When students study multiple sources of evidence, they gain insight into how historians construct narratives.

Historical photographs and artwork are "powerful entry" points into the history of the Holocaust (Feinberg & Totten, 2016, p. 2). In addition to increasing students' curiosity about historical subjects, the study of primary sources builds students' knowledge(Grant, Swan, & Lee 2017). The analysis ofworks of art hones students' observational skills. When students must also create artwork based on historic images, the learning process becomes immersive.

Through their study of historic Holocaust art, the students learned about protest through artistic expression. Per Figure 6, Käthe Kollwitz's (1942)*Seed Grain Shall Not Be Milled* became a springboard for a discussion of how a minority of Germans openly expressed dissent. The lithograph depictsa

mother's protective embrace of three children. The piece was Kollwitz's response to an edict for the recruitment of children for the Germany army in 1942.

In addition to examining historic photographs and artwork, the students studied contemporary Holocaust memorial art prior to creating their own pieces. They participated in agallery walk during which they analyzed winning posters from Designing Memory competition, which is organized annually by Yad Vashem and the Israel Ministry of Public Diplomacy. The students discussed the work of seven graphic designers, including DorielRimmer-Halperin (2012), whose commemorative poster depicts the silhouette of an elderly man, alone and with a cane in hand, looking toward the shadows of his lost family members. The students' comments suggested that they were also moved by Tamar Odaya Bodnar's (2017) rendering of the face of a child with the identification numbers that had been used to dehumanize Jewish people. The subject was the artist's grandfather as a boy. From the gallery walk, the students learned about remembrance through art. Memorial art is at the intersection of past and present. **Historical knowledge and intercultural understanding** 

In the interactive lectures with the researchers, while the students studied the historical context in which the Holocaust took place, they also identified common manifestations of hate and discrimination. When the students examined signs that barred Jewish people from telephone booths, benches, and restaurants, they drew parallels to African American experiences in the United States. In addition to learning about anti-Semitism, the students considered the racism that the Nazis harbored toward African Americans, such as Jesse Owens, who won four gold medals in the 1936 Olympics in Berlin. The young men studied the Anti-Defamation League's (2018) Pyramid of Hate, and they reflected on intimidation and violence against minority groups.

When the presenter fromIsraEd spoke about the pain and societal harmfulness of anti-Semitism, not only in Nazi Germany but in the contemporary United States and other countries, multiple students nodded knowingly. As African Americans, they understood the ramifications of prejudice. One student said, "We know how it feels." Another commented, "We understand."

## African American testimonies and perspectives

As culturally responsive educators, the researchers purposefully integrated the experiences and perspectives of African Americans. Through diverse instructional strategies, students in culturally responsive classrooms learn about their own histories and heritages as well as those of others (Gay, 2010).Recognized as a liberating force by the USHMM and the United States Army Center of Military History, the 12<sup>th</sup> Armored Infantry Division was highlighted in the project. The division had African American combat companies. As a flag, one young man depicted the medic symbol that he had observed on a vehicle in a photograph of Warren Capers. For his valorduring the Allied invasion of France, Capers was recommended for a Silver Star.

Having learned about Edward Carter from the curator of the 12<sup>th</sup> Armored Division Memorial Museum, a student decided to sculpt Carter's portrait. (See Figure 7.) For bravery in combat in Germany, Carterreceived the Distinguished Service Cross. He was posthumously awarded the Medal of Honor in 1997 (Jefferson, 2018). Carter was injured before the division became involved in the liberation of camps.

The students also learned about Leon Bass of the 183<sup>rd</sup> Engineer Combat Battalion, who witnessed the liberation of Buchenwald.Wiesel (1958/2006), the author of the students' assigned book, was at Buchenwald when the camp was liberated, though there is no evidence that the two men met there. After the war, Bass offered testimony. In his autobiographical book, *Good Enough*, Bass (2011)described a realization that he had had after witnessing the liberation of Buchenwald, "Pain and suffering is universal; it can touch all of us...I had seen the face of evil. I am speaking of racism, anti-Semitism, bigotry and prejudice and all manner of hatred. I saw it all in the camp in Nazi Germany" (p. 55).

#### Challenges, recommended methods, and resources

The creation of artwork in history classes presents challenges for students and educators, who may not see themselves as artistically inclined. The authors recommend modeling and scaffolding techniques as well as interdisciplinary collaborations. On the Internet, professional and amateur painters have posted useful how-to videos. When painting, the students could be given the option, as they were in this project, of transferring images with charcoal onto paper. While sculpting, students could opt to overlay printed images and use potter's needles to create light outlines. Stencils can be helpful. Ideally, art teachers or advanced art students would be invited to guide art instruction.

Resources on the Holocaust are numerous and accessible. To find primary-source images, the researchers recommend the website of the United States Holocaust Memorial Museum, particularly its *Holocaust Encyclopedia*. The researchers agree with Klevin and Lincoln (2016) that the USHMM has the most comprehensive online collection of sources in English in the world. The encyclopedia can be navigated without difficulty. To advance their knowledge of the Holocaust, educators can participate in training by the USHMM, Echoes and Reflections, and Yad Vashem. Facing History and Ourselves also offers valuable materials and strategies.

#### Conclusion

The uniqueness of this action-research project lies in the students' application of their acquired knowledge of the Holocaust to memorial art. The students' creation of artwork based on historical photographs engaged students in the process of inquiry. Through interactive lectures by teachers and professors as well as videoconferences with specialists, the students learned about the specific context in which the Holocaust occurred. They alsoreflected on how hatred has manifested in other contexts, including the United States. The findings of this action-research study suggest that memorial art projects have value in history and intercultural education. In a reflection, a student wrote, "My vision of a better world for people is one where everyone helps one another, supports on another, and sees one another."

#### References

- Anastasiades, P.S. (2009). Interactive videoconferencing and collaborative distance learning for K-12 students and teachers. Nova Science Publishers.
- Anti-Defamation League. (2018) Pyramid of hate. Retrieved from https://www.adl.org/sites/default/files/documents/pyramid-of-hate.pdf.
- Bartrop, P.R. (2016). *Resisting the Holocaust: Upstanders, partisans, and survivors.* ABC-CLIO.
- Bass, L. (2011). *Good enough: One man's memoir on the price of a dream*. Open Door Publications.
- Bergen, D.L. (2016). Key themes in Holocaust history. In S. Totten & S. Feinberg (Eds.), Essentials of Holocaust education: Fundamental issues and approaches (17-32). Routledge.
- Blatter, J., & Milton, S. (1981). Art of the Holocaust. The Rutledge Press.
- Boase-Beier, J., & de Vooght, M. (2019). Poetry of the Holocaust: An anthology. Arc Publications.
- Bodek, K., &Löw, K.C. (1941). *One spring*. Yad Vashem. Retrieved from https://www.yadvashem.org/yv/en/exhibitions/art/bodek.asp.
- Bodnar, T.O. (2017).*Restoring their identities*. Yad Vashem. Retrieved from <u>https://www.yadvashem.org/education/international-activities/jewish-</u>world/remembrance-day/posters/tamar-odaya-bodner.html.
- Costa, A.L., &Kallick, B. (2015). Dispositions: Critical pathways for deeper learning. In J.A. Bellanca (Ed.), *Deeper learning: Beyond 21<sup>st</sup> century skills* (55-81). Solution Tree Press.
- Efron, S.E., & Ravid, R. (2013). Action research in education. Guilford Press.
- Feinberg, S., & Totten, S. (2016). Foundational concerns. In S. Totten & S. Feinberg (Eds.), Essentials of Holocaust education: Fundamental issues and approaches (1-16). Routledge.
- Frank, A. (1947/1991). The diary of a young girl. Anchor Books.
- Gay, G. (2010). *Culturally responsive teaching: Theory, research, and practice* (2<sup>nd</sup> ed.). Teachers College Press.
- Gilbert, M. (2003/2004). *The righteous: The unsung heroes of the Holocaust*. Holt Paperbacks.
- Gragg, R. (2016). My brother's keeper: Christians who risked all to protect Jewish targets of the Nazi Holocaust. Hatchet Book Group.
- Grant, S.G., Swan, K., & Lee, J. (2017). *Inquiry-based practice in social studies* education: Understanding the Inquiry Design Model. Routledge.

- Haas, L. (1945). *Drawing of concentration camp inmates lined up for roll call*. USHMM. Retrieved from https://collections.ushmm.org/search/catalog/irn521650.
- Hayes, P. (2017). Why? Explaining the Holocaust. W.W. Norton & Co.
- International School for Holocaust Studies (n.d.). *Jewish resistance during the Holocaust*. Yad Vashem. Retrieved from <u>https://www.yadvashem.org/education/educational-videos/video-toolbox/hevt-resistance.html</u>.
- Jefferson, R.F. (2018). Brothers in valor: Battlefield stories of the 89 African Americans awarded the Medal of Honor. Lyons Press.
- Klevin, D., & Lincoln, M. (2016). The use of the Internet in teaching and studying about the Holocaust. In S. Totten & S. Feinberg, (Eds.). *Essentials of Holocaust education: Fundamental issues and approaches*(76-98).Routledge.
- Kollwitz, K. (1942). Seed grain shall not be milled. Smithsonian National Museum of American History. Retrieved from https://www.si.edu/es/object/nmah\_790611.
- Langer, L. (1982). Versions of survival: The Holocaust and the human spirit. State University of New York Press.
- Levine, K. (2002/2012). *Hana's suitcase: The quest to solve a Holocaust mystery*. Crown Books.
- Levstik, L.S., & Barton, K.C. (2001). *Doing history: Investigating with children in elementary and middle schools*(2<sup>nd</sup> ed.). Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.
- Lidegaard, B. (2013). Countrymen: How Denmark's Jews escaped the Nazis. Atlantic Books.
- Lindquist, D.H. (2006). Guidelines for teaching the Holocaust: Avoiding common pedagogical errors. *The Social Studies*97(5),215-221.
- Martin, M. (2008). *Videoconferencing for schools: Pedagogy and practice*. Guildhall Press.
- Mazzeo, T.J. (2016). Irena's children: A true story of courage. Gallery Books.
- Mertler, C.A. (2014).*Action research: Improving schools and empowering educators*. 4<sup>th</sup> ed. Sage.
- Mills, G.E. (2011). Action research: A guide for the teacher researcher (4<sup>th</sup> ed.). Pearson.
- Montero, G. (2007). Continuum. Warner Classics. Warner Music Group.
- National Council for the Social Studies (2013). *College, Career, and Civic Life Framework*. National Council for the Social Studies. Retrieved from https://www.socialstudies.org/sites/default/files/2017/Jun/c3-framework-for-social-studiesrev0617.pdf.

- Newman, D.L. (2008). Videoconferencing and the K-12 classroom. In D.L. Newman, J. Falco, S. Silverman, &P. Barbanell (Eds.), *Videconferencing technology in K-12 instruction: Best practices and trends* (1-18). Information Science Reference.
- Paldiel, M. (2007). *The righteous among nations: Rescuers of Jews during the Holocaust.* The Jerusalem Publishing House and Yad Vashem.
- Pellegrino, J.W. (2015). Beyond the rhetoric. In J.A. Bellanca (Ed.), *Deeper learning: Beyond 21<sup>st</sup> century skills* (xv-xxiv). Solution Tree Press.
- Rimmer-Halperin, D. (2012). Holocaust Martyrs' and Heroes' Remembrance Day, 2012. Yad Vashem. Retrieved from <u>https://www.yadvashem.org/education/international-</u> activities/jewish-world/remembrance-day/posters/dorielle-riemmer-halperin.html.
- Ringelblum, E. (1952/2006). Notes from the Warsaw Ghetto. Trans. J. Sloan. ibooks, Inc.
- Salmons, P. (2010). Universal meaning or historical understanding? The Holocaust in history and history in the curriculum. *Teaching History* (141), 57-63.
- Seixas, P., & Morton, T. (2013). *The big six historical thinking concepts*. Nelson Education Ltd.
- Stringer, E.T. (2014). Action research(4th ed.). Sage.
- Taylor, J.A., Neloms, Q., & Vaillancourt, R. (2018). Thematic videoconferencing and 3D memorial design in history education. *Journal of Social Studies and History Education*2(2), 1-25.
- Totten, S., & Feinberg, S. (2016). Teaching and studying the Holocaust: Curricular issues, teaching strategies, and learning activities. In S. Totten & S. Feinberg, (Eds.). *Essentials of Holocaust education: Fundamental issues and approaches*(48-75). Routledge.
- United States Holocaust Memorial Museum (USHMM). (2020), Introduction to the Holocaust, *Holocaust Encyclopedia*. Retrieved from https://encyclopedia.ushmm.org/content/en/article/introduction-to-the-holocaust
- United States Holocaust Memorial Museum (USHMM). (1943). One of the "Tehran Children." Retrieved from <u>https://encyclopedia.ushmm.org/content/en/photo/one-of-the-tehran-children</u>.
- Volavkova, H., (Ed.). (1993). *I never saw another butterfly: Children's drawings and poems from Terezin concentration camp*(2<sup>nd</sup> ed.). Schocken Books.
- Waszak, E.F. (2005). *Hellcat historian: Stories of World War II's 12<sup>th</sup> Armored Division*. iWrite Publications.
- Wiesel, E. (1958/2006). Night. Hill and Wang.
- Yeager, E.A., & Foster, S.J. (2001). The role of empathy in the development of historical understanding. In O.L. Davis, E.A. Yeager, & S.J. Foster (Eds.), *Historical empathy*

# and perspective taking in the social studies (13-19). Rowman and Littlefield.

Yenawine, P. (2013). *Visual thinking strategies*: Using art to deepen learning across school disciplines. Harvard Education Press.



Figure 1. Shawn *Tehran Child*, 2020 Ceramic



Figure 2. Darryl Holocaust Jacket, 2020 Ceramic



Figure 3. Ramel Anne Frank's Chestnut Tree Acrylic on paper



Figure 4. Jason *The Butterfly*, 2020 Acrylic on paper



Figure 5. Leo Haas Concentration Camp Victims Lined Up for Roll Call, 1945 Ink on paper United States Holocaust Memorial Museum



Figure 6. Käthe Kollwitz Seed Grain Shall Not Be Milled, 1942 Lithograph Smithsonian National Museum of American History



Figure 7. Jaydan Edward Carter, 2020 Ceramic

# **Book Review**

by William Kirtley

Storey, John. (1997). Cultural Theory and Popular Culture.

London: Routledge. ISBN: 978-1-138-81103-4. 289 pages, \$40.70, paperback.

John Storey, an Emeritus Professor of Cultural Studies at the University of Sunderland, UK., presents a concise, approachable overview on theories of popular culture. This text is the classic, most influential work on cultural studies. His thesis is that theories of popular cultureare always stated in terms of "*absent other*" (Storey 1). Scholars feel the resultant disdain from academia for their work teaching reading with comic books, analyzing romance novels, or discussing popular music. Anyone who because of color, creed, or sexual orientation finds themselves consigned among "the other" will discover a theoretical analysis of why and how this happens in Storey's textbook.

Storey's comprehensive introduction serves as a guide to the rest of the book. Hesupports his thesis with six definitions of popular culture. His first answer is succinct "It is what people like." (Storey 5). His second, defines pop culture as "what is left after the elite decides what is high culture" (Storey 5). His third definition refers to the products commodified by the culture industry. His fourth definition views popular culture as the spontaneous contributions of indigenous folk culture. His fifth definition argues it is the result of powerful groups achieving hegemonic power to define what is high culture. His sixth definition, a postmodern approach, sees popular culture as the result of a dialog between producers and consumers of culture.

One student, who reviewed the text on Amazon.com,wrotethat he would rather run into a cement wall head first than read the text.The fault lies not with the author's style. Each chapter is

short and concise, about all the reader can absorb in one sitting. This student should recognize this is a reference text. Before the advent of the internet, doing research for an assigned paper or book report required spending a great deal of time searching various textbooks. Yes, the days before Google and even (sigh) Wikipedia were time-consuming and often grueling. Research texts were a very useful tool to aid in research. Careful and determined use of the index produced pertinent information and even suitably quotable material. Huzzah! There was no need to actually peruse the entire tome!

One can download this text from Pearson Publishing for free and use the search function. However, some reading is in order to get the most out of this book. Start with the introduction.Focus on a chapter pertinent to your research.Have fun chasing down those wonderful in-text citations and don't forget about the index. The thought of actually reading an entire reference work may seem incongruous in today's age, but such an endeavor is both enriching and revealing.

Scholars that need an update on culturalism, Marxism, psychoanalysis, or structuralism will find it here. Storey's unitary approach builds on subsequent analyses.Particularly interesting, are his observations of how popular culture can migrate to higher culture over time. Shakespeare presented his plays just above the bear pit. Howling crowds traded barbs with the actors on stage. This state of affairs persisted until early in the 19<sup>th</sup> century when upper classes accepted and endorsed the works of the Elizabethan bard as their very own high culture.

The chapter on gender and sexuality has excellent sections on romance novels, women's magazines, and Queer theory. However, the chapter on postmodernism has problems of omission. The last section in this chapter on postmodern music ends with a quote from Harvard University professor Cornel West about rap being unique because it "combines the black

preacher and the black music tradition" (Storey 209). This abrupt and unfulfilling ending provides an opportunity for students to explore further. Students might, for example, explore the theoretical background of why recently departed rock and roll legend, Little Richard observed that if he were White there would have not been an Elvis Presley.

Thechapter on race, racism, and representation contains similar pockets of excellence followed by missed opportunities. The section on the historical emergence of racism is stark, brutal, and a "must-read."Storey notes that racism did not lose its scientific support until after WWII (Storey 179). The awful truth is you can find similar justifications for racism on line today.

The section on Orientalism does not deal with any of the discriminatory laws and violence directed against the Japanese and Chinese in the United States in the early 20<sup>th</sup> century. Instead, the author diverges to a discussion of Vietnam in Hollywood movies.Certainly, anti-Asian prejudice played a part in causing the Vietnam war.General Westmorland, commander of US forces, referred to Asian's lack of respect for life to account for their willingness to continue the war. Many Americans still subscribe to the myths of Vietnam created by Hollywood. However, for those for whom Vietnam was a lived experience there is no way anti-Asian prejudice comes close to explaining the complex causes of thewar and its effect on the American psyche.

Theory directs, harmonizes, and validates research. The unity, depth, and completeness of Storey's theoretical work has application across many disciplines. Anyone who writes about or incorporates popular culture in the classroomwill find this book a valuable resource. Scholars interested in a unified history of cultural theory will find this work usefulfor reviewing the theory of a specific period. It is a difficult and challenging text to read, but well worth the effort.

Dr. William Kirtley is an independent scholar from Medford Oregon. He earned a Doctorate in Political Science from Idaho State University. He and his wife Patricia (MFA) have published articles on popular culture including, Malinche,Pantos, Phantom of the Opera, teaching comic books, Googie Architecture, the Art at Caesars Palace, the *Enquirer*, and the TV show, Castle, all of which reflect many of Storey's observations in *Cultural Theory and Popular Culture*.

•

A Review and Commentary of Peter Reddaway's The Dissidents: A Memoir of Working with the Resistance in Russia, 1960-1990

Samuel B. Hoff George Washington Distinguished Professor Emeritus Department of History, Political Science, and Philosophy Delaware State University

Peter Reddaway, **The Dissidents: A Memoir of Working with the Resistance in Russia, 1960-1990.** Washington, DC: The Brookings Institution, 2020. ISBN: 9780815737735. Hardcover, 338 pp., \$29.99. The author, professor emeritus of political science and international affairs at George Washington University, has written his fourth book about recent Soviet Russian history. However, unlike the previous three, he approaches this work from a personal perspective. The objective of the current book is to relay his experience with the dissident movement in the aforementioned nation and to assess the reasons why reforms have been largely stymied. Reddaway's examination of the topic coincides with contemporary events both domestic and worldwide.

The book contains seventeen chapters along with an Introduction, a list of Reddaway's publications which are cited in the text, notes, and indexes by subject and name. The chapters themselves can be divided into four parts, although the author does not do so. Part I encompasses the personal background of the author. Part II includes a series of topics associated with the dissident movement. Part III offers a governmental history from 1968 through 1991. Lastly, the final chapter presents conclusions and observations.

In Part I, Reddaway outlines his educational background along with his early interactions with dissidents in the Soviet Union. In 1962, he earned his undergraduate degree from Cambridge University in Britain in modern languages, with a special emphasis on Russian. In 1963, he

completed a Masters degree in advanced Soviet area studies at Harvard University. Beginning in 1964, he pursued a Ph.D. at the London School of Economics, where he subsequently taught and conducted research

on Soviet dissident activities until he moved to George Washington University in 1989. He spent sabbatical years at Columbia University in New York and at the Kennen Institute for Advanced Russian Studies in Washington, DC; he later served as director of the latter institution for three years. From 1960 to 1964, Reddaway made three trips to the Soviet Union, the last of which was as a graduate student at Moscow University for eight months. However, after meeting with Soviet dissidents, he was expelled from the latter institution and forced to leave the Soviet Union, from which he did not return again for twentyfour years.

Part II of the book covers Chapters 6 through 11 along with Chapters 13 and 15. Various subjects are presented together with the author's observations of and participation in Soviet dissident activities. For instance, Reddaway examines the impact of *Khronika*, a samizdat publication which chronicled dissident activities in a series of issues over time. Further, he highlights the lives of Anatoly Marchenco and Pyotr Grigorenko, whom were leaders in human rights advancement. Additionally, he discusses the effort to change the views of those who minimized Soviet abuses. He also describes how the Soviet government discriminated against religious

groups and others. Two chapters in this section analyze the abuse of psychiatry for political reasons. Whereas Chapter 9 comprehensively details the history of opposition to Soviet psychiatric policies, Chapter

15 depicts the author's 1989 trip to the Soviet Union as part of an assemblage of American psychiatrists who were granted access to records in that area.

Part III, including Chapters 12, 14, and 16, review the record of Soviet government policy across several leaders from 1968 through 1991. This span encompasses the leadership of Leonid Brezhnev-- who succeeded Nikita Khrushchev as General of the Communist Party of the Soviet Union and ruled until November 1982—along with successors Yuri Andropov (1982-1984), Konstantin Chernenko (1984-85), and Mikhail Gorbachev (1985-1991). Chapter 12 reviews the activities of Radio Liberty and the process by which the Soviets were forced to leave the World Psychiatric Association in 1983. Chapter 14 describes the reforms undertaken by Mikhail Gorbachev as well as Reddaway's two return trips to Russia in 1988. Finally, Chapter 16 provides an account of the period from December 1990 until the dissolution of the Soviet Union a year later, including Gorbachev's efforts at reform, the August 1991 failed coup against him, the rise of Boris Yeltsin, and the creation of the Commonwealth of Independent States.

In the concluding chapter, Reddaway furnishes several factors which he

holds are responsible for stalled and incomplete reforms in Russia, particularly those affecting dissidents. Among these reasons are the legacy of empire, the inability to run the economy efficiently, and a confused

political landscape. He assets that "after eighteen years under [Vladimir] Putin, Russia is far from being pregnant with a new order that will prove stable and conducive to lasting reform" (p.293).

During the current century, two tracts of studies have emerged about Soviet and Russian Federation treatment of political dissidents. The first tract includes five books which cover the conditions in Soviet gulags along with government-supported poisoning and assassination of recent dissidents (Applebaum, 2004; Goldfarb; 2010, Volodarsky, 2013; Knight, 2017; Volodarsky, 2020). The second tract contains ten books which convey policies and treatment from the dissident perspective, including those which describe discrimination against religious groups and artists (Gilligan, 2004; Van Voren, 2009; De Wolf, 2013; Isajiw, 2014; Paul, 2014; Golomstock, 2018; Pouschine, 2019; Martin, 2019; Shatravka, 2019; Polishchuk, 2020). Although none of these tomes mix academics and activism in the specific manner that Reddaway does, a similar approach can be found in a 1987 book by Allan Wynn.

The present book has several strengths: the quality of the chapters on Soviet psychiatric abuses and the fall of the Soviet communist system, which are superior to other contemporary studies on those topics; the

persistence of dissidents and Reddaway alike in fighting the atrocities committed by the Russian government; and the humanizing of certain Soviet officials who began to doubt the wisdom of policies targeting ordinary

citizens. Conversely, as seen from the division of chapters presented above, the organization of the book could have been improved and a few chapters could have been combined. Further, Reddaway skips from Brezhnev to Gorbachev with little attention paid to those Soviet leaders in between. Finally, Reddaway's concluding observations, while addressing the reasons for continuing suppression of dissidents, do not furnish any prescriptions for improvement. Still, this book provides a powerful rejoinder to the premise that domestic and international advocacy against human rights violations in Russia has been ineffective.

# REFERENCES

Applebaum. Anne. 2004. Gulag: A History. Anchor Books.

De Wolf, Koenrad. 2013. *Dissident for Life: Alexander Ogorodnikov and the Struggle for Religious Freedom in Russia.* Eerdmans.

Gilligan, Emma. 2004. Defending Human Rights in Russia: Sargei Kovalyov, Dissident and Human Rights Commissioner, 1969-2003. Routledge.

Goldfarb, Alex. 2010. *Death of a Dissident: The Poisoning of Alexander Litvinenko and the Return of the KGB.* Free Press.

Golomstock, Igor. 2018. *A Ransomed Dissident: A Life in Art Under the Soviets.* I. B. Tauris.

Isajiw, Christina, 2014. *Negotiating Human Rights: In Defense of Dissidents During the Soviet Era.* CIUS Press.

Knight, Amy. 2017. Orders to Kill: The Putin Regime and Political Murder. Thomas Dunne Books. Martin, Barbara. 2019. *Dissident Histories in the Soviet Union: From De-Stalinization to Perestroika*. Bloomsbury Academic.

Paul, Lisa C. 2014. Swimming the Daylight: An American Student, a Soviet-Jewish Dissident, and the Gift of Hope. Skyhorse.

Polishchuk, Arkady, 2020. As I Was Burying Comrade Stalin: My Life Becoming a Jewish Dissident. McFarland.

Pouschine, Anna. 2019. Letters of a Russian Dissident: Ivan Pouschine's Siberian Exile Correspondence. Academica Press. Shatravka, Alexander. 2019. Escape from Paradise: A Russian Dissident's Journey From the Gulag to the West. Academica Press.

Van Voren, Robert. 2009. Of Dissidents and Madness: From the Soviet Union of Leonid Brezhnev to the Soviet Union of Vladimir Putin. Rodopi.

Volodarsky, Boris. 2020. Assassins: The KGB's Poison Factory Ten Years On. Frontline Books.

Volodarsky, Boris. 2013. *The KGB's Poison Factory: From Lenin to Litvinenko.* Frontline Books.

Wynn, Allan. 1987. Notes of a Non Conspirator: Working With Russian Dissidents. A. Deutsch.